7.0 Training and Education: What is Needed to Prepare Nursing Assistants to Deliver Good Care¹

7.1 Introduction

As other chapters in this study have shown clearly, staffing numbers alone have a significant effect on quality of care and quality of life in nursing facilities. Also vitally important to the delivery of good care, however, is ensuring that nursing assistants have the knowledge, preparation, support and supervision necessary to do their jobs with competence and confidence.

This chapter covers what nursing assistants need to know in order to recognize and respond to resident needs, and how they learn to perform tasks of care and work collaboratively with others on a care team. It is based on the following definitions, assumptions, and parameters:

- The purpose of educating nursing assistants is to prepare them to deliver good care to residents and to recognize and respond to resident care needs with confidence and competence.
- A first step to evaluating educational programs is understanding the roles and responsibilities of certified nursing assistants. What are they called upon to do? What kinds of knowledge and thinking skills must they draw upon?
- "Training" is too narrow a word to encompass the wide range of education and reinforcement that a student needs to assume the responsibilities of a nursing assistant. Training prepares a person to perform a task or a job. Education implies knowledge or cognitive ability to recognize and understand abstract concepts.
- Too often, the federally mandated pre-employment certification training is a nursing assistant's first, last and most substantive exposure to formal education. A comprehensive

from a number of sources, most notably Texas-based nursing assistant educator Barbara Acello; Patricia Green and the members of her NursingAssistant@yahoogroups.com listserv; Elma Holder and her colleagues at the National Citizens' Coalition for Nursing Home Reform; Janet Myder and her colleagues at the American Health Care Association; and Hazel Slocumb, Assistant Chief of the Health Care Personnel Registry for the state of South Carolina.

Mary Ann Wilner, PhD, Director of Health Policy, Paraprofessional Healthcare Institute wrote Sections 1, 2 and 17 and parts of Sections 15 and 16 of this chapter and contributed to many others. Sections 3 - 13 and parts of Section 15 and 16 were written by Elise Nakhnikian, Long Term Care Specialist, Paraprofessional Healthcare Institute. Section 14 was written by Susan Joslin of CMS and Donna Hurd of Abt Associates. Susan Joslin also wrote part of Section 16. Genevieve Gipson of Career Nurse Assistants Programs Inc. and the National Network of Career Nursing Assistants contributed to Sections 16 and 17. Joanne Rader and Charlene Boyd also contributed to Section 17. The authors received valuable feedback from a number of sources, most notably Texas-based nursing assistant educator Barbara Acello: Patricia

approach to education provides many ongoing opportunities for different types of learning such as:

- Transferring learning from the classroom to the clinical setting;
- Gaining and incorporating new knowledge and skills;
- Receiving support, supervision and feedback to reinforce the learning;
- Teaching and supporting peers; and
- Competency checks and remediation.

With these parameters in mind, the research team sought answers to the following questions:

What effects do educational programs have on care quality and continuity?

- Does a nursing assistant's education affect the quality of care that he or she delivers?
- Does education affect retention and turnover rates?
- Does access to education affect recruitment of potential nursing assistants?

What is currently taught?

- What topics are included in the federally mandated pre-employment training programs?
- How are these curricula taught? What qualifications and training do the teachers have?
- What is included in the mandated 12-hour annual in-service programs?
- How have states added to the federal educational requirements?
- What do CNAs say about the usefulness of existing programs?
- Where do the certification training programs take place? Under whose auspices? Are provisions made for consistent outcomes?
- Who pays for certification training? Is the cost a barrier to entry for nursing assistants, or an undue burden for nursing facilities?

What important areas are not likely to be covered adequately in the course of a nursing assistant's education?

- Orientation and supervision;
- Cross-cultural communication and competence;
- Problem solving;
- Critical thinking;
- Communication with residents and their families, peers and supervisors;
- Leadership;
- Stress management;
- Managing difficult workloads; and
- Serving clients with certain disabilities or diseases.

What role do career advancement programs play?

How common are career ladder programs for nursing assistants, and how do they work?

What could be done to improve the current system?

The chapter concludes with a list of recommendations.

7.1.1 Executive Summary

This chapter looks at nursing assistant education and its effect on resident quality of life and quality of care in nursing facilities.

Education is broadly defined to include not just the certification training and testing required of all new nursing facility nursing assistants or the 12 hours of mandated in-services per year but also an array of other programs and systems that nursing assistants need in order to feel confident and competent in doing their jobs. These include orientation, supervision, organizational support, ongoing education, opportunities for career advancement, support services to prepare marginal workers and those who need to improve their English skills for the workforce, and special training to help workers cope with the multiple physical, emotional and organizational demands of the job.

Although nursing assistant work is often perceived as unskilled, nursing assistants perform a complex and key function in nursing facilities. As Section 7.3 explains, nursing assistants are the most important person in most residents' lives. As such, they must be inclined by nature, prepared by training, and empowered by their facilities to offer not just physical but emotional support. Because nursing assistants are so important to residents' quality of life, frequent turnover in that position can have a significant negative impact. While many factors affect the turnover rate in an average facility, research indicates that adequate training, orientation and supervision play a key role.

As Section 7.6 details, there were no federal requirements for nursing assistant training until the Omnibus Budget Reconciliation Act (OBRA) of 1987 mandated that they have a minimum of 75 hours of training, pass a certification exam and skills test, and follow up with 12 hours a year of in-service education. Many states require more hours, mandate specific topics that must be taught, or both. These rules were passed in reaction to reports from the Institute of Medicine and elsewhere in the 1980s indicating that the quality of nursing home care was seriously deficient, and that nursing assistants were one of the key players in delivering quality care.

Approximately 14 years after the passage of OBRA '87, however, many long term care stakeholders are concluding that its mandates for initial training of nursing assistant training did not go far enough. There is also a general consensus that in-service classes tend to be repetitive and boring, and that they are not tailored to meet the needs of individual nursing assistants, or to reflect the special needs of a facility's population.

Perhaps because formal training does not go far enough, evidence points to the fact that nursing assistants learn many crucial skills on the job. In the process, they often learn ways of cutting corners that allow them to shoulder often burdensome workloads but do not account for individual residents' needs or preferences.

Section 7.8 explains how the certification training mandated by OBRA ranges widely in style, quality and content depending on the individual instructor, the requirements of the state in which they are taught, and perhaps the location of the classes. Some classes are taught in nursing facilities; some in community colleges, vocation-technical colleges, or high schools; and some in private schools. The basic curriculum includes personal care skills and certain basic medical procedures, with some time spent on common conditions associated with aging. Some adult education methods are often used to convey the material, but lectures and written texts generally predominate. The curricula often look impressive on paper, but covering all that ground effectively in 75 hours or slightly more is a challenge. In addition, teachers are required to have only minimal preparation other than a background in nursing, and some lack training in adult education.

The tests for certification are developed and administered separately from the curricula for certification classes. As a result, some say, the subject matter does not always jibe, and students may be tested on material they were not taught.

As described in Section 7.9, more problems surface when idealistic new students attempt to transfer their learning to the worksite. Many learn that there is no time to do things the way they were taught, leaving them to weigh the necessity for using shortcuts against their reluctance to compromise resident care or quality of life. Often, these decisions must be made without the help of effective orientation, supervision or organizational support.

The certification and ongoing education mandated by the federal government is supposed to be paid for by the government, but all costs are not always covered, leaving nursing facilities or nursing assistants themselves to pick up some of the expenses. This can create a financial burden for facilities and serve as a barrier for nursing assistant candidates, many of whom are living on the brink of poverty.

Section 7.12 outlines the elements that are commonly missing in preparing nursing assistants for the job, from a failure to recruit the right candidates to a lack of English as a Second Language (ESL) classes and other support services to enable others to attend classes to an absence of key content areas in most training that leaves new nursing assistants poorly prepared for the realities of the job. For instance, few certification classes teach problem solving and critical thinking, how to communicate with residents and their families, how to get along with supervisors and peers, and how to manage a difficult workload, although these are all skills most nursing assistant must draw on daily.

Section 7.13 looks at career ladders for nursing assistants, outlining how they are defined and what elements they tend to include and noting that they are more the exception than the rule,

although evidence indicates that they help retain nursing assistants by providing motivation and recognition for learning skills or acquiring knowledge beyond the basics. Sections 7.14 through 7.16 offer examples of current training programs and related initiatives sponsored by states, providers, trade unions and others. While the researchers were unable to do an exhaustive search for the best practices in the field, these programs provide a variety of examples of promising practices, which other facilities may be able to adapt.

In Section 7.17, recommendations for improving nursing assistant education and ongoing training are formulated by the Paraprofessional Healthcare Institute. Divided into recommendations for the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS), for states, and for nursing facilities, these describe an educational approach, structural framework and set of relationships that need to be in place in order to develop and sustain training and educational opportunities that will prepare nursing assistants to deliver good care to nursing home residents.

In general, the recommendations focus on expanding the training requirements for CNAs. "Raising the bar" for entrance into the nursing assistance field might seem counter-intuitive at a time of such widespread vacancies throughout the industry, but these recommendations are based on an assessment that *retention* of nursing assistants once in the field is the primary solution to addressing vacancies—not simply attracting more, less prepared, new applicants.

7.2 Methods

Relatively few articles in peer-reviewed medical or professional journals have focused on nursing assistant education. Of those, most describe a program with a narrow focus, such as incontinence or dementia care, which was implemented in one or two facilities and may not be easy to replicate.

Literature review

A search of PubMed brought up a number of relevant articles. Other books, articles and unpublished papers and studies were recommended by key contacts (see below). Citations in these articles led to other material of interest, all of which is listed in the bibliography following this chapter.

Key contacts

A number of key contacts reviewed our initial outline or shared their insights into some or all of the material covered. Most also recommended promising educational programs and relevant literature. These contacts included nursing assistants, researchers, nursing facility administrators, trade association staff, nursing assistant educators, state nursing assistant education supervisors, and consumer advocates.

Site visits

Visits to federally mandated certification training programs in the Baltimore, Philadelphia and Boston regions helped illustrate variations in class content and teaching methods.

Promising practices

Recommended by our key informants, the promising programs described in Sections 7.15 and 7.16 represent a range of intriguing possibilities sponsored by nursing facilities, community colleges, state and county governments, unions, educational institutions, and other non-profit entities.

State requirements

The research team collected data on state mandates from earlier studies and examples of state-approved programs from key informants.

It is anticipated that additional information on this topic will be available shortly from the Office of Inspector General of the Department of Health and Human Services, which is conducting a 50-state survey of CNA educational and training requirements, including extensive interviews in New York, Washington, Louisiana, Minnesota, and Florida.

7.3 Nursing Assistant Profile

"We've continued to look at NAs for years as an amorphous mass of people who do what nobody else wants to do. And how do you get any kind of satisfaction out of having a job like that? How do you feel valued?"²

7.3.1 What Nursing Assistants Do on the Job

Nursing assistants constitute the largest group of workers in nursing facilities (approximately 43 percent).³ They interact more with residents than any other members of the staff, providing approximately 90 percent of the hands-on care ⁴⁻⁵ and serving as the "eyes and ears" of the nurses they report to.

The job is physically demanding as well. Nursing assistants spend hours on their feet, often lifting or transferring incapacitated residents. They are frequently exposed to hazardous chemicals and blood borne pathogens. And residents with dementia often strike out at nursing

Genevieve Gipson as quoted in Pair power: For veteran nursing assistants, partnerships with peers provide support and stability. *Contemporary Long Term Care*, February 1996.

U.S. General Accounting Office (GAO, May 17, 2001). Nursing workforce: Recruitment and retention of nurses and nurse aides is a growing concern, Figure 4. Testimony before the Committee on Health, Education, Labor and Pensions, U.S. Senate

Waxman HM, Carner EA, Berkenstock G. (1984). Job turnover and job satisfaction among nursing home aides. *Gerontologist* 24: 503-509

Bowers B; Becker M. (June 1992) Nurse's aides in nursing homes: the relationship between organization and quality. *Gerontologist* 32(3):360-6

assistants. As a result, nursing facility nursing assistants have one of the highest on-the-job injury rates of any type of U.S. worker,⁶ totaling 15.9 percent in the most recent government survey.⁷

Their responsibilities vary depending on state regulations and facility policy, but virtually all nursing assistants watch for significant changes in a resident's condition, including signs of depression, mental confusion, or incumbent pressure ulcers. They help residents eat, dress and undress, bathe, transfer, ambulate, and maintain range of motion. They help with toileting; care for residents' mouths, skin and nails; and reposition residents who can't move. They fill out paperwork documenting much of what they do. And they take temperature, pulse, respiration and blood pressure readings; record intake and output of fluids; make beds and clean rooms; and provide postmortem care. Another responsibility is rarely included in official lists of what nursing assistants do, but it may be their most important one: forming relationships with residents.

The work of a nursing assistant is emotionally demanding. Caring nursing assistants grow close to at least some of "their" residents only to watch them suffer losses and indignities, grow sicker, or die. As one nursing assistant recently wrote to a listserv in welcoming a new member to the profession: "If you think it's easy, think again. It's demanding and overwhelming, especially your first day. EVERYTHING will hurt ... including your heart."

The work is emotionally rewarding as well. The main reason nursing assistants stay in the field is their commitment to the residents they care for. Of all the complex, often volatile relationships to be found in nursing facilities, the relationships between nursing assistants and residents are paramount to most nursing assistants—and most residents.

7.3.2 The Importance of Nursing Assistants to Residents

For a 1985 study, the National Citizens' Coalition for Nursing Home Reform (NCCNHR) asked 455 nursing facility residents to talk about what factors had the most influence on their quality of care and quality of life. The most important single factor, the residents agreed, was well-trained staff who were friendly, cheerful, competent and polite. The study participants discussed all level

Service Employees International Union (1997). Caring till it hurts: How nursing home work is becoming the most dangerous job in America. Washington, D.C.

U.S. Department of Labor, Bureau of Labor Statistics, Survey of Occupational Injuries and Illnesses, 1997. http://www.osha.gov/oshstats/bls/serv7.html.

⁸ Jessica Helms, message to NursingAssistant@yahoogroups.com.

Iowa CareGivers Association (December 2000). Certified nursing assistant recruitment and retention project final report summary. Iowa Department of Human Services, contracts 99-040 and 2000-008.

of staff, but they mentioned nursing assistants most often.¹⁰ Those findings have been borne out by other studies of residents¹¹⁻¹² and their family members.¹³

Improving the Quality of Care in Nursing Homes, an Institute of Medicine report, noted that "[n]ursing homes are 'total institutions' in which caregivers, particularly nurse's aides, represent a large part of the social world of nursing home residents and control their daily schedules and activities. This is the total environment for many nursing home residents for the duration of their stay, which may be several years." ¹⁴

Because of the intimate nature of their relationship to residents and the degree to which most residents depend on them for even the most basic needs, a thoughtless or incompetent nursing assistant can do much to erode residents' quality of life. Jackie Coombs, a nursing facility resident, listed 28 of those ways for NCCNHR. Coombs' list includes both sins of commission, such as "Watching TV while working on resident or standing in front of TV so resident can't see it," and sins of omission, such as "Not drawing privacy curtains in warm weather. Residents in bed partially nude." ¹⁵

Pillemer and Moore (1989) identified more serious forms of abuse and neglect in a study that concluded the following: "[I]t does not appear that maltreatment only occurs in isolated, well-publicized incidents, but that it may instead be a common part of institutional life." ¹⁶ In a survey of 577 randomly selected nursing assistants and nurses who worked in nursing facilities, the researchers asked questions by phone, guaranteed respondents anonymity, and asked them to report other people's behavior as well as their own in an attempt to encourage candor. Even so, they noted, it was likely that abusive incidents were underreported to some extent. Yet 36 percent reported having seen a colleague physically abuse a resident in the preceding year, 10 percent said they themselves had committed such an act. Psychological abuse was even more rampant, with fully 81 percent of the respondents saying they had witnessed psychological abuse and 40 percent saying they had perpetrated it.

Spalding J. (1985) A consumer perspective on quality care: The residents' point of view. National Citizens' Coalition for Nursing Home Reform (Washington, DC).

Grau L, Chandler B, Saunders C. (1995) Nursing home residents' perceptions of the quality of their care. *Journal of Psychosocial Nursing Mental Health Services* 33: 34-43.

Deutschmann (August 2001). Redefining quality & excellence in the nursing home culture. Journal of Gerontological Nursing.

Duncan M, Morgan D. (1994) Sharing the caring: Family caregivers' views of their relationships with nursing home staff. *Gerontologist* 34; 235-244.

¹⁴ Institute of Medicine, Committee on Nursing Home Regulation (1986). Improving the quality of care in nursing homes. National Academy Press (Washington, DC).

¹⁵ Coombs, Jackie. What nursing assistants do and do not do. National Citizens' Coalition for Nursing Home Reform (Washington, DC).

Pillmer, Karl and Moore, David W. (June 1989) Abuse of patients in nursing homes: findings from a survey of staff. *Gerontologist* 29(3):314-20.

The most common types of physical abuse were excessive use of restraints (witnessed by 21 percent and committed by 6 percent); pushing, grabbing, shoving or pinching a resident (witnessed by 17 percent and committed by 3 percent); and slapping or hitting a resident (witnessed by 12 percent and committed by 3 percent). The most common acts of psychological abuse were yelling at a resident in anger (seen by 70 percent and done by 33 percent), insulting or swearing at a resident (seen by 50 percent and done by 10 percent), isolating a resident inappropriately (seen by 23 percent and done by 4 percent), threatening to hit a resident or throw something at him or her (seen by 15 percent and done by 2 percent) and denying food or privileges (seen by 13 percent and done by 4 percent).

Conversely, a simple act of kindness or care means more than it would in a less "total" environment. As researcher Sallie Tisdale pointed out in *Harvest Moon: Portrait of a Nursing Home*: "Ordinary, even familial things happen here, though often unwitnessed. Wounds are healed, muscles strengthened, faces washed, and hands held. Each small movement is tiny in its fruition, huge in its absence." ¹⁷

The National Council of State Boards of Nursing (NCSBN) has also acknowledged the importance of the care nursing assistants provide, both mental and physical. The NCSBN, which administers licensing exams for nursing assistants, says nursing assistants should be proficient in five areas: mental health and social service needs, resident rights, basic nursing skills, basic restorative services, and personal care skills.¹⁸

But steadily increasing average resident acuity levels¹⁹ and heavy workloads leave most nursing assistants hard pressed to attend to residents' mental health and social service needs. Even basic care needs often go unmet, as nursing assistants take shortcuts on some tasks and leave others undone altogether. ²⁰

This creates an ethical dilemma for conscientious nursing assistants, who often feel that they cannot provide the care that their residents need and deserve. As one nursing assistant recently wrote to other members of a listserv: "The amount of work you're expected to do in the time allotted is unreasonable. It's unsafe for yourself and it's unsafe for the resident.... [F]amilies put their loved ones in these facilities thinking they will get the love and care they for some reason can't provide. If they actually knew how these people are rushed to bed, rushed to eat, rushed to pee, and the little things they miss like oral hygiene and lipstick. It's a shame the shortcuts

Appropriateness of Minimum Nurse Staffing Ratios in Nursing Homes
Phase II Final Report, December 2001

¹⁷ Tisdale, Sallie (1987). Harvest moon: Portrait of a nursing home. New York: Henry Holt and Company.

National Council of State Boards of Nursing, Inc. (1989) Nurse aide competency evaluation program (NACEP). The Psychological Corporation (San Antonio).

National Nursing Home Survey, National Center for Health Statistics, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, 1977 and 1997.

Foner, Nancy. (1994) The caregiving dilemma: Work in an American nursing home. University of California Press (Berkeley/Los Angeles/London).

people can be forced to take. Then as CNAs we go home with a heavy heart, feeling that our job wasn't performed right, that we let them down."²¹

The Effect of Nursing Assistant Education on Quality of Care and Quality of Life

As Kramer and Smith (2000) noted, "[r]elatively few studies have attempted to assess the effectiveness of nursing assistant training programs in increasing the participants' knowledge and improving the care they give to nursing home residents."²²

It is particularly difficult to find research evaluating the effects of OBRA's mandated education, perhaps because it was implemented so recently. Bernard Gross (July 1995) asked 352 long-term care professionals to evaluate quality of care in Pennsylvania's nursing facilities, rating 15 key areas ranging from "effective observation, assessment and reporting skills" to "provision of kind, gentle and caring service." Respondents were asked how well all 15 services were delivered during two time periods: shortly before OBRA's nursing assistant certification and testing mandate when into effect and five years later. They rated all 15 areas as improved after the mandate was enacted, all but two of them (work ethics and reduction in resident abuse) by a significant margin. ²³

Other research has linked improved outcomes to training programs that target a specific area, most often dementia care.

McCallion et al. (1999)²⁴ found that a group of nursing assistants who attended a series of personalized training, practice and feedback sessions on dementia care were better able afterward to manage "verbally aggressive behaviors such as yelling, physically nonaggressive behaviors such as wandering, and aggressive behaviors such as hitting." The demented residents cared for by these nursing assistants exhibited significantly fewer depressive symptoms at both three and six months after the training, even as they became more disoriented due to the progression of the disease.

Wilner and Shenkman (1993) found a connection between support groups for nursing assistants and resident outcomes. Nursing assistants in 16 facilities participated in support groups for eight months, discussing teamwork and how to communicate with supervisors and peers, as well as technical information about resident care. At the end of the study period, nursing directors in several participating facilities reported that the residents assigned to CNAs who attended the groups experienced fewer problems. One supervisor noted that the

²¹ Message from nursing assistant Melissa Lothrop to NursingAssistant@yahoogroups.com.

²² Kramer and Smith, 2000.

Gross, Bernard M. (July 1995) Quality of care defined: An analysis of the impact of nurse aide training and competency testing programs on quality of care of residents of long-term care facilities in Pennsylvania. Pennsylvania Department of Education, Bureau of Vocational-Technical Education, Harrisburg, PA.

McCallion P, Toseland RW, Lacey D, Banks S (October 1999). Educating nursing assistants to communicate more effectively with nursing home residents with dementia. *Gerontologist* 39(5):546-58.

"teamwork and consistency of care [of CNAs who participated in the groups] did increase. There was the same quality of work every day."

Beck et al. (March 1999) ²⁵ summarize the findings of 15 publications reporting on nine separate studies of dementia training programs for nursing assistants. Of the nine, they found, only one reported no improvements in resident behaviors and/or staff knowledge after nursing assistants underwent some form of specialized training in dementia care. Of the other studies, four reported a decrease in combative or otherwise problematic behaviors by residents. Others reported improvements in residents' intellectual status, motor skills, mental condition (exhibiting less depression, agitation and confusion), and ability to function independently.

Two of the studies incorporated formal monitoring and feedback by supervisors after completion of training, and reported that this combination produced better results than training alone. Other studies have also shown that training cannot significantly improve care quality unless it is paired with effective supervision and organizational support systems (see Section 7.9).

7.4 Who Nursing Assistants Are

Just under 700,000 nursing assistants work in nursing facilities in the United States.²⁶ About nine in every 10 are women. Nationally, one in nine (11.1 percent) are foreign-born and just over half (56.6 percent) are non-Hispanic whites. African-Americans account for a larger percentage of nursing assistants than of the population in general, but they remain a minority at 31.8 percent. The percentage of black, Hispanic and/or foreign-born nursing assistants is much higher in cities than in rural areas.

Widespread stereotypes about women in general, and nonwhite and foreign-born women in particular, probably account for some of the tendency to dismiss nursing assistants as unskilled workers. As Wilner and Wyatt (1998) put it: "Home care aides especially, but CNAs as well, face a constant struggle against those who perceive or treat them as 'girls' or 'maids.' 'This struggle reflects deep-seated prejudices about poor and working class women, especially African-American and Latin women. Since most workers choose this field as a health-related position, it is particularly frustrating for them to be perceived as glorified domestic service workers.' (Surpin & Grumm, 1990)"²⁷

Just over half of all nursing assistants (51.5 percent) are between the ages of 25 and 44. More than a quarter (27.4 percent) attended at least some college.

Appropriateness of Minimum Nurse Staffing Ratios in Nursing Homes
Phase II Final Report, December 2001

²⁵ Beck C, Ortigara A, Mercer S, Shue V (March 1999). Enabling and empowering certified nursing assistants for quality dementia care. *International Journal of Geriatric Psychiatry* 14(3):197-211; discussion 211-2.

^{26 1999} employment and wages for selected health care occupations and industries. Bureau of Labor Statistics, Occupational Employment Statistics, Washington, DC.

Wilner, Mary Ann, and Wyatt, Ann. (1998) Paraprofessionals on the front lines: Improving their jobs—improving the quality of long-term care, September 10-11, 1998. A conference background paper prepared for the AARP long-term care initiative. AARP (Washington, DC).

Most nursing assistants are their family's primary wage earners. Only 39.4 percent are married, yet over half (56.3 percent) have children under the age of 18. About one in three (32.4 percent) are unmarried with children. Yet wages are low.

The median hourly wage for nursing assistants, orderlies and attendants was \$8.29 in 1999. ²⁸ As a result, many workers live in poverty. Eighteen percent of all nursing facility nursing assistants have family incomes below the federal poverty level, 13.5 percent use food stamps, and 56 percent live at less than twice the poverty level. ²⁹ The median annual salary for a nursing facility nursing assistant is \$13,287, just 120 percent of the poverty level for a family of two. ³⁰

Health insurance is out of reach for many. According to Wilner and Wyatt (1998), only 36 percent of all frontline workers have the option of getting health insurance through their jobs, and 28.5 percent have no health insurance at all. Nursing assistants who work in nursing facilities may be offered health insurance more often than their peers in home care, but even those whose employers offer the benefit often cannot afford it. In a report based on a survey of 900 nursing assistants who work in nursing facilities, the Service Employees International Union found that 22 percent of all workers in long term care are uninsured, compared to just 14.5 percent of workers nationwide. "Close to 20 percent of CNAs surveyed don't even have access to healthcare coverage by their employer, while another 25 percent of those who are offered health plans cannot afford them," noted the report. 32

7.4.1 Stayers and Leavers

Genevieve Gipson, the founder of Career Nurse Assistants Programs Inc. and the National Network of Career Nursing Assistants, cautions against lumping all nursing assistants together in this and other statistical analyses. At one end of the scale, she says, are those who last less than a year in the profession, increasing turnover rates and changing the overall demographic profile. At the other extreme are the veterans she calls "career nurse assistants," who stay for years and see what they do as a calling, not just a job. In their Ohio Teaching Network studies, Gipson and colleagues found that more than half the nursing assistants they surveyed had at least two years of service, just over a quarter (28 percent) had more than five, and one in eight had between 10 and 42 years. ³³

American Federation of State, County and Municipal Employees. 2001. *Cheating Dignity. The Direct Care Wage Crisis in America*. AFSCME. Washington, DC.

²⁹ Center for Workforce Studies, University of Albany, 2001 analysis of CPS data, 1997,1998, 1999.

³⁰ GAO, May 17, 2001.

Wilner and Wyatt 1998.

Service Employees International Union (1998). A crisis for caregivers: Health insurance out of reach for nursing home workers.

Gipson G.A. and Garland T. N. (June 29, 1998) Final Report: Training Experienced Nurse Assistants in Long Term Care.

Maun, Lind, and Efta (2001) report a similar finding, based on consulting work done in a number of nursing facilities: "Without exception, in every client facility, we find that 60% to 80% of the staff have been there two years or longer, many since the doors opened. The other 20% to 40% fill jobs that routinely turn over five and six times per year.... Turnover rates exceeding 100% generate from as few as 20% of total positions." ³⁴

Although there are no national statistics on stayers, they appear to have somewhat different characteristics ³⁵ than their shorter-term colleagues. ³⁶ Career nursing assistants appear to be a bit older than other nursing assistants (55.9 percent are between 31 and 50). They are somewhat less likely to have gone to college, with 86.1 percent having completed their formal education at the level of high school graduation or less. As Peacock (2000) pointed out, "This profile may be an artifact of perceived or real opportunities available." ³⁷

Another significant difference is the stability of their primary relationships. More than half (54.3 percent) of the stayers surveyed by Gipson et al. are married, compared to less than 40 percent of all nursing assistants.

7.4.2 Strivers and Endurers

Tellis-Nayak and Tellis-Nayak (1989) proposed another way to differentiate between nursing assistants. Like Gipson and colleagues, they divided nursing assistants into two broad categories, but these categories, which the Tellis-Nayaks labeled "Strivers" and "Endurers," were based on attitude toward the job rather than years of service.³⁸ In the Tellis-Nayaks' estimation, nursing assistants who stay on the job for years often do so only because they cannot envision or attain a more desirable alternative

The Tellis-Nayaks noted that all nursing assistants "share a common denominator: their socioeconomic class. They are mostly women and belong to the lowest rung of the health care labor market: they are the least educated, the least skilled, and the least paid, often barely above the minimum wage, and they endure a low occupational status. They share the lower class lifestyle, perched precariously, as most of them are, just above the poverty line, straddling that uneasy fence that separates the two lowest classes, the working class and the lower class."

Maun C., Lind D, Efta G (2001). Workforce 21: Recruitment, selection and retention of top quality staff in the 21st century. Maun-Lemke Inc. (Omaha, NE).

³⁵ Gipson and Garland 1998.

³⁶ GAO, May 17, 2001.

Brian Peacock Consulting Inc. (January 2000) Recruitment, training, employment and retention: Report on certified nursing assistants in Florida's nursing homes. Florida Department of Elder Affairs (Tallahassee, FL).

Tellis-Nayak, V. and Tellis-Nayak Mary (1989). Quality of care and the burden of two cultures: When the world of the nurse's aide enters the world of the nursing home. *Gerontologist* 29(3): 307-313.

But Strivers and Endurers react very differently to their shared circumstances. Strivers work hard to overcome adversity, sometimes with help from family members or others, but and always "[w]ith sheer effort, with singular determination and at a heavy price." Endurers "continue to live precariously on the edge, some caught in exploitative marriages or heartless liaisons, some as single parents valiantly seeking a better future for their children, some full of dreams but with few skills to match their hopes, and others turned cynical because, being realists, they have little hope left. Many of them had looked elsewhere for a job, but they all ended up at the nursing home. The nursing home is always short of nurse's aides."

The authors noted that no statistics clearly showed which of those types of workers predominated in nursing facilities, but added that "the data support the common impression that nursing homes hire Strivers far more than the Endurers, perhaps by a margin of 2 to 1. But because the Strivers keep their sights high, they often make up the great nursing home staff exodus. Thus, at any one time, Strivers form only a minority among the nurse's aides in a given nursing home."

7.5 The Link Between Education and Retention

7.5.1 The Importance of Turnover

The rate of turnover for this group is notorious. The lack of a standardized formula for computing turnover and retention data makes it difficult to compare data, but estimates range from 38 percent to 143 percent a year, depending on the sample studied and the method used.³⁹

Some turnover among nursing assistants is inevitable—perhaps even healthy. The high rates common in nursing facilities, however, have a negative effect on residents. Constant turnover means that residents are frequently being cared for by new hires, and even seasoned nursing assistants are at a disadvantage during their first few months at a new job. The better nursing assistants know the residents they care for, the better they can identify changes in mental or physical conditions. Time on the job also allows nursing assistants and residents to develop the emotional ties that are key to residents' quality of life.

Furthermore, frequent turnover may affect the morale and workload of those who stay behind. Researcher Karl Pillemer pointed out that frequent turnover hurts morale by weakening the sense of belonging people get from "a stable group of work friends whom they know and trust," thus starting a vicious cycle. The more nursing assistants leave, "the less content are those staff persons who stay. Then these staff themselves become likely to leave. And of course, chronic staff shortages led to increased work load for nursing assistants, and more job stress." ⁴⁰

Appropriateness of Minimum Nurse Staffing Ratios in Nursing Homes
Phase II Final Report, December 2001

American Health Care Association (February 2001), Health Services Research and Evaluation. Staffing of nursing services in long term care: Present issues and prospects for the future. AHCA, Washington, DC.

Pillemer K. The revolving door (and why it turns) (fall 1996). Journal of Long Term Care Administration. 24(3):46-9.

As Straker and Atchley (June 1999) summed up, "At the minimum, turnover affects continuity of care and care recipient relationships. In addition, staff turnover can often result in staffing shortages that require the remaining staff to do too much work in too little time." ⁴¹

7.5.2 The Effect of Nursing Assistant Education on Turnover

Several studies indicate that education is one of several significant factors that affect nursing assistant turnover rates, although other factors are believed to have a greater influence.

High turnover rates have been linked to insufficient or ineffective orientation, ⁴² ineffective supervision, ⁴³ failure to attend to nursing assistants' emotional needs, ⁴⁴ strong economies that offer a variety of job opportunities, ⁴⁵ and autocratic management systems that allow nursing assistants little control over their daily routines or input into resident care plans. ⁴⁶⁻⁴⁷ As a May 2001 GAO report summarizes: "The 2000 IOM study of quality in long-term care identified several environmental and job design factors that directly affect nurse aide turnover, including:

- adequacy of training;
- methods for managing workload and schedules;
- opportunities for career advancements;
- respect from administrators;
- organizational recognition;
- workloads and staffing levels;
- clarity of roles; and
- participation in decision making." ⁴⁸

As review of existing literature for a recent Pennsylvania study notes, "Training is believed to be related to turnover, but little hard data is available to support this proposition. Some studies have

Straker, Jane Karnes and Atchley, Robert C. (June 1999) Recruiting and retaining frontline workers in long-term care: Usual organizational practices in Ohio. Scripps Gerontology Center, Miami University (Oxford, Ohio).

⁴² Tynan, C. and Witherell, J.(1984) Good orientation cuts turnover. Geriatric Nursing 5(3): 173-175.

Garland, N, Oyabu, N., and Gipson, G. (1989) Job Satisfaction among nurse assistants employed in nursing homes: An analysis of selected job characteristics. *Journal of Aging Studies* 3(4): 369-181.

⁴⁴ Tellis-Nayak V. and Tellis-Nayak M. (1989).

Banaszak-Holl, Jane and Hines, M. A. (1996) Factors associated with nursing home staff turnover. Gerontologist. 36(4).

Streit, A and Brannon, D. (1994) The effect of primary nursing job design dimensions on caregiving technology and job performance in nursing homes. *Health Services Management Research*, 7: 271-278.

Aroskar, Mila Ann; Urv-Wong, E.K. and Kane, R.A. (1990) Building an Effective Caregiving Staff: Transforming the Nursing Service in Kane, R. and Caplan, A.L. (eds.) Everyday Ethics: Resolving Dilemmas in Nursing Home Life. New York: Springer Publishing.

⁴⁸ GAO, May 17, 2001.

found that training programs in nursing homes did not have much of an effect on the performance by nurse aides." ⁴⁹⁻⁵⁰ However, the researchers found a strong relationship between retention rates and the number of hours of training provided, supporting "the idea that more training has a positive effect on retention."

Another study of nursing assistants in two nursing facilities found that those who were assigned at random to an educational program on dementia care had lower turnover rates at three months and six months after the training than the control group. The researchers posited that the CNAs who attended the classes may have felt more empowered and better able to communicate with the residents they cared for.⁵¹

But the strongest link between turnover rates and education does not appear to be what nursing assistants are taught. Instead, it may be what they are *not* taught. Crucial skills such as critical thinking and time management are rarely covered in class (see Section 7.12). Little or no time is typically spent on teaching how to communicate with people with dementia, although 70.9 percent of all nursing facility residents have long-term and/or short-term memory problems, 72.9 percent have problems with orientation, and the ability to make daily decisions is impaired or severely impaired in 80.6 percent. ⁵² And regardless of what is taught in class, newly minted nursing assistants generally find that getting things done takes precedence over doing them right.

With one nursing assistant commonly responsible for nine or more residents on the day shift and twice as many at night, ⁵³ time management often degenerates into triage. Baths and meals are given on a tight schedule and at the convenience of the home's routine rather than the residents, leading to things like waking residents in the middle of the night for showers. Call lights are left unanswered, nonessential tasks such as nail care are neglected, and practices are often adopted that endanger either residents or staff. ⁵⁴

"The training I got had a lot of good ideas," said nursing assistant Shirley Rosser. 55 "Some I still think about, especially ways of lifting, universal precautions, things that are not really hands-on

⁴⁹ Brannon D. and Smyer M.A. (1994) Good work and good caring in nursing homes. *Generations* 18:34-38.

Smyer M., Brannon D. and Cohn M. (1992) Improving nursing home care through training and job redesign. *Gerontologist* 32: 327-333.

McMallion P et al. (1999) Educating nursing assistants to communicate more effectively with nursing home residents with dementia." *Gerontologist* 39(3): 546-558.

Krauss MA and Altman BM. Characteristics of Nursing Home Residents—1996. Agency for Healthcare Policy and Research 1998, MEPS Research Findings No. 5, AHCPR Publication No. 99-0006 (Rockwell, MD).

Stakeholder perceptions of appropriate nursing home minimum staffing: Report on focus groups with nurse aides (Summer 2000). Report to Congress: Appropriateness of Minimum Nurse Staffing Ratios in Nursing Homes, Volume I, Chapter 5. Health Care Financing Administration, Washington, DC.

Bowers and Becker 1992.

⁵⁵ Personal communication.

care. When it comes to that, you are too busy to 'do it right'; you just need to get it done. Isn't that a shame, to treat our residents like that? Yet it is the only way to get done before the end of the shift."

Researcher Karl Pillemer found that 40 to 50 percent of all nursing assistants leave during orientation and training,⁵⁶ often because they don't know where to turn for help in prioritizing a competing list of demands. "Frustration with their inability to get everything done leads to low self-esteem, high stress levels and disillusionment with their job," he wrote. "The new CNA graduates generally have not had enough experience to gain good organizational, prioritizing, and time management skills."

Robert Atchley reported similar findings. "Nursing home workers often quit early in their tenure, some in response to the heavy demands of the job, some to pursue better opportunities, and some from disillusionment caused by the gap between when they saw as the ideal of frontline care and the realities of work in many nursing homes," he wrote. 57 "Of course," he added, "others leave because they do not like the work or are discharged because they are not doing an adequate job."

For those who stay, a lack of time management skills may lead to inadequate care, according to one study of nurses' perceptions of the role played by nursing assistants. One contributor to poor care, they said, was that "nurse assistants often do not receive enough practical experience in their training and are therefore too frequently ill-prepared for 'real world' conditions." ⁵⁸

7.6 The History of Current Educational Requirements

7.6.1 1986 IOM Study and the History Behind OBRA 87

Prior to the Omnibus Budget Reconciliation Act of 1987 (OBRA '87), there were no federal requirements concerning the qualifications of nursing assistants.

A 1986 study by the Institute of Medicine ⁵⁹ found that nursing assistants provided approximately 90 percent of the care received by nursing home residents, and that federal regulations allowed nursing assistants to deliver care without the supervision of a registered, licensed, or vocational nurse from 3 p.m. to 7 a.m. Yet these key caregivers were generally inexperienced and inadequately trained to perform their duties.

Atchley, Robert C. Frontline workers in long-term care: Recruitment, retention, and turnover issues in an era of rapid growth. Scripps Gerontology Center, Miami University (Oxford, OH), September 1996.

⁵⁶ Pillemer (Fall 1996).

Shirm, V and Garland, T.N. (1997) Nurses' Perceptions of the role of nurse assistants in delivery of quality care in the nursing home. Presented at the annual meeting of the Midwest Sociological Society, Des Moines, Iowa, April 3-6, 1997.

Institute of Medicine, Committee on Nursing Home Regulation. 1986. Improving the Quality of Care In Nursing Homes. Washington, D.C.: National Academy Press.

The study reported that only one-third of the states (17) mandated training programs for nursing assistants, and their requirements varied widely. Some required only 20 hours, while others required 150, comprised of 50 hours of classroom and 100 of clinical training. There was no consistency in format or course content.

The study's recommendations, which provided the basis for much of OBRA 87, included a call for federal standards for nursing assistant training. IOM recommended that, as part of the administration conditions of participation in Medicare or Medicaid, nursing homes must employ only nursing assistants who have completed a state-approved training program in a state-accredited institution such as a community college.

Federal regulations

The federal regulations concerning certification training for nursing assistants address virtually all aspects of administration and testing of the programs. They do not contain instructor-to-student ratios, but some states have established these ratios on their own. In addition, many states have increased the minimum number of training hours. California, for instance, requires at least 150 hours of training.

The provisions of the OBRA '87 ⁶⁰ legislation were implemented through regulations and guidelines. The Social Security Act added new provisions relating to nurse aide competency evaluation programs (CEPs) and nurse aide training and competency evaluation programs (NATCEPs). Sections 1819(b)(5), 1819(e)(1), and 1819(f)(2), 1919(b)(5), 1919(e)(1), and 1919(f)(2) of the Act established the following:

- Facilities participating in Medicare and Medicaid may not employ anyone as a nursing assistant for more than four months unless the individual has completed a NATCEP or a CEP approved by the state and is competent to provide such services.
- The Secretary must establish standards for the training and competency evaluation of nurse aides.
- States may approve only of CEPs and NATCEPs that met the standards established by the Secretary.
- States may not approve a program offered by or in a nursing facility that has been determined to be out of compliance with federal long-term care facility requirements within the previous two years.
- Facilities may not employ temporary nursing assistants who have not completed a NATCEP or CEP approved by the state.

Appropriateness of Minimum Nurse Staffing Ratios in Nursing Homes
Phase II Final Report, December 2001

Federal Register 42CFR Part 431 et al. *Medicare and Medicaid; Requirements for Long Term Care Facilities; Final Rule* 56(187): September 26, 1991

Federal regulations established basic curriculum requirements for a nursing assistant training program.⁶¹ While states and individual instructors were welcome to include more, they were required to include the following:

- At least 16 hours of training prior to any direct contact with a resident, which must incorporate
 - --communication and interpersonal skills
 - --infection control
 - --safety and emergency procedures, including the Heimlich maneuver
 - --promoting residents' independence
 - --respecting resident's rights.
- Basic nursing skills, including
 - --taking and recording vital signs
 - --measuring and recording height and weight
 - --caring for the residents' environment
 - --recognizing abnormal changes in body functioning
 - --reporting such changes to a supervisor
 - --caring for residents when death is imminent.
- Personal care skills, including
 - --bathing
 - --grooming, including mouth care
 - --dressing
 - --toileting
 - --assisting with eating and hydration
 - --proper feeding techniques
 - --skin care
 - --transfers, positioning, and turning.
- Mental health and social service needs, including
 - --modifying one's own behavior in response to residents' behavior
 - --awareness of developmental tasks associated with the aging process
 - -- allowing residents to make personal choices
 - --providing and reinforcing other behavior consistent with the resident's dignity
 - --using the resident's family as a source of emotional support.
- Care of cognitively impaired residents, including
 - --techniques for addressing the needs and behaviors of individual with Alzheimer's disease and other dementias
 - --communicating with cognitively impaired residents
 - --understanding the behavior of cognitively impaired residents
 - --appropriate responses to the behavior of cognitively impaired residents
 - --methods of reducing the effects of cognitive impairments.

⁶¹ Federal Regulations, Title 42, Part 483, Subpart D, Section 483.152

- Basic restorative services, including
 - --training residents in self care to the fullest extent possible
 - --use of assistive devices in transferring, ambulation, eating, and dressing
 - --maintaining residents/ range of motion
 - --proper turning and positioning in bed and chair
 - --bowel and bladder training
 - --care and use of prosthetic and orthotic devices.
- Residents' rights, including
 - --providing privacy and maintaining confidentiality
 - --promoting the residents' right to make personal choices to accommodate their needs
 - --giving assistance in resolving grievances and disputes
 - --providing needed assistance in participating in resident and family groups and other activities
 - --maintaining care and security of residents' personal possessions
 - --promoting the resident's right to be free from abuse, mistreatment, and neglect
 - --reporting instances of such treatment to appropriate facility staff
 - --avoiding the need for restraints in accordance with current professional standards.

Section 483.152 also specifies who must pay for nursing assistant training, stating the following: "(1) No nurse aide who is employed by, or who has received an offer of employment from, a facility on the date on which the aide begins a nurse aide training and competency evaluation program may be charged for any portion of the program (including any fees for textbooks or other required course materials).

(2) If an individual who is not employed, or does not have an offer to be employed, as a nurse aide becomes employed by, or receives an offer of employment from, a facility not later than 12 months after completing a nurse aide training and competency evaluation program, the State must provide for the reimbursement of costs incurred in completing the program on a pro rata basis during the period in which the individual is employed as a nurse aide."

Finally, federal regulations⁶² establish the following guidelines for state approval of a NATCEP or CEP:

- The state must respond to a request for approval within 90 days.
- The state must make at least one on-site visit to the entity providing the training or performing the competency evaluation.
- State approval of a program is granted for a two-year period.
- A program must consist of no less than 75 hours of training and include at least 16 hours of supervised practical training. Practical training is defined as training in a

Appropriateness of Minimum Nurse Staffing Ratios in Nursing Homes
Phase II Final Report, December 2001

Federal Register 42CFR Part 431 et al. *Medicare and Medicaid; Requirements for Long Term Care Facilities; Final Rule* 56(187): September 26, 1991

clinical setting in which the trainee demonstrates knowledge while performing tasks on an individual under the direct supervision of a registered nurse (RN) or a licensed practical nurse (LPN).

- Training must be performed by, or under the general supervision of, an RN who has a
 minimum two years of nursing experience, at least one year of which must be in the
 provision of long-term care services. In a facility-based program, that function may
 be performed by the director of nursing.
- A NATCEP must employ the competency evaluation procedures specified in 483.154, which details such matters as how the evaluation must address each course requirement listed above and the importance of using a system that prevents disclosure of the answers.

Why current educational requirements may not be sufficient

As was the case when IOM published its 1986 study, CNAs continue to provide approximately 90 percent of the care to nursing home residents. In the past 15 years, however, the average acuity level of nursing home residents has risen, requiring nursing assistants to deliver more complex care. Yet the training provided to CNAs has not changed with this change in resident acuity.

In addition, there is little consistency nationwide in the content of nursing assistant training programs or the number of hours of certification training required, although these programs appear to meet federal requirements. In-services and other educational programs also vary widely in content and format.

Finally, there is growing evidence that the minimum federal requirements may not be adequate to meet the educational needs of nursing assistants. More hours of certification training and a greater focus on orientation for new workers and supervision and ongoing education for both new and experienced CNAs may be needed to prepare nursing assistants for the complex demands of their job.

7.7 Effective Teaching Methods

7.7.1 How Nursing Assistants Learn Job Skills

Nursing assistants value their formal educations. Shirm et al. (2000) noted that "many nursing assistants felt there is no substitute for experience in learning how best to meet residents' needs, [but] they also frequently commented that formal training was necessary for learning how to provide good care." Deutschmann (2001) asked nursing facility administrators, directors of nursing, nursing assistants, social workers, family members and surveyors about obstacles to

Schirm, Victoria, Albanese, Terry, Garland, T. Neal, Gipson, Genevieve and Blackmon, Dorothy J. (August 2000) Caregiving in nursing homes. *Clinical Nursing Research*, 9(3): 280-297.

quality care. When asked to name opportunities for change, "Training, orientation or education" tied for first place, mentioned by more respondents than anything else other than "improve communication." ⁶⁴

Yet their formal training and education receives poor marks from many nursing assistants. In a 1998 study of nursing assistants, 86 percent of the respondents rated education and training to do their job better as "very important," but more than a third (37 percent) said their training had not prepared them to do the job well. As one said: "I figure a lot out on my own because of my background, but I feel all of us would benefit from timely and complete training at the beginning of our employment." 65

To be effective, "timely and complete" training must not be limited to the classroom. Classroom teaching, noted Robert Atchley in a 1996 study, "is often negatively evaluated by frontline workers in long-term care, often because it is either 'above their heads' or has no obvious application in their everyday work." Respondents to the Iowa Caregivers Association's focus groups echoed that sentiment, and most agreed that the best way to learn skills was "by being shown what to do, and then practicing 'hands on' until they can perform comfortably by themselves."

In a survey of nursing assistants with relatively long job tenures, Gipson et al (August 1998) found that many of the tasks they considered very important and/or did every day were learned on their own or from others on the job rather than in formal training. These included the following:

- Learn how to train a new nurse assistant (22 percent self-taught; 58 percent taught on the job);
- Check and report on the condition of a resident's skin (20 percent self-taught; more than 50 percent taught on the job);
- Communicate about a resident's condition or behavior to other members of the staff (28 percent self taught; 49 percent taught on the job); and
- Position resident properly in bed (9 percent self-taught; 60 percent taught on the job). ⁶⁸

Nursing assistants also teach one another how to do things—not always correctly. "New [nursing assistants] are sometimes berated [by their experienced coworkers] for doing things the right way

⁶⁴ Deutschmann, Marian (August 2001).

Hill Simonton Bell, LC. (December 1998) Certified nursing assistant (CNA) recruitment and retention pilot project. Phase I: Survey results. Iowa Caregivers Association.

⁶⁶ Atchley 1996.

Hill Simonton Bell, LC. (January 1999) Certified nursing assistant (CNA) recruitment and retention pilot project. Phase II: Focus group study results. Iowa Caregivers Association.

Gipson, G, Garland, RN and Benedict L (August 1998). Training experienced nursing assistants in long term care: A research report submitted to the National Institute on Aging, Washington, DC.

and not taking shortcuts," points out nursing assistant educator Barbara Acello. "Many cannot resist the peer pressure and do not stand their ground, so they develop sloppy work habits." Researcher Marian Deutschman makes a similar point. "Newcomers learn appropriate (and sometimes inappropriate) behaviors by listening to stories and anecdotes, hearing about rituals and observing the nonverbal behaviors or their peers and supervisors," she writes.

To reinforce good work habits on the job, some providers combine formal training with formalized, institutionally supported peer supervision. Robert Atchley believes that combination can be powerful. "[T]raining that emphasizes classroom formats is not nearly as effective as a model that uses senior 'master CNAs' to work alongside frontline staff, model effective job performance, and train CNAs as they go," he says. "In this latter context, material is introduced when it is most relevant and is not disconnected from the activities of the job. Of course, the master CNAs themselves must be trained to be trainers."

After researching current methods of training nursing assistants, Kramer and Smith (May 2000) concluded that one of the most effective was "a model which could perhaps best be described as 'peer-oriented,' with the focus on nursing assistants teaching and sharing with each other." ⁷² That method shows promise, they wrote, because it allows nursing assistants to benefit from each other's "valuable and extensive knowledge base." The researchers believed that nursing assistants would be more receptive to information and ideas emanating from their peers, more likely to implement them, and perhaps even inclined to "encourage their use and implementation among one another."

The Cooperative Healthcare Network (CHCN), a group of five agencies and training programs for direct care workers, has documented several essential elements of effective training based on 15 years of experience. Prominent features of the CHCN training program include peer support groups for new workers led by former nursing assistants and a coaching style of supervision, which builds a positive relationship between nursing assistants and their supervisors and encourages nursing assistants to develop and use problem-solving skills while maintaining high standards of care. Although most CHCN providers work with home health aides, the network's approach to training can be applied to preparing direct care workers in any setting. (For details, see Sections 7.7.2 and 7.16.2.)

Peer support groups have also proven effective. In a study of support groups for nursing assistants led by a skilled facilitator in 16 Massachusetts nursing facilities, Wilner and

⁶⁹ Personal communication.

Deutschman Marian. (June 2000) "What you hear when you listen to staff," Nursing Homes Long Term Care Management.

⁷¹ Personal communication.

Kramer, N.A. and Smith, M.C. (May 2000). The Effectiveness of a peer-oriented, work-integration dementia care training program for nursing assistants: Final report. New York State Department of Health Dementia Project.

Shenkman (1993) reported: "Participation in the groups helped nursing assistants to work better as a team, to learn from one another, and to develop new skills of coping, communication and problem solving as well as to carry those back to their responsibilities on the floor. Nursing assistants also enhanced their [feelings] of self-confidence." ⁷³ Participants who had difficulties with English used the sessions to practice and improve their English language skills. Others reported learning more about teamwork, how to communicate with peers and supervisors, and how to express themselves more effectively. This ability to communicate better also helped reduce their stress on the floor. "Learning how to communicate... eased some of the tension," said one participant. "It also made me feel important because people took the time to listen to you," said another. In addition, learning emerged from the exchange of technical information about resident care and from practicing skills of communication and problem solving through the group interaction.

Long term care employers in the Pioneer Network, a national organization dedicated to changing the culture of aging in America, have designed training programs and a supportive workplace culture that is based on Network and individual organization values. Several of these employers, including Apple Health Care and Providence Mount St. Vincent, are highlighted in more detail throughout this chapter.

From the first day of work, the training emphasis at Network member facilities is on skill building to enter into a caregiving relationship. Tasks are de-emphasized. For example, CNAs are taught to get to know an individual, learn their bathing habits and incorporate this information into the bathing experience the resident will be offered in the nursing home. Nursing assistants enter into relationships with a primary group of residents whom they always care for, so the CNA knows those residents are looking forward to seeing her, depending on her not only for care tasks but for the fact that she knows each resident personally and brings that knowledge into the care. Pioneers seek to engage both elders and experienced CNAs in the training process. Learning from residents directly, and from peers who experience the challenges CNAs face daily, is more effective than being taught by a nurse alone.

Many Pioneer organizations offer their own CNA certification courses. Although state and federal requirements are met with regard to the minimum certification standards, many add communication and on-the-job training. In addition, the Network strongly encourages career ladder opportunities, which enable a CNA to grow within the career of CNA, advancing both job responsibilities and wages. (For more on career ladders, see Section 7.13.)

_

Wilner, M.A. and Shenkman S (1993). *Evaluation of Nursing Assistant Support Groups in Nursing Homes*. Final Report to National Center for Nursing Research of the National Institutes of Health (Washington, DC).

7.7.2 Adult Learning Methods

Research shows that not everyone learns in the same way. ⁷⁴⁻⁷⁵ While some easily absorb information delivered in lectures or books, others tend to tune out a barrage of written or spoken words. In fact, according to researcher David Lazear, everyone learns in multiple ways.

Lazear (1991) divided adult methods of learning into seven types: verbal-linguistic, visual-spatial, logical-mathematical, kinesthetic, musical-rhythmic, interpersonal, intrapersonal, and natural awareness. To teach a group of adults incorporating various styles of learning, he argued, educators must use a variety of teaching styles, including demonstrations and role playing for the kinesthetic learners, graphics for the visual learners, repetition or rhyme for the musical-rhythmic learners, and so on.

These methods need not replace the traditional lecture. Instead, they can augment it. As one recent paper put it, a lecture is the most effective way of teaching "as long as it is well structured, clearly presented and uses the full range of techniques and visual aids available."⁷⁷

In addition to differing ways of learning, adult learners have previous life and work experience that may affect the way they process new information. Phillips and Baldwin (1997) noted that nursing facility nursing assistants tend to be older than their peers in acute care and have a significant amount of work experience. As a result, they concluded, "New information must be incorporated into existing knowledge and ideas." This could be done most effectively, they said, through adult learning methods such as videotaping and then analyzing role-plays, or introducing a new topic by discussing related experiences that the students have had. ⁷⁸

Nursing assistant educators often incorporate devices such as role playing and sensory deprivation exercises into nursing assistant training programs, but the success of such methods varies depending on the educator's charisma and energy level and the extent of his or her formal training in how to teach adults. The biggest hurdle to implementing these innovations may be simply finding the time to fit them in. "We teach the traditional way—lecture and lab in the classroom, 24 hours of clinical," said one nursing assistant educator of the certification training she offers. "We try to be as innovative as possible with creative teaching techniques, but it is a

Kolb, D. (1987) "The process of experiential learning," *Culture and Processes of Adult Learning*. London: Routledge.

Anderson, J. and Adams, M. (1992) "Acknowledging the learning styles of diverse student populations: Implications for instructional design" Teaching for Diversity, 49:23.

Lazear, D. (1991) Seven ways of knowing: Teaching to multiple intelligences. Skylight Publishing (Palatine, IL).

Adcock, Lesley. (July 2000) Linking basic theory to practice for healthcare assistants. *Journal of Community Nursing*.

Phillips R and Baldwin BA (Mary/June 1997). Teaching psychosocial care to long-term care nursing assistants. Journal of Continuing Education in Nursing 28(3): 130-134

vast amount of material to cover in a very short time." ⁷⁹

The Cooperative Healthcare Network uses a four-to five-week program to educate its direct care workers, most of whom are home health aides. The program is based on the philosophy that, while adults often resist formal education, everyone continues to learn and incorporate new knowledge throughout their lives. This may be especially true of new recruits to nursing facilities, who may have poor histories in the formal educational system. For details on the CHCN training program, which incorporates various adult teaching techniques, see Section 7.16.

7.8 Certification Education and Testing

7.8.1 What Gets Taught in Certification Classes

The curriculum varies dramatically from state to state. Some mandate only the 75-hour federal minimum of classroom or supervised lab time and require no clinical experience in a nursing home, while others require much more. (For details, see Section 7.6.1.)

Instructors are free to teach more than the mandated minimum, and many do. Certain types of providers may also offer more than others, on average. A Pennsylvania study found that government-operated nursing facilities provided an average of 105 hours of formal education, while privately operated facilities averaged 78 hours. 80

Clinical experience is not required in every state. In fact, some states forbid it. Student nursing assistants in Oregon aren't allowed any hands-on experience until they've finished their certification classes, says Oregon-based researcher Joanne Rader. "If these people don't have any [clinical] experience, nothing that's said in the classroom really makes any sense," she notes. 81

There may also be some disconnect between what students are taught in certification classes and what they do on the job. In Oregon, Rader points out, students must learn how to use physical restraints, although most facilities in the state don't use them any more."

7.8.2 The Basic Curriculum

At its most basic, the material covers just 75 hours. At least 16 hours must consist of practical training supervised by a registered nurse or licensed practical nurse.

In Texas, which one nursing assistant educator describes as fairly typical of states that require only 75 hours, the mandated material is divided into five sections. Those sections may be taught in any order, but the material within each section must be taught as a unit.

⁷⁹ Personal communication

Pennsylvania's Frontline Workers, February 2001

Personal communication

Section One includes the 16 hours on specific topics that OBRA says must be taught before students may have any contact with nursing facility residents. It introduces all the major topics, starting with an overview of nursing facility residents; the nursing assistant's role; communication and interpersonal skills; and good work habits. It covers resident rights and other OBRA regulations, as well as other laws that apply to nursing facilities, such as the Safe Medical Device Act and accident and incident reporting. It touches on infection control and basic nursing skills. It addresses personal care — both attending to one's own physical and mental health and helping residents with bathing, toileting, mouth care and other personal care needs. It covers mental health and social service skills; basic restorative care; and care for the cognitively impaired. It covers creating a safe environment, including fall prevention and what to do in case of a fall, a seizure, vomiting, or choking; and what to do in case of fire or a natural disaster.

Federal law mandates that the Heimlich maneuver must be taught, but CPR generally is not — perhaps because there's no time to fit it in. "This is intense stuff you're squeezing into those 16 hours," points out a nursing assistant educator.

Section Two focuses on delivering personal care to residents, covering grooming, bathing, transfers, positioning, nail care, incontinence and perineal care, nutrition and hydration, care of the resident's environment, oral hygiene and more. Texas requires that 17 hours be spent on this section.

Section Three covers basic nursing skills. Included are measuring and recording blood pressure and other vital signs, use of restraints, measuring height and weight, care of the dead and dying, and procedures for admission, transfer, and discharge. Students are also taught observation skills and told how to report and chart treatments and changes in resident status. This section must last at least eight hours.

Section Four covers restorative care, including range of motion, ambulation, assisting residents with adaptive or assistive devices and prostheses, and more. This section is important, points out Acello, because "the OBRA requirements are all about maintaining and improving resident functioning, and that's what restorative care is all about." Texas requires at least four hours of training in this area.

Section Five, which encompasses mental health and social services, covers Abraham Maslow's hierarchy of needs, the losses nursing facility residents commonly experience, how to cope with their problematic behaviors, and information about aging, residents' coping and defense mechanisms, and dementia and other cognitive losses. Texas mandates six hours to cover that material.

7.8.3 Going Beyond the Basics

Texas educators say the curriculum is difficult to cover in just two weeks. One instructor says her community college program includes 144 classroom and 64 clinical hours. The additional hours,

she says, give her a chance to get into "critical thinking skills. Instead of just giving a bath, we're really looking at the individual." ⁸²

The extra time also allows her instructors to teach the crucial communications aspect of care more effectively, even role-playing how to make small talk with residents. "Students go into the clinical scared; they don't know how to start a conversation with someone they don't know," she says. It gives instructors time to explain not just what nursing assistants should do but why. And, she says, because her students understand why it's important to do things like wash their hands and dress neatly, they're still doing those things on the job years later.

Other states routinely offer considerably more than 75 hours of training. In Florida, for instance, the minimum number of hours is 120, but programs may last up to three times that long. Private training programs in the state averaged 259.5 hours in 1997-98.

7.8.4 Who Develops the Curriculum

Each state appoints a regulatory body — often the state board of nursing or health department, but sometimes an independent contractor — to develop its guidelines. Sometimes the governing body writes the guidelines, but more often it convenes a group of RNs and other experts to create them. The group may also create a curriculum or approve the use of an existing curriculum.

Nursing assistants are virtually never asked for input into these curricula. One review of programs found that almost all "take their ideas, information, and principles of care from the work of various health care professions, but not from nursing assistants."⁸⁴

Many educators follow a curriculum developed by the Red Cross. Others use the ProCare curriculum. ProCare was developed in 1988 for the American Health Care Association by Educational Testing Service and Professional Training Systems, Inc., with input from long term care providers, health care educators, state regulators, consumer advocates, and others.

7.8.5 How the Curriculum is Taught

Certification training is usually delivered through a combination of lectures, discussions, videotapes, and supervised hands-on practice. Students typically practice on one another in the classroom, though many states or individual schools also require clinical practice in a nursing facility as part of the curriculum.

Educators may use textbooks, educational CD-ROMs or videotapes to augment their lectures. They may bring in guest lecturers who are expert on a particular subject. They may also use

Personal communication.

Brian Peacock Consulting Inc., January 2000.

Kramer, N. and Smith, M. (2000) Training nursing assistants to care for nursing home residents with dementia, in V. Molinari (Ed.), *Professional psychology in long term care*, NY: Hatherleigh.

tactics such as empathy training, in which students are temporarily "handicapped," often with a blindfold, to get a sense of how it feels to live with a disability.

But the traditional style of teaching predominates. "Almost all the manuals and videotapes use a primarily didactic style in which informational material is presented via readings, videotapes, or lectures and the nursing assistant is a passive recipient, expected to maintain close attention and understand and absorb the lesson," writes Kramer. ⁸⁵ Some programs "incorporate other teaching styles to a significant degree, including discussion, role-playing or other exercises, and on-the-job training," she notes, but only a few use non-didactic styles as their main method of teaching.

Most teaching tends to be "very task-oriented: 'This is how you wash your hands,'" as one educator puts it. 86

7.8.6 Teacher Training and Supervision

Federal law requires only that the teaching be "performed by or under the general supervision of a registered nurse who possesses a minimum of two years of nursing experience," at least one of them in long term care. Some states require that all instructors be registered nurses, but others allow LPNs to teach, as long as an RN is in charge of the program.

The federal requirements for instructors' educational backgrounds are loose, requiring teachers only to "have completed a course in teaching adults or have experience in teaching adults or supervising nurse aides." Although many states mandate train-the-trainer preparation, these standards are rarely rigorous either. Ohio, for example, requires only that educators attend 28 hours of classes, which cover state laws and standards, resident and nursing assistant demographics, and training in how to use audiovisual equipment. Any other professional who may teach part of the nursing assistant course, such as a pharmacist, dietitian, fireman, or gerontologist, is required only to have at least one year of experience in his or her field.

As one study sums it up: "[T]he persons responsible for training new workers too often lack formal education and may have only a few months more experience than the persons being trained" "90"

⁸⁵ Kramer and Smith, 2000.

⁸⁶ Personal communication.

Federal Regulations, Title 42, Part 483, Subpart D, Section 483.152 (a)(5)(i).

Federal Regulations, Title 42, Part 483, Subpart D, Section 483.152 (a)(5)(ii).

⁸⁹ Personal communication, Genevieve Gipson.

Jacobs, H. (January 22, 1994) A new development in the education of direct care practitioners. SUNY-New Paltz.

7.8.7 Where Classes are Held

Classes are usually provided by nursing facilities, private schools, vocational-technical schools, or community colleges. Some high schools offer nursing assistant courses as part of their curriculum. Students who don't attend class at a nursing facility usually spend some time in one for clinical training.

A group of nursing assistants polled in 1988 cited pros and cons for each type of location. Nursing facilities, they pointed out, give students hands-on experience with residents and a more realistic sense of how to handle a typical day's work. However, they said, the quality of instruction varies widely, with good facilities providing good educations and inadequate facilities providing bad ones. Community colleges and vocational-technical schools are more closely monitored for quality, but they may lack the crucial clinical component. Private, for-profit programs elicited the most criticism, with respondents reporting that some charged "exorbitant fees," prepared students poorly, and made false promises about employment opportunities after graduation. ⁹¹

Others contend that the quality of instruction is usually better in licensed schools, pointing out that they are held accountable by the state for the quality of their instructors and instruction, while nursing facilities are not. Furthermore, students taught in nursing facilities may be taken out of class to help care for residents. "If [the facility is] short-staffed, students are pulled to the floor but given credit as if they were in the classroom," says one nursing assistant educator. ⁹²

Castle (2000) found that nursing facilities that provide their own certification training had fewer survey citations for excessive restraint use than facilities that did not do their own training. However, the author cautioned, there may not be a causal relationship between the training and the lower citation rate. Facilities that offered their own training, he hypothesized, may simply be more sophisticated than their peers, and hence likelier to be aware of the need to reduce restraint use. ⁹³

Facility-based classes are common in most areas, but government officials sometimes prohibit it. No training offered by a facility in Florida or the District of Columbia, for instance, is approved by the state unless the facility is licensed as a school. And in all states, OBRA will not allow a nursing facility to provide certification training and testing if, within the past two years, it has been cited for immediate jeopardy or certain other types of substandard care on an annual survey.

In some cases, facilities band together to train each other's workers. Seattle-based Providence Mount St. Vincent nursing home, for example, trains nursing assistants for nearby rural

_

National Citizens' Coalition for Nursing Home Reform (January 30, 1988). Final report: Nurse aide training symposium. NCCNHR, Washington, D.C.

⁹² Personal communication.

Castle, N (2000). Deficiency citations for physical restraint use in nursing homes. Journal of Gerontology 55B(1): 533-540.

facilities that do not have the resources to do their own training. (For details, see 15.2.1) An innovative partnership has developed in Tucson, where the Direct Caregiver Association (DCGA) is bringing together healthcare providers, workers and others to address the caregiver shortage by recruiting, training and retaining caregivers. A nonprofit entity developed by a local home care agency, DCGA trains home health aides not just for its parent agency but for other home health and nursing home providers throughout Tucson. In addition, it operates a resource center that offers career counseling, training, continuing education and professional development to both individuals and organizations providing long-term care.

7.8.8 Certification Testing

"In Maryland, individuals who want to become groomers and handlers of dogs must have a seven-week course (for poodles) or a 14-week course for all breeds ... To deny long-term care workers quality training is insulting to them and those they care for." "94"

The test consists of two parts, a competency evaluation and a skills demonstration. For the competency portion, the student is allowed to choose either a written or an oral exam, allowing students with poor or no literacy skills to pass. In many states, including Texas, Florida and New Mexico, students may opt to take the oral test in Spanish.

Some states have developed their own tests, while others use a test developed by the Red Cross. A handful use a test by D&S Diversified Technologies. About two-thirds use at least part of the Assessment Services International (ASI) test, some pairing the competency part of ASI's test with a skills test of their own.

The written examination of the ASI test consists of 10 pre-test questions and 60 that are scored. To pass, a candidate must get approximately 80 percent of the scored questions right. To pass the skills test, the candidate must get all the critical element steps correct, along with about 80 percent of the remaining steps within each set of five skills demonstrated.

7.8.9 Pass Rates

While the test inspires dread in nearly all who take it, the great majority pass—although some fail once or twice before succeeding. In Texas, for instance, where the test is given in three different forms, 80 percent of those tested in 2000 passed the written English version, 65.9 percent the oral English, and 52 percent the oral Spanish. And in Florida, the pass rate was 88 percent for all candidates tested during the year starting on July 1, 1997.

Some nursing assistants fault the test for being too easy, too far removed from the skills needed to do the job well. Her own test, notes nursing assistant Patricia Green, was "scary but, in hindsight, stupid.... I was observed doing tasks only. I was told to give a bed bath; I did so. I was

Holder, Elma. Paraprofessionals on the front lines: Improving their jobs—improving the quality of long term care. AARP symposium panel, September 10-11, 1998.

told to do a set of [vital signs]. Again I did so. Not once was I asked to deal with a demented lady who was having a hard time. Not once was I presented with a hypothetical situation [and asked to] verbalize how I would act." ⁹⁵

Others complain that the test is too arbitrary. Because each state's tests are developed and administered by a different group than its certification curriculum, the two don't always cover the same ground, and even the best students may fail if they are tested on material they haven't been taught.

7.8.10 Who Gives and Evaluates Tests

Each state appoints a governing body to oversee the test. This is not the same group that oversees the certification curriculum.

The testers are often the same people who teach the certification curriculum. According to federal law, a nursing facility employee may proctor the test of one of the home's own students, but someone else must evaluate and score the test.

7.8.11 "Testing Out"

A clause in the federal regulations allows a nursing assistant to become certified without taking classes if he or she can pass the test. In most states, this is a rare occasion. "I don't think someone right off the street could walk in and pass," notes Acello, who teaches in Texas and corresponds with nursing assistant educators nationwide. Those who succeed, she adds, are generally nursing students who want to work as nursing assistants while completing their educations, or former nursing assistants who want to get back on the OBRA-mandated registry of certified and otherwise eligible nursing assistants maintained by each state.⁹⁶

In at least one state, however, there is considerable disagreement over whether candidates should be allowed to take the test if they have not attended an accredited training program. In Florida, this practice is called "challenging the test," and it is relatively common. Challengers may be certified CNAs who have moved to Florida from another state, people in an approved program who want to take the test before completing the program, or people with related work experience who think they can pass without going through nursing assistant training. In many cases, however, they come from a fourth category: people who attended a training course that was held by one of the state's nursing facilities. Such courses are not approved by the state department of education, which oversees certification training in Florida.

Many managers of nursing facilities say they wouldn't have enough good candidates if they relied only on state-approved private schools to supply them. However, as Peacock (2000) noted, "There is substantial division on this issue. Those associated with approved training programs

⁹⁵ Personal communication.

⁹⁶ Personal communication.

view the challenge as a threat to the quality of care that CNAs provide (due to inadequate training)." ⁹⁷

7.9 Transferring Learning to the Work Site

"My vision is to be able to walk into work and see enough well-trained and experienced CNAs to finally give QUALITY CARE to our residents! The present conditions for most of us CNAs prevent us from ever being truly well trained! Why? ...[W]e have to skip many steps that should be done just so we can accomplish minimal standards of care! ... Even if we did take and pass all the courses offered us, most of it would be a wasted effort because we could never practice what we learned! Now if we were offered a raise or some sort of bonus for achieving advanced goals and skills? Why not? I would do it! But we don't.

"These courses would be taught where? At the facility? Cool, but what about working? Oh! On our days off, or we should come in early before work so we could take them? Ok, I will give up my valuable time for a few courses. What? We can't practice what we learned because we have not enough staff? What a surprise! What? Over half the people that showed up for class were pressed into work instead? Wow! What a surprise.... Good ideas are easy to come by. Good conditions to carry them out are very rare to come by."

As discussed in Section 7.5.2, the gap between what is taught in certification classes and what nursing assistants learn on the job can be wide. Due to a lack of effective orientation or supervision, newly minted nursing assistants are often left to bridge that gap as best they can. "I know a lot of NAs who feel competent but don't feel confident," says Genevieve Gipson. "They're always scared. I think part of what's going on is that they never get any effective feedback. They're never really sure they are doing things right."

7.9.1 Orientation

Orienting a new worker to the job takes time. "A good manager knows that an orientation period should last more than a few shifts," notes nursing assistant Patricia Green. "Orientation needs to cover everything from policies to who to call to what to do in an emergency." 100

In a paper describing the Pioneer Network's philosophy about relationships between residents and workers in nursing facilities, social worker Carter Catlett Williams wrote: "the orientation

⁹⁷ Brian Peacock Consulting Inc., January 2000.

⁹⁸ Message posted by CNA Richard J. Solka to the NursingAssistant@yahoogroups.com listserv.

⁹⁹ Personal communication.

Personal communication.

can be an opportunity to introduce the new staff member into a team which is characterized by mutual support, good communication and a sense of learning together." ¹⁰¹

New nursing assistants are not the only ones who need orientation. In Pennsylvania's recent study of nursing assistants, respondents pointed out that orientation "isn't just when you first start in this profession. It's anytime your situation or work environment changes. For example, if you are working in a nursing facility and you are going to move to another wing or hall, you should have an orientation period to get to know the residents, their needs, specific issues, and so on."

The need for this kind of apprenticeship is generally accepted for other healthcare workers. Nurses, for instance, work under close supervision for their first months on the floor and perform only limited duties at first. Yet nursing assistants are usually expected to assume a full patient load and a full set of duties from the start, and they are generally given little guidance.

Orientation in most facilities is restricted to new hires--and even for them, it ends quickly. In a study of nursing assistants by the Iowa CareGivers Association, most respondents said they had had three days of orientation, ¹⁰³ which all but two of the respondents agreed was not enough. Furthermore, orientation generally consisted simply of working alongside other nursing assistants who were not prepared — or inclined — to train new hires. "People doing the orientation just don't have the gumption, the interest they should have," said one respondent. "They just put you with whoever."

The people charged with orienting new hires often resent the time required of them, for which they rarely receive extra pay, and take out that resentment on the new worker. "Nursing has a tendency to eat their young," says researcher Joanne Rader. "A new aide can come in, wanting very much to do a good job, and not feel welcomed by the other aides, who immediately judge her as not being good enough, not knowing how to do it." 104

7.9.2 Supervision

Effective supervision is an important part of assuring good care. Regular monitoring and input from supervisors helps nursing assistants master and incorporate new procedures and identify and overcome barriers to quality. In the Iowa Caregivers Association nursing assistant poll, respondents noted that they stay at or leave their jobs because of the quality of their relationship with their direct supervisor. ¹⁰⁵

Carter Catlett Williams. Relationship The Heart of Life and Long Term Care. The Pioneer Network. March 2001

In their own words: Pennsylvania's frontline workers in long term care. (February 2001) A report to the Pennsylvania intra-governmental council on long term care (Harrisburg, Pennsylvania).

¹⁰³ Hill Simonton Bell 1999.

Personal communication.

Hill Simonton Bell 1999.

A pair of recent studies demonstrates that fact. When Burgio et al. (1994) taught nursing assistants a way of minimizing residents' urinary incontinence through prompted voiding, they built monitoring by specially trained nurse supervisors into the program, convinced that it was of central importance. The program had a positive effect on nursing assistant behavior and residents' continence rates, both of which were maintained over time, ¹⁰⁶ but there was no way of separating the effects of the training from those of the supervision. Stevens et al. (1998) then tested the same model in another nursing home. This time, nursing assistants on some units were monitored by trained supervisors, but those on other units were not. Both sets of nursing assistants performed better on certain job measures immediately after they underwent the skills training, but only those on the units with formal management maintained their improvements after four months. ¹⁰⁷

Effective supervision is an art, and few people can master it without training, practice, and supervision of their own skills. Nurse supervisors must correct behaviors and enforce good care without being punitive or harsh. At the same time, they must help nursing assistants manage the considerable physical and emotional demands of the job. Good supervisors model the development and maintenance of respectful relationships with staff and residents. They act as advocates for both nursing assistants and residents, helping CNAs solve problems while holding them responsible for maintaining high standards of care. As Williams (2001) put it: "For relationships between supervisor and CNAs to develop and thrive ... CNAs need to know that they *are* recognized, appreciated, cared about, understood, and that there is someone standing in union with them."

Yet most charge nurses receive no supervisory training, and many are uncomfortable in their role as supervisors. In a report on focus groups with 36 licensed nurses who work in nursing facilities, Schirm et al. (2000) found that their respondents "consistently expressed a dislike for their role as supervisors of nursing assistants and frequently stated they were ill prepared for these responsibilities." ¹⁰⁸

Cultural differences may add to the discomfort. Supervisors are often of a different ethnic group, class, and/or culture than the nursing assistants they supervise. Sometimes they do not even share a primary language. And in the hierarchical world of healthcare, a nurse's professional license and years of clinical and classroom training confers much greater status than a nursing assistant's certificate and 75 or so hours of training. These differences are often barriers to good

-

Burgio, L.D., McCormick, K., Scheve, A., et al (1994). The effects of changing prompted voiding schedules in the treatment of incontinence in nursing home residents. *Journal of the American Geriatrics Society*, 42: 315-320.

Stevens A., Burgio, L.D., Bailey, E, Burgio, K.L., Paul P., Capilouto E., Nicovich P. and Hale G. (June 1998). Teaching and maintaining behavior management skills with nursing assistants in a nursing home. *Gerontologist* 38(3): 379-384.

Schirm V., Albanese T, Garland T.N., Gipson G and Blackmon D (August 2000). Caregiving in nursing homes: Views of licensed nurses and nursing assistants. Clinical Nursing Research 9(3): 280-297.

communication and mutual understanding, and can cause nursing assistants to feel disrespected by their supervisors. ¹⁰⁹

In a poll question posted in July 2001, the moderator of the NursingAssistant@yahoogroups.com listserv asked members how nurses could show more respect towards CNAs. The following responses illustrate many of the ways in which nursing assistants often feel unappreciated, unfairly treated, or ignored by their supervisors:

- Call me by my name;
- Ask me about my concerns;
- Ask me for input into my assignments;
- Allow me and my peers to make out our own assignments;
- Check in with me during the shift;
- Enable me to attend care plan mtgs;
- Host staff/unit/shift meetings;
- Share important info with me;
- Ask for my input about residents;
- Listen to me when I am worried about residents:
- Help me with setting goals;
- Enable me to go to in-services and seminars;
- Advocate for my work;
- Stick up for me;
- Speak to me with respect and dignity;
- When I make a mistake, let me know right away, privately;
- Help me by answering call bells;
- Assist me with lifts;
- Assist with feeding, bathing;
- Help me when I am in conflict with others;
- Don't play favorites;
- Stay away from cliques;
- Hear all sides first, seek to get facts;
- Act on my concerns about resident health; and
- Assume role of team player vs. BOSS;

Some facilities have reacted to this cultural divide by relieving their nurses of many management duties, appointing a non-licensed unit or program manager to do such things as hire, train, evaluate, discipline and schedule nursing assistants. This leaves the nursing staff free to concentrate on clinical work and documentation, with nursing assistants reporting to them only for matters directly related to care.

¹⁰⁹ Tellis-Nayak and Tellis-Nayak 1989.

Other employers are implementing a coaching model of supervision. Coaching is a style of supervision that focuses on supporting the growth of workers, as opposed to the more traditional "discipline and punish" approach to addressing problems. In addressing job performance concerns, the coach has two roles: the first is to be clear and straightforward about the problem and its consequences; the second is to help the person being coached to reflect on her thinking and behavior, consider different perspectives or possibilities, and actively make decisions to ensure that the problem does not recur. For details, see the description of the Cooperative Healthcare Network in Section 7.16.2.

7.9.3 Organizational Support

Good supervision is important, but it is not enough to guarantee good care. Sheridan et al. (1992) surveyed 558 direct care workers in 25 nursing facilities, including 23 that passed state inspections within a year of the survey and two that failed to meet minimum standards. In looking for characteristics more common to the poorly rated facilities than the others, the only clear link they found was to organizational climate. The unsuccessful facilities were rated lowest in human relations, their administrative practices having been judged as showing less of an interest in the well being of their employees and doing less to improve staff relations. They were also judged highest on laissez-faire climate (failure by the administration to establish clear objectives, inadequate resource planning, and a lack of incentives for doing a good job) and status orientation (administrative practices that emphasize status difference and create conflicts between departments.) "Administrators cannot blame ineffective staff members or supervisors for poor care," the authors concluded. "Often the management system is the root cause of poor quality." "110

Smyer et al (1992) found that five one-and-one-half-hour classes on causes and management of problem behaviors in residents left a group of nursing assistants more knowledgeable but had no effect on their job performance, as rated by their supervisors. Calling their findings "sobering," the authors hypothesized that it was due to the fact that the facility did not adequately support the new way of doing things. They concluded that "administrative training and technical assistance support must be pursued at the same time that staff initiatives are undertaken. Without such administrative support we are unlikely to substantially affect the quality of care in nursing homes."

Robert Atchley's research has led him to a similar conclusion. "The greatest determinant of the quality and effectiveness of training are the attitudes top management have about training," he says. "Organizational values about the importance of front-line staff, inclusion of front-line

Sheridan John E., PhD., White John and Fairchild Thomas J., PhD. (1992) Ineffective staff, ineffective supervision, or ineffective administration? Why some nursing homes fail to provide adequate care. Gerontologist 32: 334-341.

Smyer M, Brannon D, Cohn M (June 1992). Improving nursing home care through training and job redesign. *Gerontologist* 32(3):327-33.

Personal communication.

staff in care planning, and ongoing training of front-line staff all have to be translated into management behavior rewarding those values or the organization will not show much effectiveness of training, no matter how well-designed the training program is."

7.10 Ongoing Education

In-service classes are the only form of continuing education nursing assistants are required to have, and the federal regulations regarding what they must consist of are brief. In-service education must be "sufficient to ensure the continuing competence of nurse aides." Most classes should be geared toward a nursing assistant's areas of weakness as determined in annual performance reviews, although some may address the special needs of a resident or group of residents.

The only specific federal requirement is that nursing assistants who work with the cognitively impaired must attend in-services on how to care for that population, and that all nursing assistants must attend 12 hours of classes a year. Some states require more than 12 hours. Many also mandate that certain subjects must be taught every year.

7.10.1 What's Taught

The verdict on in-service education is close to unanimous—and bleak. As the name implies, the training takes place in the facility, usually while attendees are on the job. Units usually last an hour or less, allowing little time for reflection, and the material is nearly always presented in the form of an uninspired lecture or videotape.

Despite OBRA's mandate that the content be tailored to a nursing assistant's areas of deficiency, few facilities have the resources to present more than a one-size-fits-all agenda, especially in states that require certain topics to be covered each year.

In a review of in-service instructional materials for dementia care, Kramer and Smith (May 2000) found 14 guides, all but four of which relied on the same teaching model. This model, wrote the authors, "could be characterized as having an 'expert' who is not a nursing assistant instruct persons who are nursing assistants in principles of dementia care. Implicit in this model is the idea that the students, i.e., nursing assistants, know relatively little about the topic under discussion and will profit most by listening to the instructor. Typically, a non-nursing professional presents information in a relatively didactic style of teaching, with occasional group discussions and periodic presentation of hypothetical cases to support and clarify points made in the lectures."

Most states require annual sessions on OSHA standards, residents' rights, and fire and safety procedures. Lifting techniques and skin care are also commonly taught. Another common

Federal Regulations, Title 42, Part 433, subpart B, section 483,75 (e)(8)(i, ii and iii).

type of in-service is held when a facility buys a complex piece of equipment such as a patient lift or a ventilator, and staff is convened to learn how to use it.

"Most employers cheap out on training; they use poor materials and poor trainers," says Robert Atchley. "Employers tend to see training as a waste of time and money and a regulatory pain in the neck instead of an opportunity. This sends a negative message to the trainees." 114

Furthermore, the people who develop in-service programs rarely ask nursing assistants what they want to learn. "There's a [false] sense that nursing assistants don't know what they need to know," notes Genevieve Gipson. 115

A "best practices" survey of nursing facilities in Pennsylvania, New York and Illinois uncovered some of the more specialized or advanced topics that may be covered in in-services. Respondents often taught in-services on pain management, joint and musculoskeletal problems, diabetic care, customer service survey etiquette, wound and pressure sore management, residents' rights, advanced nutrition and hydration, restorative care, improving documentation, and skin care. Also taught, though less often, were topics such as hospice care, cultural diversity, tender touch and sexuality. ¹¹⁶

7.10.2 Who Determines the Content

A few nursing facilities have a full-time or part-time employee devoted solely to staff education, but most nursing facilities cannot afford this, or are not willing to assume the expense, as the costs associated with a full-time trainer are not necessarily reimbursed through their Medicaid rate. As a result, most fold those responsibilities into the job of an administrative nurse--usually an already overburdened director of nursing or assistant director of nursing.

Because of the competing demands on their time, heads of in-service generally welcome offers from anyone willing to present a program, and it's generally left up to the volunteer to decide what and how to teach. Representatives of equipment or medical supply companies often conduct in-services, explaining general caregiving procedures along with tips about their products.

7.10.3 Connecting Ongoing Education to Experience on the Job

There is little evidence to prove whether in-services improve nursing assistants' skills and residents' quality of care. In one study, facility managers were asked whether their in-service programs had a positive effect on job retention and care delivery. While the overwhelming

¹¹⁴ Personal communication.

¹¹⁵ Personal communication.

Hegeman C. and Lambating F. (April 2000). Best practice survey of nursing home aide continuing education programs. Foundation for Long Term Care (Albany, NY).

majority said yes, more than 80 percent admitted that they based that belief on "impression or anecdotal information." Only a small minority had formal evaluations to back up their claims. 117

Meanwhile, nursing assistants and nursing assistant educators tend to be skeptical about the efficacy of in-service training. As noted in Section 7.10.1, in-services often fail to cover what attendees need to know.

Furthermore, the processes taught in in-services are not usually encouraged on the floor. "I think, for the most part, we teach [nursing assistants] right," says Acello. "But then they go back to the floor and do things the way they've always done them. They don't have time to do it the way we teach. In the real world, with staffing shortages the way they are, you've got to hustle." ¹¹⁸

Burgio and Burgio (1990) also concluded that follow-up was key after studying training methods in other healthcare settings in order to recommend a model for training nursing assistants in long-term care. Successful in-services, they concluded, included three things. First was "didactic instruction, presented both verbally and in a written format; modeling of the procedure by the trainer (either in-vivo or via videotape); role playing of the procedure by the trainee; and immediate performance feedback by the trainer." Second was "a checklist assessment of skill performance in an analogue situation," giving the trainer an opportunity to provide "immediate, corrective feedback and praise." The third step, which the researchers called "crucial though often overlooked," consisted of assessing the trainee's performance on the job. "These assessments should be conducted immediately following the in-service and at regular intervals thereafter," the researchers advised. "If staff perform poorly during these assessments, they should be required to attend remedial training sessions." ¹¹⁹

7.10.4 How Much In-service Education Nursing Assistants Get

Our sources were almost unanimous in agreeing that nursing assistants probably attend close to the mandated 12 hours a year. However, several experts question whether nursing assistants always get a full hour of in-service training for every hour logged, noting that students who train in nursing facilities are often called out of class to answer call lights or perform other duties, especially if the facility is short-staffed.

Hegeman and Lambating, April 2000.

¹¹⁸ Personal communication.

Burgio L.D. and Burgio K.L. (1990). Institutional staff training and management: A review of the literature and a model for geriatric, long-term-care facilities. International Journal of Aging and Human Development 30(4):287-302.

7.11 Who Pays for Education and Testing

7.11.1 OBRA Mandates

Federal law is clear on who should pay for the certification training required of nursing assistants who work in nursing facilities. According to federal regulations, students who are employed by a nursing facility or who have received an offer of employment from one when they begin taking classes may not be charged for "any portion of the program (including any fees for textbooks or other required course materials." In such cases, the nursing facility that employs or will employ the newly certified nursing assistant must pay for the classes. The state will then reimburse the facility for at least part of its costs. (For details, see Section 7.11.3.)

Some nursing assistants in training pay for their classes and course materials, having had no job or offer of employment at a nursing facility when they started class. The state must also reimburse the cost of training for these students, if they start work at or receive an offer of employment from a nursing facility within 12 months of becoming certified. In such cases, payment is to be made through the nursing facility that hires the new worker, which repays him or her and then applies for reimbursement from the state. Some states direct facilities to repay nursing assistants on a pro rata basis over the course of a year or less, until the full amount is paid off or the worker leaves the facility, whichever comes first. ¹²¹

Despite these mandates, however, nursing assistants who pay for their certification training and testing are not always repaid, even when they go to work for a nursing facility within a year of getting certified (for details, see Section 7.11.4)

7.11.2 The Cost of Initial Certification Education and Testing

The reported cost of certification and training varies widely. According to one decade-old study, the cost for both combined averaged \$1,859. A more recent study reported average training costs of \$1,604 for government-operated nursing facilities and \$1,066 at privately operated facilities. The government facilities tended to provide substantially more hours of training per student, which presumably explains the difference.

The considerable differences between these reported costs may be explained in part by the variation in state requirements (longer courses presumably cost more), where the classes were held (urban classes are probably more expensive than rural ones), and by variations in the formulas used to calculate costs. Other variations include whether the nursing facility pays the students for their time while learning and whether it pays a third party to provide the education.

Federal Regulations, Title 42, Part 483, subpart D, section 483.152 (c)(1).

Federal Regulations, Title 19, Section 1919(f)(2)(a)(iv); Title 18, Section 1819(f)(2)(a)iv; Title 42, Volume 3, Part 483, subpart D, section 483.152 (c).

¹²² Zahrt, Linda M. (April 1992) The cost of turnover in a home care agency. *Caring*.

Pennsylvania's Frontline Workers, February 2001.

7.11.3 The Cost to Nursing Facilities

Because nursing facilities employ so many nursing assistants and their turnover rate is usually high, the cost of educating new nursing assistants adds up fast. The annual cost of certification training for Pennsylvania's nursing facilities, for instance, is estimated to be more than \$21 million. Some facilities are disinclined to invest in training because many trainees leave soon after finishing training, some of them to work in home care or acute care after getting trained free of charge at a nursing facility.

The American Health Care Association, the largest trade association for long-term care providers, performed an informal canvass of its state affiliates for this chapter to ascertain the cost of certification training. The 19 state affiliates responding to AHCA's e-mailed questions reported average per-student costs as low as "between \$150 and \$500 depending on facility and class size" and as high as \$2,000, with the great majority ranging from \$400 to \$1,000. The higher reported costs were usually associated with licensed schools.

Depending on where they operate, nursing facilities may not be reimbursed the full cost of certification training. Training and competency evaluations are not included in a facility's daily Medicaid reimbursement rate for medical expenditures. Rather, they are considered part of the costs of administering the state's Medicaid program. Facilities pass their training and education expenses directly to Medicaid, which reimburses from the state's administrative cost center. Some states initially add training expenses to the per diem paid to the facility for medical expenses, but when the final cost settlement is made between the state and the facility, the facility passes costs for CNA training on to the state as an administrative expense.

States may impose "reasonable cost guidelines" based on the median cost of training reported by all facilities in the state, or by a pre-determined group of facilities. In such cases, facilities are paid in full for all eligible expenses up to a certain point, which is usually more than the median cost

States may impose other limits as well. In Oregon, for instance, facilities are reimbursed based on the percent of Medicaid clients served at the facility, so if 75 percent of its residents are Medicaid recipients, a facility will recover 75 percent of its allowable training costs. 126

7.11.4 The Cost to Nursing Assistants

Feedback from providers and nursing assistants indicates that relatively few nursing assistants pay in full for their education and training, although the percentages appear to be higher in some states than in others. ¹²⁷

_

Pennsylvania's Frontline Workers, February 2001.

Memo to Tom Burke from Janet A. Myder, Director Regulatory Systems. American Health Care Association (AHCA), July 24, 2001.

¹²⁶ AHCA memo, July 24, 2001.

Nursing assistants in need of certification education have three payment choices: pay in full at a private school, pay part of the cost in a subsidized program, or attend classes at the expense of a nursing home. Even those who initially shoulder the cost are often repaid.

An informal poll of members of the NursingAssistant@yahoogroups.com listserv conducted for this chapter illustrates some of the ways in which nursing assistant educations are subsidized. Over half of the respondents (six) attended classes free of charge at a nursing home. Four paid out of pocket, but half of these were heavily subsidized by scholarships or grants. One paid just \$75 for training, including the cost of textbooks, and another \$50 for testing; the other paid \$75 for training and can't remember what she paid for the test, indicating that its cost as not steep. Costs were substantially higher for the other two. One paid \$40 for a textbook and \$300 for training and testing; the other paid \$450 for training and testing. However, the former was reimbursed when he went to work for a nursing home, and the latter would have been reimbursed by the nursing facility that trained her if she had agreed to work there for at least six months (instead, she opted to work for a hospital).

Some training is subsidized by programs like the federal Workforce Investment Act (WIA), which distributes money to the states for job training. State-funded and other scholarships and grants help pay for nursing assistant training at community and vocational-technical colleges. However, WIA funds typically have not been available to train workers for jobs with such poor wages and benefits.

Although nursing facilities are supposed to reimburse the cost of training for new hires who were certified within the past year (see Section 7.11.1), anecdotal evidence indicates that compliance with this rule varies from facility to facility and possibly from state to state. Three of the key contacts interviewed for this chapter, who are each in regular contact with many nursing assistants nationwide and who live in three different states, all said that they had heard of numerous instances in which facilities did not comply. "Homes generally don't want to fiddle with the paperwork, so they usually pretend they don't know how," said nursing assistant educator Barbara Acello. Ohio-based nursing assistant educator Genevieve Gipson believes that reimbursing eligible new hires is the exception rather than the rule in her state. "It just doesn't happen," she said. Nursing assistant Patricia Green agreed, saying "Many places don't let CNAs know they can be reimbursed by the state."

7.11.5 Cost as a Barrier to Entry

The cost of the education is a barrier to some. As outlined above, some students must come up with hundreds of dollars for classes and textbooks — an unattainable sum for many people who live from one paycheck or public assistance check to the next. Even a relatively small amount, such as \$75 for a test, may be more than a mother struggling to feed her children can afford to spend.

¹²⁷ AHCA memo, July 24, 2001.

The cost of classes and materials is not the only barrier. People living at subsistence level and working two jobs or hurrying home after work to look after young children at home do not always have the time to attend classes unless they are paid for the time spent in training, and most nursing assistant certification classes do not pay students for their time.

Conflicting government policies are another impediment to entry for low-income would-be workers. As Dawson and Surpin (2001) point out: "state and federal employment agencies often preclude the long-term-care industry from participating in training support programs—on the basis that graduates of such programs cannot earn a livable wage as direct care workers." 128

The federal requirement that nursing assistants get specialized training also puts the job out of reach of many people who are trying to move from public assistance into the workforce. The 1996 law that restructured welfare includes "a presumption, often referred to as 'work first,' that discourages entry-level, skill-based training as a pathway to employment," the authors explain. That policy endorses "immediate attachment" to a job, which "discourages low-income women from gaining access to training as a pathway to healthcare work."

7.11.6 Continuing Education and Career Advancement Opportunities

Aside from the OBRA-mandated in-services provided by nursing facilities (see Section 7.10), continuing education for nursing assistants is hard to come by. Perhaps as a result, employers are rarely willing to pay to send nursing assistants to conferences. Nursing assistants are rarely able to shoulder the costs themselves, first because the cost of travel, a hotel room and meals is usually prohibitive and secondly because they must often take the time off without pay. However, a handful of conferences have recently begun to target or include nursing assistants, and a growing number of nursing assistants attend them every year.

The Career Nurse Assistants Program (CNAP)(see Section 7.16 for details) hosts a national nursing assistant leadership conference every fall in conjunction with NCCNHR's annual meeting, covering travel costs for some nursing assistants who couldn't otherwise afford to attend. The Direct Care Alliance (DCA), a national network of long-term care consumers, workers and concerned providers, dedicated to ensuring a stable, valued, well-trained direct care workforce, also includes nursing assistants as both participants and presenters in its twice-yearly meetings and conferences, raising funds to pay for their travel expenses. At both DCA's and CNAP's meetings, nursing assistants practice leadership development, learn and report about public policies affecting long-term care, and exchange information and insights with consumers, providers and workers from other states. The National Association of Geriatric Nursing Assistants (NAGNA), a professional association for nursing assistants, hosts an annual national convention. NAGNA pays travel expenses for the winner of an essay contest each year, but other attendees must cover their own costs. Several states have also held regional or statewide meetings.

-

Dawson, Steven L. and Surpin, Rick. (Spring 2001) Direct-care healthcare workers: You get what you pay for. *Generations* 25(1): 23-28.

At least two publications address nursing assistants' professional concerns as well. *Nursing Assistant Monthly*, an educational program produced by Frontline Publishing (www.frontlinepub.com), addresses the challenges faced by nursing assistants in themed monthly issues, pairing a newsletter for nursing assistants with instructional materials for nurse supervisors (see Section 7.16 for details). Participating nursing facilities pay to have the newsletters sent to all their nursing assistants. *CNA Today*, launched by NAGNA in the summer of 2001, is a quarterly magazine that costs \$25 a year for NAGNA members and \$35 a year for nonmembers (www.nagna.org).

For the most part, nursing assistants who want to further their educations must do so at their own expense or find free sources of information. For the small but steadily growing number with regular access to the Internet, a handful of websites and e-mail listservs for nursing assistants¹²⁹ can provide a good starting point. As nursing assistant Melissa Lothrop recently wrote to the NursingAssistant listserv: "Recently, I got a computer and found this website, just by looking for information in my field... I've learned of magazines and articles and the way the rest of the country works in my field."

7.12 What's Often Missing in Preparing Nursing Assistants for the Job

"We should raise the bar for CNAs regarding training and orientation. For years now we have complied with the regulations, but at the same time lowered our expectations. This has been done because of our immediate and critical need for nursing assistants. There is an urgency to get them 'trained' and through class (usually 75 hours of classroom/instructor) so they can be utilized on the floor. However, because it is such a rushed situation, sometimes there is not a thorough comprehension, there is not mastery of skills... Often orientation in a facility is the same as training: rushed, hurried, unorganized, and chaotic. Many times it is not the best CNA trainer who is doing the orientation." 131

These include NursingAssistant@yahoogroups.com, http://www.directcareclearinghouse.org, http://www.homestead.com/nurseassistant/Home.html, http://www.na-network.org, http://www.nagna.org.

Response to a question from nursing assistant Connie Trendel, who was writing an article for *CNA Today* magazine about nursing assistants taking responsibility for their own educations.

Personal communication with Lisa Cantrell, RN, C, co-founder and president of the National Association of Geriatric Nursing Assistants (NAGNA).

7.12.1 Recruiting the Right People

Facilities that hire the wrong person cannot erase the mistake with any amount of training. Nobody wants to make that mistake, yet it appears to happen frequently. In a study of nursing assistants who are active registrants in North Carolina's nurse aide registry, Konrad (2001) found that "less than half of the 180,000 North Carolinians trained to work as nursing assistants during the last decade are currently certified to work as a nurse aide. Even among those who are certified, many seem to work only part-time as a nurse aide and supplement this income with earnings from other unrelated jobs in low wage industries. Those who used to be certified as CNAs have mostly left the [long term care] field and appear to have more stable jobs at higher wages in other industries." 132

A similar probe by the Florida Education and Training Placement Information Program showed that only 53 percent of the people who had joined the state's CNA registry in the year beginning July 1, 1997, were working in a health-related field up to a year later. ¹³³

To reduce its approximately 100 percent annual turnover rate among nursing assistants, the Lovington Good Samaritan Center in Lovington, New Mexico, instituted a new hiring and recognition program in March 1997. While the program also includes awards and financial incentives, its core philosophy is "Hire for character and train for skills," and it revolves around a hiring policy in which the employer looks for people who exhibit certain character traits. The facility reports that the program improved staff morale, lowered turnover among CNAs (the rate was 14 percent lower in the first quarter of 1998 than in the first quarter of 1997), saved the facility a considerable sum in sick time, overtime and hiring costs (those costs totaled \$14,600 less in the first quarter of 1998 than in the same quarter the previous year).

7.12.2 What Keeps Candidates Out of Certification Classes

Literacy Skills

With shortages of frontline workers already severe and growing in most parts of the country, ¹³⁵ facilities can ill afford to discourage qualified candidates. Yet some interested candidates who would be good at the job simply can't pass the certification test.

In the late 1980s and early '90s, as long term care geared up to implement the certification training and testing mandated by OBRA '87, a number of seasoned nursing assistants feared they

Konrad, T R (2001). Where have all the nurse aides gone? North Carolina Institute on Aging.

Brian Peacock Consulting Inc., January 2000.

Brian Peacock Consulting Inc., January 2000.

Paraprofessional Healthcare Institute (January 2001). Direct-care health workers: The unnecessary crisis in long-term care. The Aspen Institute Domestic Strategy Group, Washington, DC.

would be unable to pass the test. As nursing assistant educator W.H.Heaton reported at the time, "The majority fear taking a written examination because of their inexperience in test-taking." ¹³⁶

Apparently, those fears were well founded. Heaton tested about 150 nursing assistants on 100 items that would be covered in the federally mandated curriculum. The subjects were experienced nursing assistants in good standing, averaging eight years on the job. Yet only 10 (6.7 percent) passed the test, and their average score was 58 percent.

The nursing assistants, noted Heaton, did best on "areas that are taught most often in a facility's in-service training programs—skin care, intake and output, care plans, psychological aspects of dying and restraints." This indicated, he said, that part of the problem was lack of knowledge, and that more education in specific areas was needed. But for the most part, Heaton believed, the nursing assistants knew what to do on the job; they just didn't know how to pass written tests. "The majority of those tested have been away from the academic environment for several years and are not familiar with how tests are now administered," he wrote. "Many indicated that they had a problem with reading comprehension. They simply did not understand the questions. This is not because the questions are difficult, but because the terminology used in formulating the questions is foreign to them."

Literacy standards may have been too low for nursing assistants before OBRA. Illiteracy can compromise care quality, as some competency in both written and spoken English are needed in order to communicate about complex care needs, chart work done and observations made, and to read and comprehend written instructions. For example, if employees do not understand instructions well enough to learn why it is important they do a specific activity in a certain way — such as place used sharp objects in a "sharps disposal box"—then quality could be compromised. Lack of fluency in English can also create a barrier in communicating with residents, unless most of the residents in the facility speak the nursing assistant's primary language.

However, Heaton's findings indicate that current educational and testing requirements eliminate many people who would make good nursing assistants if their language skills could be brought up to speed. For many, the solution would be a graduate equivalency degree (GED) or an English as a second language (ESL) classes, but prospective students generally find these difficult to find, pay for, and graduate from.

Some nursing assistants manage to get certified, learning enough in class to pass the oral exam, and then access ESL classes through their employers. While the researchers for this chapter were unable to investigate the prevalence of such programs, discussions with key contacts uncovered a few. At Providence Mount St. Vincent, for instance, supervisors at the Seattle nursing facility noticed that many of their nursing assistants were neither fluent in English nor proficient in reading and writing in their own language. In response, the facility

-

Heaton WH. (March 1989) Examining nurse aide competency evaluations. *Contemporary Long Term Care*. 12(4):23-4, 38.

began to use pictorial presentations on some instruction sheets, and to offer ESL training throughout the year to all interested employees. ¹³⁷ (For details on Providence Mount St. Vincent's training programs, see Section 7.16.)

Other Hurdles

Retaining newly trained employees requires employers to devote serious attention and resources to employee supports. Nursing assistant work often entails off-hour employment, sometimes in more than one site. Therefore, community services such as evening or overnight childcare and transportation must be arranged, most likely through community-based services.

As noted in Section 7.4, most nursing assistants are low-income women. Some straddle the worlds of welfare benefits and health care employment, leaving welfare for work but cycling back to public assistance as soon as the next family crisis hits. Others receive cash, food stamps, and other forms of public assistance even while employed as direct-care workers, because their jobs offered only poverty-level income. Still others lack basic job skills and need education in the importance of showing up on time, dressing professionally, and so on.

A recent report aimed at helping state and local governments transition welfare recipients into the workforce¹³⁸ outlined the following common barriers to employment:

- substance abuse,
- domestic violence,
- physical disabilities and chronic health problems,
- depression and other mental health problems,
- criminal records,
- very low basic skills and learning disabilities, and
- language barriers.

The author estimates that between a quarter and a half of the people currently on welfare probably face at least one of these barriers, some of which — e.g., substance abuse, certain types of criminal records, and certain physical disabilities — would disqualify them from work as a nursing assistant. But, with enough desire and effort on the part of the employer and employee and with help from government programs, most of these barriers could be surmounted.

Government programs would have to go farther than usual, the author notes, providing "additional support services, beyond those traditionally provided by welfare-to-work programs (such as child care and transportation), These include mental health counseling, shelter for victims of domestic violence, and substance abuse treatment." Employers must also be prepared to make extra provisions, as "[t]he path from welfare to work is not linear. Some problems must

Personal communication with Charlene Boyd, Providence Mount St. Vincent administrator.

Brown, Amy (April 2001). Beyond work first: How to help hard-to-employ individuals get jobs and succeed in the workforce. Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation.

be addressed before individuals begin work, others can be addressed while they are working, and still others may not even emerge until after they have begun to work."

Employers in the Cooperative Healthcare Network, who frequently hire women who are entering or re-entering the workforce after being on public assistance, have found certain approaches effective in helping new employees make the adjustment. For details, see "Easing the transition to work."

Easing the transition to work

Cooperative Healthcare Network employers use these strategies to help trainees and new employees transition into the workforce.

- Full-time counselors help employees access community supports such as transportation, childcare, children's health insurance, or housing assistance.
- A structured support system responds to employee needs systematically with assistance such as a credit counselor or a small loan fund managed by a committee of employees.
- A "coaching" model of management emphasizes problem solving over disciplinary actions.
- Training is tailored to the individual employee and designed to strengthen the candidate's critical thinking, problem solving and communication abilities, to prepare the trainee for both the content and the performance expectations she will find when she begins work.
- High standards of work performance and professional behavior are rigorously enforced.

7.12.3 What's Missing from Certification Training and In-services

In general, most nursing assistants and nursing assistant educators agree on a few key points. Certification education should last for more than 75 hours and should include a significant clinical component (see Section 7.9.1). In-services should be less repetitive and more tailored to the needs of individual residents and staff members, with more advanced topics covered for the more experienced workers (see Section 7.10.2). As one group of nursing assistants observed, "Deficiency driven [in-service] training is the rule at present, rather than development of knowledge and skills that can prevent deficiencies." 140

_

Paraprofessional Healthcare Institute (1997). Welfare to work: An employers' dispatch from the front by the Cooperative Health Care Network. Bronx, New York.

¹⁴⁰ NCCNHR 1988.

As to specifics, every topic listed below is covered well by some facilities or schools, as programs vary widely. Overall, however, these areas tend to be either absent or underdeveloped in educational programs for nursing assistants.

7.12.4 Orientation and Supervision

Good supervision and orientation help reinforce learning from the classroom and model the values of the organization. The CNA develops a positive relationship with her supervisor, which becomes an important model for relationship building with residents and other staff in the facility. Conversely, not getting along with a supervisor is one of the main concerns nursing assistants cite about their jobs. ¹⁴¹

Orientation introduces the new CNA to the culture and relationship environment in the facility. It is through this introduction she learns the values of the facility: how staff treat each other and residents and family members, how to work in teams, whether relationship building is important. As Williams (2001) wrote: "We need to fuel each other with the positive energy of regard for the other person. If CNAs do not have that from supervisors and fellow workers, what do they have to give to residents?"

Yet nursing assistants all too often must do without effective, well-organized orientation or supervision (see Sections 7.9.1 and 7.9.2).

7.12.5 Problem Solving and Critical Thinking

Despite the title, nursing assistants are not just assistants to nurses. In fact, some facilities, such as Seattle's Providence Mount St. Vincent, call their CNAs resident assistants in an effort to emphasize the fact that their role is to help the residents, not the nurses.

Among the many dilemmas nursing assistants face are the following:

- Seeing peers do things they were taught not to do in training;
- Residents responding unfavorably to care, although it is delivered the way they were taught to;
- Peers not responding to requests for help;
- Interacting with a supervisor who you feel is treating you unfairly;
- Handling a resident emergency;
- Being asked by a nurse to do something outside the job description, i.e., give a medication or administer a treatment;
- Being offered money by a family or resident to take special care of them; and
- Being unfairly accused of abuse.

¹⁴¹ Iowa Caregivers Association, December 2000.

Yet training for nursing assistants rarely prepares them for the psychological challenges they will face.

As Hoffman (1995) points out, "nursing assistants, who often are referred to as 'unskilled staff,' are put in situations that require unusually sophisticated interpersonal and communication skills. They are called upon to manage conflict, set limits, make ethical decisions, grieve and help others to grieve, and support other members of the caregiving team. There is little in their training that addresses such complex psychosocial problems."142

Communicating with Residents and Families 7.12.6

For most nursing assistants, relationships with residents and their family members are their greatest source of job satisfaction. But those same relationships are also one of the greatest sources of frustration for most nursing assistants. "Frontline workers must deal with difficult or abusive residents or unhappy families at the same time they respectfully change a resident's clothes or give a bath," notes one report. "More emphasis on handling the interpersonal aspects of care could help employees maximize what they view as the best part of their job relationships with residents and clients." ¹⁴³

As Karl Pillemer has documented, lack of preparation can lead to resident abuse. "Work in a nursing home requires interpersonal skills and understanding of psychosocial issues, but staff often do not have the skills to handle the interpersonal aspects of care," he wrote in a book on how to reduce abusive incidents. "To give an example, a nursing assistant may know all of the technical procedures for giving a resident a bath. But what does she do when the resident cries in fear of the shower, or begs to be left in bed, or cries out for her long-dead mother, or strikes out at the nursing assistant while being washed? It is in these kinds of situations where the risk of inappropriate actions and abuse goes up."¹⁴⁴

Such situations are common. "Our studies revealed surprisingly high levels of staff-resident conflict," noted Pillemer in the same book. "For example, the majority of staff reported that they had conflicts at least several times a week over residents' unwillingness to eat, residents' personal hygiene, unwillingness to dress, toileting, and other issues. Many staff reported such conflicts every day. It is fair to say that few other occupations involve such a high degree of interpersonal conflict." Yet classes rarely cover ways of handling such delicate situations. "In most facilities, no such training is ever provided, and how to deal with conflict is not even discussed," Pillemer noted.

Hoffman, Richard. (November 1995) Training nursing assistants translates into better care. Brown University Long-Term Care Quality Letter, 7(21): 6.

Straker and Atchley 1999.

Pillemer Karl, Menio Diane A. and Keller Beth Hudson. Abuse-proofing your facility: A practical guide for preventing abuse in long-term care facilities (2001). Frontline Publishing (Somerville, MA).

Part of the problem is that many residents can't communicate through the usual channels. Nursing assistants must learn "how to listen to nonverbal communications, how to talk with the person with hearing deficits, sight deficits, memory deficits, problems of orientation, etc.," points out Genevieve Gipson. ¹⁴⁵

Nursing assistants also feel the need to communicate better with residents' families. In a roundtable discussion in South Carolina, one participant "told of how a training video on how families deal with grief helped her to better understand the differences between family members of nursing home residents, and increased her tolerance." And nursing assistants canvassed by Anna Ortigara and her colleagues when they were developing a career ladder program (see section 7.15 for details), talked "a lot about needing better communications skills—with each other, with supervisors and with residents' families," says Ortigara.

7.12.7 Communicating with Supervisors

As discussed in Section 7.9.2, differences in ethnicity, class, cultural values and professional status often prevent nursing assistants and supervisors from communicating effectively. Nurse supervisors need to improve their management skills, but nursing assistants would also benefit from learning more effective ways of communicating.

While conducting focus groups with nursing assistants, Anna Ortigara and her colleagues had an unusual reaction to the usual complaints that they heard about nurses. In order to be taken seriously as members of the clinical team, the researchers decided, nursing assistants must learn how to talk to licensed nurses in their own language. As a result, they added a module to the career ladder classes they were developing (see Section 7.16 for details), covering common changes in residents' conditions and the clinical terms nurses and physicians use to describe them.

The nursing assistants attending the pilot program reacted enthusiastically to that module, said Ortigara, because the knowledge they gained allowed them to communicate more effectively with their nurse supervisors. "Language separates people," noted Ortigara. "When someone is using terms and someone else doesn't know them, the person who doesn't know them becomes the 'them '"¹⁴⁷

7.12.8 Managing Stress

Both on the job and in their personal lives, most nursing assistants contend with a great deal of stress. In one study, nursing assistants listed several non-job-related stressors, including financial

Personal communication.

Painter, William and Kennedy, Beth (Autumn 1999). The evolving role of certified nursing assistants in long term care facilities. Part One: Highlights of nursing home CNA roundtables on career issues for frontline staff. *The Director* 7(4): 142, 146-147.

Personal communication.

worries (54 percent said they "worry about all the money I owe" and 49.6 percent "do not have enough money to cover medical and dental care"), family worries (35.7 percent agreed with the statement "I worry about my family when I'm at work"), and personal health and well-being (22.8 percent agreed that their physical health had declined since they began working as a nursing assistant). ¹⁴⁸

Job-related sources of stress included scheduling problems (68.9 percent had been asked to come in early or stay late, and 52.4 percent to come in on a day off), not having been prepared for the reality of the job in initial training (57.6 percent), and problems with a supervisor (49.3 percent agreed with the statement "My supervisor acts better than me," 41.4 percent with "My supervisor talks down to me," and 31.8 percent with "My supervisor ignores my input in developing resident care plans.")

Emotional attachments formed with residents can also cause stress. Nursing assistants often worry about residents who are declining physically or mentally, or who they feel are not receiving proper care. The deaths that are so much a part of life in long-term care also take a heavy toll. In focus groups with 22 nurses in Ohio, one respondent noted that "training needs to prepare nurse assistants to handle the emotional aspects of death." ¹⁴⁹ In a support group demonstration project, participating CNAs mentioned several factors that contributed to their stress, including the deaths of favorite residents. In the midst of their grief, they noted, they have the added stress of adjusting to a new resident in the bed of the resident who had just died. ¹⁵⁰

7.12.9 Managing a Difficult Workload

As outlined above, nursing assistants navigate a heavy schedule of daily duties while responding to a barrage of requests and demands, many of them urgent. Prioritizing tasks is, therefore, a crucial skill.

Nursing assistants are rarely taught how to do this. Yet requiring newly hired nursing assistants to develop time management skills on their own or to flounder without them contributes to the high turnover rate among CNAs—and to inadequate care (see Section 7.5.2).

The experiences of providers like those in the Cooperative Healthcare Network indicate that peer mentoring, an effective orientation program, and a coaching method of supervision can help new CNAs learn how to manage and prioritize workloads (see Section 7.16 for details).

_

Noelker, Linda S. What can be done to improve the nursing assistant's job? Section 3: Working conditions, job redesign, and career ladders for paraprofessionals. Benjamin Rose Institute (Cleveland, Ohio).

Gipson, Genevieve, Albanese, Teresa, Blackmon, Dorothy, Garland, T. Neal, Schirm, Victoria, and Falter, Julie. (September 1997) An empirical comparison of definitions of quality care held by licensed nurses and nursing assistants employed in long-term care in Ohio: Final report.

Wilner and Shenkman (1993).

Bowers and Becker (1992) studied three facilities with above-average turnover rates, comparing nursing assistants who stayed past the first few weeks on the job with those who left. Workloads in all three facilities were so heavy, they noted, that "[c]utting corners was necessary to survive as a nurse's aide, it seemed." ¹⁵¹

Those who stayed, the researchers found, found ways to juggle countless competing demands. That often meant instituting taking shortcuts that "could be done extensively without being discovered." It also meant instituting relatively rigid routines. Those who left were either unable or unwilling to fall into such a routine. Instead, they "tended to respond to each summons [from a resident] as it arose."

Both methods ultimately proved unresponsive to residents' individual needs. Residents abandoned by nursing assistants who tried to respond to requests as they arose "could often be found half bathed, half fed, or sitting on a toilet waiting to be taken back to bed," while residents cared for by nursing assistants with better time management skills "were effectively prevented from altering their usual schedule."

Bowers and Becker noted that nursing assistants "may simply be caught in an impossible situation." However, they concluded, "The findings from this study indicate that nurse's aide orientation programs could be more effective if they incorporated open discussion of how to organize the work."

7.12.10 Clinical Skills and the Nursing Process

Personal care and clinical skills such as taking blood pressure readings and giving baths are the core of a nursing assistant's education. Even so, some crucial areas tend to be overlooked.

Nursing assistants often express a desire to learn more about how to work with people who have dementia or other types of disabilities. Participants in the Iowa Caregivers' Association's focus group, for instance, cited a need for more education about Alzheimer's, "resident behaviors, especially those due to dementia," diabetic care, and "mental health and the elderly." One respondent noted: "I don't think people understand the different types of dementia. They need to be explained better so people are better prepared for what they're going to deal with. You get a new CNA that's never worked in a nursing home and they're going to get bit the first night or hit or kicked or sworn at, and they don't know how to react. It can end up in a bad situation." 152

Nursing assistant educators also see gaps in teaching. Barbara Acello thinks CPR should be part of all certification classes, along with material on how to recognize and treat pain. She'd like to see in-services cover "a great deal more about disease processes and observations, particularly

Bowers and Becker 1992.

¹⁵² Hill Simonton Bell 1999.

those suggesting the client is acutely ill" and "a great deal more about [pressure ulcers] and contractures" "153

But clinical information alone is not enough. Nursing assistants are generally taught how to perform certain tasks without being told how their work fits into the goals set by nurses, physical therapists, physicians and other clinicians. Other members of the "caregiving team" are quick to issue orders to nursing assistants, but generally slow to solicit their input into care planning or patient evaluations. As a result, these supposed teammates rarely share information freely, and may develop very different ideas about how a patient is doing or what kind of treatment he or she needs.

This can create conflict. It can also endanger patient care, allowing crucial information about residents' needs or changes in their conditions to fall through the cracks. Noting that nursing assistants were generally the first members of a nursing facility's staff to notice signs of acute illness in residents but that their observations often were not conveyed to nurses or other clinicians who could act on them effectively, Boockvar (2000) devised a measurement instrument to allow nursing assistants to enter their observations into the patient care record. In testing the instrument, he found that nursing assistants recorded signs of acute illnesses an average of five days before any such sign was recorded in the patient's chart. ¹⁵⁴ The reason for the delay, Boockvar surmised, is that most nursing facilities provide no standardized route for that kind of information to travel along from CNAs to nurses or other clinicians. "[I]n most nursing homes nursing assistants communicate their observations to medical staff only informally," he noted.

7.12.11 Leadership Skills and Working with Peers

The teamwork that can help or hinder patient care is not limited to communication between nursing assistants and other caregivers. Nursing assistants can support or undermine each other in countless ways. They may try to help coworkers who need to do a two-person lift or remain perpetually unavailable, answer a call bell for a coworker engaged in a time-consuming task or attend only to their assigned residents, share ideas and offer emotional support with their coworkers or criticize and gossip about them. Cooperation is also needed between shifts, as people share information about how a resident is doing or coordinate such things as meals and baths.

When nursing assistants work well together, stress is reduced for nursing assistants and quality of life and of care are improved for residents, yet leadership and teamwork are almost never addressed in class.

¹⁵³ Personal communication.

^{1.}

Boockvar, Kenneth MD, MS, Brodin, H Daniel MD, Lachs, Mark MD MPH (September 2000). Nursing assistants detect behavior changes in nursing home residents that precede acute illness: Development and validation of an illness warning instrument. *Journal of the American Geriatrics Society*48(9): 1086-1091.

7.12.12 Cross-cultural Communication and Competence

Nursing assistants often work with peers or supervisors who come from very different cultural, ethnic, religious or class backgrounds. Wilner and Shenkman (1993), for instance, found that English was not the first spoken language of about one-third of the CNAs in their study of 32 nursing facilities in eastern Massachusetts. The nursing assistants came from Central and South America, Europe, Asia, and Africa. In some of the facilities, as many as six or seven different languages were spoken. Language differences existed not only among nursing assistants but also between CNAs and residents and between CNAs and supervisors.

The participants in that study had a biweekly support group in which to get to know one another, ask about each other's cultures, and gain respect and compassion for each other. Other such programs presumably exist, but this chapter's research team did not discover any. Differences can lead to trouble if they are not openly acknowledged and explored. Nursing assistants from countries where elderly people are highly respected and nearly always cared for at home by family members, for instance, may disapprove of American families who trust their loved ones to nursing homes.

Bonder, Martin and Miracle (2001) noted that it is not clear whether nursing assistants can be taught to be more open-minded, as "research findings are equivocal about whether educational programs can actually alter attitudes or, more important, behavior to any significant extent (Pruegger and Rogers, 1994)." Yet, the authors contend, healthcare workers "must be culturally competent to respond adequately to the needs of each client." That means learning such things as how to interpret signals such as expressions of pain, which vary greatly across cultures, looking for clues in people's body language and tone of voice, and asking their clients to help them understand their value systems, desires, and needs.

7.12.13 Compassion

We are not used to teaching about "soft" matters such as caring in class, particularly in a clinical setting. Yet compassion is clearly one of the most important traits a nursing assistant can have (see Section 7.3.2). As a result, some think that empathy training should be part of the certification curriculum.

After conducting focus groups with licensed nurses and nursing assistants to discuss the factors that facilitate or interfere with the delivery of quality care, researchers Dorothy J. Blackmon and colleagues concluded: "it would seem reasonable to place strong emphasis on how to be a caring person in training programs for nurse assistants. This may be difficult to do effectively, as many of the respondents in this study felt being a caring person is a characteristic one is born with — a

Appropriateness of Minimum Nurse Staffing Ratios in Nursing Homes
Phase II Final Report, December 2001

Bonder B, Martin L, and Miracle A (Spring 2001) Achieving cultural competence: The challenge for clients and healthcare workers in a multicultural society. *Generations* 25(1): 35-42.

'gift,' so to speak." ¹⁵⁶ But the "gift" of caring for one's elders, the researchers believed, was developed through experiences such as "participating in church activities with elders and in their neighborhood communities, as well as by sharing living quarters and life experiences with older family members." As those experiences become less common, they may need to be replaced by formal training in sensitivity to the special needs of older people.

Dillon and Stines (1996) interviewed 130 LPN and nursing assistant students to ask whether they thought caring could be taught, and if so, how. The answer to the first question was affirmative. As to the second, the students agreed that a caring style of teaching and management can foster a caring attitude in a nurse or nursing assistant. "Both LPN and nurses' aide students saw an attitude of respect for the learner as a unique individual to be a critical prerequisite for an atmosphere of caring," the authors noted. "Faculty sharing and giving of self is exemplified by such issues as time, remembering the little things, and listening.... Listening attentively and non-judgmentally allows the student to speak freely and think creatively. Ultimately, it is hypothesized that the student who is educated in this humanistic environment has the potential to carry this attitude to his/her practice." ¹⁵⁷

7.13 Career Advancement Linked to Specialized and/or In-depth Knowledge

As Genevieve Gipson and others have pointed out, a great many nursing assistants see their work as a career (see Section 7.4.1). But to many, it is a dead-end job. Because the work done by nursing assistants is generally perceived as unskilled, it is rare for a nursing assistant's specialized knowledge or experience to be recognized by a significant increase in pay. On the contrary, as staffing shortages make it necessary for employers to offer more to attract frontline workers, some new hires are paid more than their veteran coworkers. Even temporary workers, who bring with them no knowledge of a home's culture and philosophy, let alone of its individual residents, are usually paid far more than long-time stayers. Veterans are often asked to take on extra duties such as mentoring and orienting new staff, but given no extra pay or change in title.

In recent years there has been considerable talk among long term care professionals about how to counteract this demoralizing state of affairs and give dedicated nursing assistants a greater incentive to stay. Some nursing facilities offer tuition reimbursement and other incentives for nursing assistants who want to become licensed nurses. While such programs are commendable and may help facilities retain valued employees who want to try something new, they are of no

-

Blackmon D.J., Garland N, Oyabu-Mathis N and Gipson G (April 1994). Changes in knowledge of care techniques among nurse assistants in a training program: Achievements and failures. Paper presented at the Ohio Network of Educational Consultants in the Field of Aging, King's Island, Ohio.

Dillon RS and Stines PW (March 1996). A phenomenological study of faculty-student caring interactions. Journal of Nursing Education 35(3) 113-118.

¹⁵⁸ Personal communications with members of the <u>NursingAssistant@yahoogroups.com</u> listserv.

help to the many people who prefer the hands-on care and contact with residents that they get as nursing assistants but want more responsibility, pay, or both in recognition of special knowledge or skills.

To give those people more incentive to stay on the job, and to make better use of their abilities and experience, a growing number of facilities are instituting career ladder programs for nursing assistants. These are sometimes called career paths or career lattices, to distinguish them from the type of career ladder that leads to becoming licensed as an LVN, LPN or RN.

7.13.1 How Career Ladders Work for Nursing Assistants

An article outlining a proposed Red Cross career ladder program summed up the philosophy behind it as follows: "Career ladders increase a CNA's self esteem on the job by rewarding them [sic] for work well done and providing opportunities to develop both technical and personal skill."

A career ladder is any set of clearly defined steps that allow workers to qualify for more skilled work, usually through education or training. Raises in pay and/or specialized titles are usually associated with each rung of the ladder.

Career ladders for nursing assistants take many different forms, but they generally fall into one of two broad categories. Nursing assistants may advance by gaining specialized clinical skills, taking classes and passing a test to develop expertise in an area such as restorative care or geriatric care, or they may develop leadership skills, studying such things as adult learning style and effective communication skills and often gaining the title of preceptor or mentor.

Some career ladders include rungs for any nursing assistant who stays on the job for a year or two and performs satisfactory work. The model suggested by the Red Cross, for instance, starts with a CNA level 1, open to all new CNAs who pass the certification exam, complete the facility's orientation, are certified in CPR, and "prove skills validations by passing a skills exam or proving their skills ability during their orientation." Even level 2 requires only that a nursing assistant have at least two years' experience, including one year of continuous employment with the facility, "a good performance evaluation and work attendance," and "good attendance at inservice meetings." ¹⁶⁰

Other programs are designed to reward only more specialized skills and knowledge. For an example, see the descriptions of the LEAP program and Apple Health Care's career ladder in Section 7.16.

_

Simpson, A. (1998) American Red Cross chapter creates CNA development program. *Insight*, 7(2).

¹⁶⁰ Simpson, 1998.

7.13.2 Who has Access to Career Ladder Programs

As recently as a decade ago, career ladders for nursing assistants were virtually unheard of. When employees of the Masonic Geriatric Healthcare Center in Wallingford, Connecticut, decided to implement one in the late 1980s, they did a search for information on similar programs and found only two.¹⁶¹

The concept has become more widely accepted since then, but most facilities don't offer them yet. "When I go to facilities and do presentations and ask, most people don't have a career advancement program," says researcher Joanne Rader. She thinks that's a mistake she adds, "since many aides think it's a dead-end job." In Pennsylvania's recent report on frontline workers, only 0.5 percent of respondents said they had implemented a career ladder. 162

7.14 Examples from the Field

7.14.1 Site Visits

Visits to nurse aide training programs in the Baltimore, Boston and Philadelphia areas were conducted to complement information obtained from the literature review and interviews with key industry contacts. A variety of training programs were sought out, including ones sponsored by the American Red Cross (ARC), community colleges, unions, hospitals, nursing facilities and private organizations. The Baltimore, Boston and Philadelphia areas were selected for ease of travel for the research team (based in Baltimore and Boston). At the training programs, administrators and instructors were interviewed as available, regarding the following: structure of the program; curriculum content; teaching methods; materials; costs; and instructor qualifications. Nurse aides in training were interviewed to gain information on educational background, previous work experience, reasons for enrollment and confidence in the program's ability to adequately prepare them for certification. Researchers observed classes in progress to better understand teaching methods, the student population and the learning environment.

Also as part of this task, directors of nursing and staff education coordinators from a sample of nursing facilities were interviewed to determine their experiences with training, hiring and orienting newly certified nursing assistants. Nursing assistants who had completed their training and certification testing within the past 12 months were sought out and interviewed for information on their preparation and initial work experience.

To accomplish the above tasks, two interview forms were devised. One contained questions to be used with training site staff and students and the other for use with directors of nursing and nursing assistants. The interview forms were shared with key industry contacts and revised based on their input (see Appendix E-1 for copies of the interviews).

Polio, J.D. (1997) Implementing a career ladder program for the geriatric nursing assistant. *Insight*, 6(3).

Pennsylvania's Frontline Workers, February 2001.

7.14.2 Description of Programs Visited

Researchers identified nursing assistant training programs sponsored by the groups identified above and planned to visit ten different programs. Most training programs approached were willing to participate in the interviews, but scheduling during the summer months was difficult. Additional scheduling problems were encountered when nursing facilities were contacted for interviews. Another difficulty for nursing facilities was that their participation required the identification of nursing assistants who had been trained and certified during the previous twelve months, determining their work schedule and coordinating with the researcher's planned visit. Researchers visited nursing facilities on multiple days and times to interview the nursing assistants on their scheduled shift(s), so as to minimize any data collection burden. Researchers were unable to identify any nursing facilities that were currently providing training programs. Although some were certified by their state agencies as qualified to train nursing assistants, DONs explained that there was not a significant number of persons interested in training and that to run classes for a small number was not cost effective. Although a privately sponsored program was identified, researchers were unable to coordinate with the program administrator to schedule interviews.

The following types of nurse aide training sites were visited:

- American Red Cross training programs (2);
- Community college program;
- Hospital-sponsored program;
- Union-sponsored program; and
- Skilled nursing facilities (2).

Information from the various programs obtained through interviews is presented in Table 7.1, displayed by the following characteristics:

- Program description (types of certification offered);
- Course length in hours;
- Approximate cost;
- Class size and ratios of instructors to students;
- Pre-testing and prerequisites for enrollment;
- Materials utilized;
- Teaching methods;
- Lab Facilities;
- Instructor qualifications; and
- Support for transition to work.

The remainder of this section will contain an introductory section on the sample states' regulations on nurse aide training instructor qualifications, followed by a description of the training programs. These descriptions are based upon researcher classroom observations and

interviews with instructors and students. The final section contains summaries of interviews with nursing facility directors of nursing, education coordinators and newly certified nursing assistants.

State Regulations Regarding Instructor Qualifications

The federal requirements for instructor qualifications (described earlier in Section 7.8.6) state that nurse aide certification instructors shall have a minimum of two years experience. At least one year of experience must be in long-term care. The educational background required of instructors is only that they complete a course in teaching adults or have experience in teaching adults or supervising nursing assistants.

The Massachusetts and Maryland State regulations on instructor qualifications were reviewed and found to vary significantly. Maryland regulations state that each course instructor must be a registered nurse licensed to practice in Maryland, have a minimum of two years of nursing experience — at least one year of which was in caring for the elderly or chronically

Table 7.1
Nursing Assistant Training Program Characteristics

Type of Program	Curriculum	Required Hours	Approximate Cost	Prerequisites	Class Size	Methods	Methods	Lab Facilities	Instructor Qualifications	Transition Support
American Red Cross	Combined CNA and HHA Course	MA - Total 100 hours Clinical - 21 hours MD - Total 127 hours Clinical - 40 hours	\$550 + \$87 Testing Fee	Reading and writing tests, 8 th grade level	Maximum class size is 24; Ratio of instructor to students in the clinical area is 1:6.	ARC Textbook and workbook	Lecture, video, flip charts, team activities, demonstration, return demonstration.	Combined classroom and lab	Lead instructors are all RNs. Clinical instructors RNs and LPNs. Long term care experience required. Only RNs and LPNs utilized as instructors.	Job opportunities posted on classroom bulletin boards
Hospital- Based	CNA	Total 80 hours Clinical - 21 hours	\$425	No pre-testing. Program based on 9 th grade reading level.	Class ranges in size from 6 - 20 students. Ratio of instructor to students in the clinical area is 1:6.	Textbook only	Lecture, video, demonstration, practice, reading assignments from textbook.	Combined classroom and lab	Program coordinator RN with BA degree in education and experience in long term care. Primary instructor LPN. Physical therapist teaches certain modules and assists in clinical area.	Job opportunities posted on classroom bulletin boards
Community College	GNA Geriatric Nurse Assistant	Total 200 hours Clinical - 75 hours	Tuition - \$700, Fees \$100 Books and supplies \$200 Total \$1000	High school graduate or GED and Basic Cardiac Life Support Certification	Same as MD state requirements	Textbook and workbook	Lecture	Combined classroom and lab	Same as MD state requirements	No information available
Union- Sponsored	CNA	Welfare-to- work - 480 hours Clinical-160 hours Other program Total 110 hours Clinical -40 hours	Welfare-to-work - No charge Other programs supplemented by union benefits programs for union members, also open to non-union members for reasonable tuition and fees	Welfare-to -work - pre-testing at the 6 th grade level. Other program pre-testing at the 8 th grade level.	Maximum size 20 students	Textbook only	Lecture, video, demonstration, return demonstration, role playing	Separate classroom and lab	RN instructors with LPNs to assist in the lab and clinical areas. RNs must be certified to teach in the state, have at least 1 year experience in LTC and 5 years experience as an RN. LPNs must have 3 years experience as a nurse.	Students assisted with job placement and continuing support after employed. The programs are described as a "life long resource."

ill in the past five years, and complete a course with a minimum of 16 hours of instruction in the principles of adult education or have a minimum of two years of teaching experience. ¹⁶³

In contrast, Massachusetts requires that the instructor be a registered nurse with either one year's experience in teaching or the equivalent of 24 continuing education units in curriculum development, and familiarity with the use of teaching strategies for adult learners. No specific requirement regarding the extent of nursing experience is noted. If the instructor does not meet these qualifications, regulatory compliance may be achieved by having a written agreement between the instructor and a registered nurse consultant who meets the above qualifications. This consultant must consult with the instructor at set intervals during the course while the instructor attends the required continuing education programs. Both education and experience qualifications noted above may be waived by the state if the proposed instructor has "obtained sufficient experience in the care of long-term care residents and in teaching adults how to provide such health care to ensure that he or she may train nurses' aides to perform the objectives outlined in the minimum standard curriculum described." No specific information as the definition of "sufficient experience" is offered.

Program Descriptions

American Red Cross programs in Boston and Baltimore combine nursing facility certified nursing assistant training with home health aide (HHA) training. In Boston, the total length of the program is 100 hours, with 21 hours designated for training in the clinical area. Nurse aide training takes place in ARC classrooms with clinical training at local nursing facilities. Baltimore programs are longer, requiring 127 hours for the combined CNA/HHA class. Maryland regulations require 100 hours of training, of which 72 hours are provided in the classroom and 42 hours in the clinical area. Massachusetts adheres to the federal mandate of 75 hours of training. Maryland regulations require that students be CPR-certified, while Massachusetts has no CPR requirement. Students must pass a reading and writing examination, based on 8th grade level, to gain entrance into the class. The cost of training in both Boston and Baltimore is approximately \$550 plus fees for testing. Partial payment is allowed. Classroom instructors are all RNs. Clinical instructors are RNs and LPNs. Boston instructors are required to have long-term care but not education experience. Completion of the Boston program may be applied toward six credits at three local community colleges. Students must pass with an 80 percent, and there are two quizzes and a final exam.

The hospital-based program examined by the research team is a nursing assistant training program and does not include the home health aide segment. The program is 80 hours in length, of which 21 hours is spent in the clinical area. Clinical skills are taught at one of several area nursing facilities. The instructor at this program explained that interest in the dual program (CNA/HHA) has diminished in the past years and on occasion, when there is a

Maryland Register, Subtitle 39 Board of Registration - Certified Nursing Assistants 10.39.01 Certification of Nursing Assistants, Vol 28, Issue 2, 1/26/01.

¹⁶⁴ Commonwealth of Massachusetts, 105 CMR: Department of Public Health, 156.210 (A). 4/1/94.

demonstrated interest, she does provide the additional hours. The hospital-based program is based on a 9th grade reading level and does not require any pre-testing. The program has a very strict policy regarding minimum test scores that students need to maintain to continue in the program. Three failed tests and the student is ejected from the program. Program instructors strongly encourage nursing facilities sponsoring students for training to conduct their own pre-testing. Cost is approximately \$425. The program coordinator is an RN with a Bachelors' degree in education and experience in long-term care. The primary instructor is an LPN. The program utilizes a physical therapist, in addition to licensed nurses, in both the classroom and clinical areas.

The community college program is 200 hours in length, of which 75 hours is spent in the clinical area. When complete, students are eligible to take the nursing assistant certification examination, known in Maryland as Geriatric Nursing Assistant (GNA) certification. Students must be high school graduates or have received a general education diploma (GED) and be CPR-certified. Total cost for the community college program is nearly \$1000, which includes \$700 for tuition, \$200 for books, supplies and uniforms and \$100 in testing fees.

The union-sponsored program offers two different tracks, a full-time welfare-to-work program and a part-time program for dislocated and incumbent healthcare workers and community participants. The welfare-to-work program consists of 320 hours of classroom instruction and 160 hours in the clinical setting over 16 weeks. The part-time program is 110 hours over 12 weeks. Pennsylvania adheres to the federal 75 hour requirement of training. Instructors are RNs with LPNs providing assistance with the clinical and lab components. Students are pre-screened for enrollment in the welfare to work program with 6th grade level reading and math tests. Students in the part-time program are pre-tested at the 8th grade reading and math level. A GED is not required for enrollment in either program. Tests are administered during the training and students are expected to maintain a 75 percent average. Students scoring below the 75 percentile are allowed to continue in the program and are provided with supportive tutoring. Students in the welfare-to-work program are provided with CPR training, but it is not a requirement for enrollment in either program. There is no cost associated with the welfare-to-work program. These programs are provided to union members, but are open to non-union members as well. For union members, the cost of the part-time program with associated fees may be covered by union benefit programs, with the student contributing to the cost for books and uniforms. The part-time program is also open to members of the local community for a reasonable tuition charge, which includes tuition and books; uniforms and testing fee are additional.

Classroom Observations

In order to better understand the various nurse aide training curricula, researchers visited the four program types for several hours at a time, usually on more than one occasion. It is important to note that these observations represent only a brief glimpse into the total program training activities.

Classrooms in ARC, hospital-based and community college programs combine classroom and laboratory facilities. Classrooms appeared crowded, but well supplied with handwashing sinks, hospital beds, bedside tables, over-the-bed tables, wheelchairs, walkers, mechanical lifts, upright scales, commodes, folding screens, linens, and personal care equipment. The union-sponsored program utilizes separate classroom and lab facilities.

Most instruction is given via lecture, with videotapes, posters and textbook used to supplement material presented. Student participation varied among the programs. In AMR programs, students were observed to participate by reading from textbooks and engaging in discussion to clarify important points and to draw from personal experience. The community college program was observed to be taught primarily via lecture. Students are regularly assigned homework. Skills training involves a demonstration by the instructor with return demonstrations from students working in small groups. Students practice on each other, and are required to demonstrate how to knock on doors, introduce themselves and explain a procedure before beginning. Students are frequently reminded to talk to the residents, explain what they are doing, and ask if residents are comfortable.

During skills training, instructors were observed on several occasions in two of the programs to teach different procedures for the same task; one that the student would be expected to demonstrate to pass the certification test and the other the "real" way that would be done when employed in a nursing facility. For example, when the students were instructed on how to offer a bedpan to a nursing facility resident, they were told that during the certification test, their partner (someone who accompanies the student to the skills segment of the exam) would be allowed to lift themselves off the bed so that the student could easily slip the bedpan under them. The instructor explained that elderly nursing facility residents would not be able to do that and demonstrated how to turn the resident on his/her side, place the bedpan appropriately and then have the resident turn on their back.

In combined nursing assistant and home health aide training programs, material applicable to either or both programs was observed to be presented concurrently throughout the classes. For example, one class observed by a researcher covered the topic of safety and included both toddler and infant safety as well as safety issues applicable to the nursing facility. In this same segment, students were provided with and were responsible for information on positioning an infant to prevent Sudden Infant Death Syndrome, recognizing the signs and symptoms of heart attack, and emergency care and first aide for choking, poisoning and seizures. In this class, the instructor demonstrated the Heimlich maneuver and then had students practice with a partner. Students were then observed and "passed" on this skill by the instructor.

Instructor Interviews

Interview questions posed to the instructors focused on whether the number of state required hours were adequate (in their opinion) to prepare nursing assistants for employment and what supports they would recommend for newly certified and newly-hired aides. Instructors at both the ARC and hospital-based programs believed that students were adequately prepared

for entry level work but that a comprehensive orientation program was key to making a successful transition from student to practitioner role. Nursing assistants are prepared to perform basic tasks, but are not prepared to accomplish the level of organization necessary to accept a full resident assignment. The ARC instructor stated that students should not have a full resident assignment until they've been employed for four to five weeks and that their responsibilities for residents should be gradually increased over this period. She also stated that newly certified nursing assistants need six months of support and/or mentoring during their first job.

If any changes were to be proposed, ARC instructors advised increasing the required time in the clinical area or adding a requirement that nursing facilities put aides in a one-on-one mentoring or support relationship for at least the first few weeks following certification.

The instructor in the hospital-based program stated that students involved in clinical training in her program started out providing an aspect of care for one resident with a partner and then gradually advanced to the point of being able to provide care for one resident by themselves. This instructor stated that students are often initially uncomfortable and anxious in the nursing facility setting and that having a partner alleviates some of this discomfort.

When questioned about the make-up of the student population currently and in the past, instructors noted that language is an issue for many more students now than in the past. They explained that pre-testing students with reading and writing tests helps to identify those students who would have difficulty with the language level of the textbook and program materials. Inner-city classes include a higher percentage of non-native English speakers, while suburban classes are generally split evenly between students for whom English is their native language and students for whom English is a second language. The ARC offers English as a Second Language classes and will refer students to those classes if they are unable to pass the reading/writing examination. The age of students has not varied significantly over the years, but the number of men enrolling has increased. According to instructors in the ARC and hospital-based programs, 80 and 50 percent of students respectively pay for the program themselves.

Student interviews

Nine students were interviewed who were enrolled in ARC and hospital-based programs. Students were evenly split between under-25 and the 26-45 age groups. The majority were female and described themselves as Black/African American. Three were currently enrolled in college programs and two had been employed as business or healthcare professionals in their own country. Eight of the nine indicated that they were either currently enrolled or planning to attend nursing school in the future. It should be noted that these interviews took place in June 2001 when it is possible that a greater percentage of college students would be enrolled in the programs as they prepare for summer employment.

7.14.3 Nursing Facility Interviews

Interviews were conducted with directors of nursing and educational coordinators who are responsible for the orientation and on-going education of nursing assistants. Nursing assistants who had completed their certification training within the past 12 months were identified and interviewed as time and schedule permitted. Researchers recognized early in the study that the interview protocol for nursing assistants as originally drafted was excessively long and had to be shortened considerably. Because nursing assistants were interviewed at the facility during their shift of duty, they were far too busy to spend more than 10 or 15 minutes with the researcher. The original questions were also noted to be too complex for many nursing assistants, especially those for whom English was not their native language. One of the facilities visited was large (over 100 beds) while the other was small (100 beds or less); one was located in a suburban location, the other in the city. One facility was privately owned while the other was part of a chain.

Directors of Nursing/Education Coordinator Interviews

Directors of nursing (DON) and educational coordinators were questioned on their opinion of the adequacy of the preparation of nursing assistants, variation in training programs and ways that they provide support for the newly certified nursing assistant. Both DONs interviewed stated that nursing assistants generally need more training, particularly clinical training. One director of nursing had found that the aides were completely overwhelmed by the size of their assignment and the complexity of all that they were expected to do in the course of a shift. They commented that the aides were often unprepared for what the job entailed. They noted several areas where students could benefit from additional training. Students were not always adept at respecting resident rights or talking to residents and/or their families. They also did not know how to operate commonly used equipment, for example mechanical lifts and scales for weighing residents. Furthermore, they were not skillful at certain tasks, like taking blood pressures or transferring and positioning orthopedic residents.

When asked about the variability in level of preparation between various training programs, one DON stated that she has noted a great deal of variability in the competency of the nursing assistants coming from different programs. Some programs, she noted, seem to "pass" everyone, while others seemed too restrictive. This variation seemed to center on language issues. In her experience, she had hired recently trained, but not necessarily certified, nursing assistants. She described these recently trained nursing assistants as having such poor English language reading and writing skills that it was unclear how they could have passed the nurse aide training program and/or state certification examination. On the other hand, uncertified nursing assistants that she had hired and enrolled in a different certification program, had been dropped from that program because they were unable to maintain the required test average. The DON stated that she had confidence that these nursing assistants were caring individuals who would be competent nursing assistants and planned to have them repeat the program.

The other DON stated that she preferred students to be trained on-site at the nursing facilities as she believed that such training considerably shortened their learning curve. They were able to learn the facility environment (e.g., where supplies were kept, procedures for laundry, and required documentation), and develop supportive relationships with other staff during the course of their training. She pointed out that with the increase in acuity of nursing facility residents and the greater number of admissions and discharges, nursing assistants no longer have the opportunity to care for the same resident day after day. Nursing assistants' assignments change more frequently and thus they do not receive the needed reinforcement of providing the same care techniques daily. By training in the facility, this DON believed that a more consistent environment was achieved and was thus more conducive to learning.

Both facilities indicated that they provide individualized orientation programs designed to provide the appropriate level of orientation based on the newly hired employee's level of experience. All employees receive a standard general orientation, but beyond that the orientation is driven by the employees' needs. Nursing assistants' skills are evaluated using competency checklists to document that each skill has been successfully demonstrated. Evaluation of the various skills is completed by the nursing assistant, a co-worker, and their supervisor. Each facility stated that they assign a "buddy" or preceptor to new employees and that assignments are initially very light and are gradually increased over time. Both facilities indicated that although the orientation was individualized to the experience of the new employee, generally newly certified aides were in orientation for two weeks. One facility stated that if the orientation goes beyond two weeks, they evaluate the appropriateness of the individual's employment.

Interviews with newly certified nursing assistants

Newly certified nursing assistants were interviewed to determine the type of program they had attended, the curriculum, teaching methods and instructors, and to share information on their initial work experiences. As stated above, it was difficult to obtain all the desired information due to time and language constraints. In many cases, nursing assistants simply did not understand the interview questions.

Five female nursing assistants were interviewed; four from one facility and one who was interviewed at the union-sponsored program. Four described themselves as Black/African American and one described herself as Hispanic-Latino. Three stated their ages as between 26 and 45 years old and two were under 26 years. Two were high school graduates, one had completed two years at the university in her country, one was currently enrolled in the community college nursing program and one was enrolled in a union-sponsored LPN program. Prior to becoming nursing assistants, they had worked as housekeepers, lab assistants, home health aides, at a library and at a fast food chain. Two indicated that they decided to become nursing assistants because they had cared for elderly family members, one had selected it because it would get her a job and two wanted to go to nursing school.

Each one gave good marks to her training program. Four had passed the written and skills test the first time they had taken it, the fifth had had to repeat the training course and take the

written test twice, but had passed the skills test the first time around. When questioned as to which teaching methods were most effective, two nursing assistants indicated that the skills practice sessions were most helpful, while one found the textbook helpful and another stated that the "two languages" was good. She explained that her training class was conducted in English, but that if a student didn't understand something, he or she could request that the instructor explain it in their native language.

When describing their orientation to the nursing facility, each nursing assistant stated that she had been assigned a "buddy" and that this person had been very helpful, although it was not always the same person. The nursing assistants reported receiving full resident assignments between one and three weeks after beginning their employment. One stated that she felt she knew her job after two months. Three of the nursing assistants stated that they had learned 50 percent of what was needed to do their job in the training programs and 50 percent on the job. When asked if the way they perform tasks at the nursing facility was different from the way they learned in the training program, two stated that it was very different. One explained that it was because the way they do it at the nursing facility is more tailored to the needs of the residents, while the other stated that it was "completely different from the way it's done in class," but didn't offer any further explanation. These noted differences between the way procedures are done in class and the way they are done on the job impacted the newly hired nursing assistants' perception of the orientation program. When asked to describe their initial days on the job, one answered that, "it wasn't easy, things were very different from the class" and another stated that it was "very difficult as the workplace was not at all like the classes." One nursing assistant explained that no amount of training could have prepared her for "working short", (i.e., low staffing). She stated that, "I don't know how they can train you for that." She expressed that she had used most of the material that had been presented in her class, "some of the stuff I thought I would never use but I have."

7.14.4 Interpretation of Findings

Any conclusions or recommendations put forth in this section are limited by the extremely small sample of programs and nursing facilities reviewed. However, certain themes that were recognized in our interviews parallel testimony offered by industry experts that was noted in the literature review. Classroom observations along with interviews with program instructors, students, nursing facility directors of nursing and newly certified nursing assistants yielded the following key points:

• Time spent in clinical practice is important for improving competency levels at the time of certification and in easing the transition from certification program to work environment. Increasing the mandated number of hours in nursing assistant certification training programs and requiring that a portion of these hours be spent in the clinical practice component or in formal facility orientation programs would improve the competency level of newly certified nursing assistants.

- Communication between training program instructors and nursing facility staff
 regarding competency levels at the time of certification is needed to bring the level of
 expectation on the part of the nursing facility in line with the reality of program
 capabilities. Because facilities are often not aware of the variation in training course
 content, communication in the form of individual student competency evaluation
 specific to care tasks should be provided by the certifying program to the hiring
 agency.
- The amount of material presented to the student and for which the student is held responsible is vast. (For details, see sections 7.6.1 and 7.8.2.) Students, regardless of educational background or employment experience are expected to absorb information on the following:
 - Basic nursing procedures (e.g., bathing, dressing, feeding, transfers, mouth care, measurement of temperature, pulse, respiration and blood pressure);
 - . Medical information on diseases (e.g., Alzheimer's disease, cancer, diabetes);
 - . First aide and emergency procedures (e.g., poisoning, falls, burns);
 - . Nutrition;
 - . Safety;
 - . Resident rights;
 - . Communication;
 - . Death and dying; and
 - . Infection control.

The majority of the programs examined attempt to accomplish all of the above within the 75 hour minimum required by OBRA '87. If the training program is one that includes both CNA and HHA training, information and procedures applicable to all age groups must be mastered. Increasing the number of hours, especially for students with no previous medical experience would improve competency levels.

- Emphasis should be focused on the special needs of the geriatric population. Because the course content is extensive and often includes both CNA and HHA training, thus covering all age groups, little focus can be spent on the special needs of the elderly, who make up the vast majority of the population needing care.
- Techniques taught should be current to the present nursing facility environment, e.g., nursing facilities do not use upright scales as few residents are able to step up on them, yet training programs teach weight measurement using upright scales.

The responses by newly certified nursing assistants that 50 percent of what they currently know about their job they learned in the training program and other 50 percent they learned on the job agrees with data from a survey referenced in Section 7.7.1 (Gipson et al, 1998). These observations made by nursing assistants are interesting and at the same time rather distressing. Nursing facilities appear to focus their attention during the orientation process on the verification of skills that these nursing assistants should have learned in training

programs. They recognize the need to teach nursing assistants and all new employees the policies and procedures that are unique to their facility, but do not appear to see their role as providing much more than general orientation and skill verification. The newly certified nursing assistants expressed great appreciation to their "buddies" and charge nurses who helped them learn during those initial weeks on the job. If it is indeed true that half of the learning is taking place at the facility, then the majority of this teaching is being provided by nursing assistants, which is putting considerable burden and responsibility on individuals who themselves have had minimal preparation. Furthermore, half of nursing assistants' preparation is taking place in an environment that is not aware that this practice is occurring nor acknowledging this task as their responsibility. More investigation into the interaction between training programs and work environment is needed.

7.15 Innovations from States

7.15.1 State Initiatives to Support Nursing Assistant Education

Several states are authorizing new sources of funds to support education, recruitment and retention of CNAs. Some initiatives are developing or evaluating programs that foster career development for CNAs. Others are preparing nursing assistants for certification, teaching them about specific diseases, or offering ESL or GED classes.

More detailed information will be available soon from the Office of Inspector General (OIG) of the Department of Health and Human Services, which is conducting a survey of all nursing assistant educational requirements in each state. The OIG's study, which will include data about which states are adding to or deleting from their mandated requirements, is due to be released in late 2001 or early 2002.

7.15.2 Michigan

The Michigan Department of Community Health has authorized \$7 million of tobacco grant funds over three years to enhance training in health careers. Among many funded projects are the following:

- "Staff development and training" awards for a dementia training project intended to help family and paid caregivers provide care to people with dementia.
- Funds to help the American Red Cross of Southeastern Michigan develop, test, and refine a curriculum to prepare direct care staff to work in various long-term care settings.
- A service organization in the Upper Peninsula of Michigan will receive \$150,000 for the "Home Care Assistant Training Program," a partnership with several community and state colleges and Michigan Works!, the state's workforce investment agency. The program will be implemented throughout the Upper Peninsula for existing in-home providers, workers and caregivers to address area direct care recruitment and retention.

- Alpena General Hospital in Alpena will receive \$50,000 for the "Certified Nurse Aide/Certified Home Health Aide Training Project," in partnership with Alpena Community College in several rural counties in northeast lower Michigan. The project is expected to reduce the cost and improve the quality of nursing facility and home care services.
- MidMichigan Gladwin Pines, of Gladwin, will receive \$70,268 for the "Staff
 Development & Training Project," to partner with Michigan Works!, a regional
 Community College, a county extension program, a Regional Education Service District,
 a family service agency and several long-term care providers. The project will result in a
 community strategic recruitment plan, more stabilized work force and greater recruitment
 of staff to the facility.
- American Red Cross Southeastern Michigan Chapter, of Detroit, will receive \$100,000 for the "Nurse Assistant Training, Recruitment, and Retention Program," to develop, test, and refine a direct care curriculum which prepares direct care staff to work in a variety of long term care settings.
- Huntington's Disease Society of America Michigan Chapter, of Lansing, will receive \$48,645 for the "Specialized Community/Individualized Care Planning," project to engage in a public/private partnership with Tendercare Corporation to provide Huntington's Disease training and consultation program within several Tendercare facilities to better handle associated behavioral symptoms and meet the long-term care needs of consumers with this form of dementia. The project will provide individualized care and planning with consumers in these facilities with Huntington's, family members, facility staff and other long-term care community providers.
- Tendercare Regional Office, of Okemos, will receive \$150,000 for the "Advanced Health Care Provider Training Program." The training will go beyond physical treatment practices to include outcomes that are consumer driven. The staff training models will include segments related to assisting customers in making informed choices related to their care as well as the available resources in their community to meet all of their needs.

7.15.3 Massachusetts

A Nursing Home Quality Initiative, passed by the Massachusetts legislature in FY01 and signed by the governor, was designed to improve the quality of long-term care by directing resources toward improving the quality and stability of the labor force. The budget included the following:

- \$35 million for an across-the-board wage pass-through for CNAs;
- \$1 million for a scholarship program for entry-level CNA and home health aide training;

- \$1 million for ESL and adult basic education (ABE) training for workers to develop the skills needed to enter a CNA training program; and
- \$5 million for the Extended Care Career Ladders Initiative (ECCLI).

ECCLI takes as its premise that long-term care providers must change how they value, train, and promote direct-care workers to compete for labor in today's economy. It awarded three rounds of funding during FY 01.

In two of those rounds, 24 nursing facilities were awarded up to \$100,000 each for initiatives that offered direct-care workers opportunities for skill development and career advancement. These took many forms, from ladders that emphasized leadership development to English classes for speakers of other languages. All allowed low-wage staff to move to more senior direct-care positions that offer greater responsibility and increases in wages.

A third round of funding offered nursing facilities from \$100,000 to \$500,000 to form partnerships with other long-term care facilities or home care providers, workforce development agencies, and community colleges. In each case, training for direct-care workers had to be linked to changes in work organization and care giving practices. Providers were asked to examine the quality of life for their residents, develop specific plans for improving care giving and workplace practices, and tie their career ladder curricula to the changes they proposed. Program components included changing supervision and management methods, instituting employee supports, and developing soft skills such as problem solving and communication.

Seven partnerships were funded, each including at least two long-term care providers, with a total of 27 nursing facilities and 3 home care agencies participating. Each consortium is developing a career ladder program. In some cases, housekeeping and dietary staff are encouraged to participate in ESL and ABE programs that provide the basic skills needed to enter a CNA training program. Many career ladders include mentoring and leadership components, which are complemented by supervisory training that emphasizes a "coaching" style of management (for details, see Section 7.16.3). A number of the programs provide employee supports, career counseling, and case management services.

In addition to career ladders, participants are engaging in other practices designed to expand the pool of workers and improve retention. One consortium, for example, is developing a shared curriculum for home health aides and CNAs, so workers can be cross-trained and can supplement their part-time home-based jobs with work at facilities during peak hours.

The legislature and the governor have proposed to continue funding for workforce development in long-term care in the FY02 budget. In its next phase, the program will include workers providing home-based care. The budget proposals maintain the wage increase and continue the scholarship program and resources for ESL, ABE, and employment supports.

7.16 Promising Practices from Providers and Other Nongovernmental Entities

In the limited time available to research and write this chapter, the research team was unable to conduct a comprehensive review of the many programs nationwide intended to recruit and train new nursing home nursing assistants or offer career advancement opportunities to experienced NAs. Most of the programs outlined below have not been evaluated formally, if at all. They were, however, recommended by program developers, researchers, and other key informants who believe them to be innovative and effective.

7.16.1 Dementia Care Training

Due to the prevalence of dementia among nursing home residents and the special challenges posed by the condition, many educational programs for nursing assistants focus on some form of dementia care. Promising approaches include the following:

- Bathing. Being given a bath or shower often causes people with dementia to become
 agitated, striking out physically or verbally at their caregivers. In a pilot project at two
 Oregon nursing homes, researchers Joanne Rader and colleagues identified a number of
 ways in which nursing assistants could reduce aggressive behavior and make the
 experience more pleasant and less stressful for the residents.
- Adult education methods for teaching dementia care. A method of dementia care training disseminated by the Eastern North Carolina chapter of the Alzheimer's Association teaches both direct caregivers and their managers effective ways of working with people with dementia. The training itself incorporates many concrete suggestions, such as approaching people from where they can see you, not from behind, giving them time to realize and adjust to what's happening, staying at eye level rather than towering over them, offering a hand but letting the resident initiate contact, and keeping messages simple.

The content is taught in a variety of methods calculated to get through to all types of adult learners (for details on adult learning methods, see Section 7.7.2). "Our experience indicates this training approach and our techniques result in better content integration into practice, improved caregiver understanding of resident behavior, use of new and more effective intervention techniques ... and fewer episodes of negative resident-caregiver interactions around caregiving," writes Teepa Snow, one of the developers of the program and the program director for the Durham Technical Community College OTA program and restorative care offerings. ¹⁶⁶

Rader J, Lavelle M, Hoeffer B, McKenzie D (March 1996). Maintaining Cleanliness: An individualized approach. Journal of Gerontological Nursing 22(3) 32-38.

Personal communication.

• Music and touch therapy. Kramer, Smith and Dabney (1996-1997)¹⁶⁷ trained nursing assistants and family members to use these two types of therapy on residents with advanced dementia. Touch therapy concentrated on stimulation of the hand and arm, using such techniques as a light comforting touch, light hand massage and acupressure. The music therapy involved caregivers using techniques such as singing, humming, playing familiar or soothing music, moving rhythmically and playing instruments. Caregivers were taught each intervention in time spans of between 30 minutes and half a day over the course of several weeks.

The researchers found evidence that both types of interventions "can have a strong positive impact on nursing home residents with severe dementia," with touch typically calming agitated residents and music eliciting increased arousal and interest. Both interventions caused residents to exhibit less sadness and depression.

Noting that it was difficult for nursing assistants to find the time for the additional training, the researchers concluded that "a more important consideration for training than establishing a uniform schedule which has to be followed by everyone is assuring that each caregiver can devote about eight hours overall to the training process."

7.16.2 Programs Offered by Individual Facilities or Chains

Providence Mount St. Vincent

Providence Mount St. Vincent (PMSV) is a large nursing home in Seattle, Washington, that has reorganized its staffing to facilitate the development of relationships between residents and resident assistants (its title for nursing assistants). To foster this Pioneer philosophy, nurses no longer manage resident units. For each "neighborhood" of care, PMSV has hired more resident assistants. The resident assistants have increased authority and responsibility and more time to spend with residents to provide individualized care, while licensed nurses have more time to conduct nursing assessments and treatments.

PMSV recently developed its own in-house training program because its managers felt that CNAs trained elsewhere were not prepared to do the work or be familiar with the PMSV philosophy of resident-directed care and management. It also provides training for several rural nursing homes who lack the funds and infrastructure to train their own staff.

The training program comprises 134.5 hours including 74.5 hours of clinical practice. The curriculum includes components about conflict resolution, communication and multicultural issues in addition to segments on the aging process, death and dying and cognitive impairment. PMSV establishes "extra" days during which students can return to practice

Appropriateness of Minimum Nurse Staffing Ratios in Nursing Homes
Phase II Final Report, December 2001

Kramer NA, Smith M, Dabney J (January 1996-December 1997). Final report: Effects of specialized training of family and nursing home caregivers in the use of music and touch with nursing home residents with advanced dementia.

skills prior to taking their exams, since the exam is often scheduled a month or two after they have completed the training.

The entire facility is invested in the training program. Although two full-time RNs direct the training program, other staff, including members of the management team, are often called on to teach specific segments.

PMSV encourages most employees to take the training so everyone is certified to provide resident care. The course is tuition-free, and PMSV pays all transportation costs. PMSV also pays wages to existing employees and holds their jobs while they take the resident assistant course.

In addition, PMSV provides English as a Second Language courses for interested employees. Employees who take ESL training take three hours of class a week. PMSV pays them for half that time.

Experienced resident assistants become preceptors to RAs in training and to those newly certified and assigned to neighborhoods. Under supervision from managers, preceptors work with the new RAs as long as necessary to help teach the resident-directed philosophy, oversee technical skills, and model the relationship building that is the core of the work. Preceptors are given a raise in salary. PMSV also offers financial credit for experience gained outside the facility that relates to an employee's job responsibilities.

Nurse Managers supervise the students during their clinical hours on the neighborhoods, and the training staff meets quarterly with preceptors to train them in identified areas and have them demonstrate their skills. In addition, PMSV periodically sponsors extended training for supervisors to develop their skills at supervision.

PMSV has a part-time counselor to help students succeed in the training program and access an Employee Assistance Program if necessary. The facility also provides support to students after they complete the training, whether they are employed at PMSV or elsewhere. In focus groups with employees held in 2001 to learn what kinds of support they need, PMSV learned that they want certain types of assistance in order to be able to work full-time or overtime. In response, PMSV is arranging for assistance such as late night childcare, food delivery and transportation.

PMSV is reimbursed for partial costs of its training program. Based on its Medicaid population, Medicaid pays 50 percent of the cost for teachers, expenses and supplies, but none of the wages paid to staff in training.

Apple Health Care

Apple Health Care is a small chain of 21 nursing facilities in Connecticut, Rhode Island and Massachusetts. As part of a corporate-wide culture change process, Apple addressed its high

turnover of CNAs through a holistic approach that redesigned hiring, orientation, advancement, and workplace culture practices.

To increase retention, Apple refined its selection process to ensure the hiring of candidates who believed in its quality-of-life mission. It then enhanced its orientation program and developed a career ladder program.

CNAs eligible for the Career Path program must be employed by Apple at least one year, be an employee in good standing, and be recommended by the administrator and director of nursing. CNAs earn quarterly bonuses of \$75, \$150 and \$250 respectively after completing each of three modules. (CNAs said they preferred getting the money as a bonus rather than as part of their wage packages.) The bonuses continue as long as the CNA remains employed.

Each module lasts for eight weeks, during which participants attend one two-hour class every week. The modules are Individualized Care, Pioneering Approaches to Quality of Life, and Leadership. Sample class titles from the first module include "From 'Difficult Behavior' to 'Meaningful Communication,'" "Care Plans that Know the Resident," and "Food is NOT Medicine!" The module on leadership includes classes on effective communication, understanding change, becoming a preceptor, and stress reduction, among other topics.

Apple's revamped orientation program partners a trained mentor (a level 3 Career Path CNA) with a new hire whenever possible. New CNAs go through on-the-job training, which is time spent directly with residents, before working on their own. This orientation period may be lengthened if the mentor and supervisors believe the employee is showing progress but needs more time. Mentors work with new aides holistically, teaching not just how to perform caregiving tasks but how to communicate effectively as well.

Apple also instituted a "Better Life" program to give paraprofessionals a voice in overall workplace culture. Joint committees of workers and residents suggest ways to make the home a better place to work and live. The committees have representation from a variety of shifts and have suggested many improvements that have been implemented.

The Cooperative Healthcare Network

The Paraprofessional Healthcare Institute has fostered a network of employee—centered enterprise and training programs modeled after Cooperative Home Care Associates, a worker-owned home care agency employing more than 600 direct-care workers in the South Bronx. The Cooperative Healthcare Network (CHCN) also includes two other worker-owned home health agencies, and two worker-centered training programs.

Although most CHCN providers work with home health aides, the network's approach to training has also been successfully applied to preparing nursing assistants for work in nursing facilities. The network has documented the following essential elements of effective training, based on 15 years of experience.

- Apply adult-learner training techniques throughout the curriculum. To accommodate different methods of learning, the CHN training program incorporates a range of teaching techniques, including the following:
 - -- Case studies
 - -- Learning team discussions
 - --Role plays, theatre and other simulations
 - --Interactive lectures
 - --Homework that stimulates questions and discussion
 - --Recycling (repeating) information in different contexts and forms
 - --Interactive review/assessment activities
- Adapt clinical and personal care skills curriculum to the specific needs of the resident base.
- Add work-readiness skills such as communication, critical thinking and interpersonal
 problem solving to the curriculum. These skills are introduced early and then woven into
 clinical and personal care skills units. (For example, a bathing unit is used to practice
 communication skills.) Appropriate workplace behaviors are also covered, including such
 matters as case assignments, hours, expectations for professional dress and behavior, and
 time sheets.
- Integrate learning about appropriate workplace behaviors into the training program. These may include such topics as case assignments, hours, expectations for professional dress and behavior, and time sheets.
- Extend training into the first 90 days of employment (this may be a probationary period), through a combination of close supervision and with the following:
 - --A comprehensive orientation program that refreshes skills, improves communication and problem-solving skills, and introduces aides to the full range of staff they will interact with in the organization.
 - --An on-the-job training program for the first three to six months.
 - --Peer support. Larger employers who hire a number of workers at one time convene peer-mentoring groups bi-weekly, ideally with an outside facilitator to help identify issues that need to be brought to supervisors or care managers. Smaller organizations that hire employees one at a time are encouraged to set up more flexible and informal mentoring relationships.
 - --Frequent in-service training to reinforce problem-solving skills through discussing onthe-job experiences. When possible, these are held bi-weekly, with peer-support sessions on alternating weeks.

Learning about appropriate workplace behaviors and understanding company policies is integrated throughout the training program. This is accomplished through on-the-job training to support workers in their first three to six months on the job, extensive orientation, regular in-

services that are responsive to student needs, peer support and mentoring programs, and a coaching style of supervision.

The coaching method uses one-on-one sessions to build a trusting relationship. Issues to be addressed are identified, and the coach seeks to understand how the nursing assistant sees her world, what her thinking and problem-solving process is, what she understands as her goals, and what barriers might be in the way of achieving these goals.

When there is a shift from "blaming" direct-care staff for problems such as absenteeism or "poor attitude" toward supporting growth and development and good problem solving skills, nurses and supervisors can begin to listen more carefully and improve communication with CNAs. Rancor and tension are reduced, and CNAs who might have left the organization may become prized employees. Sanctions are still used when necessary, but the goal is to replace the traditional "discipline and punish" method of supervision with a more effective "problem-solving" method.

Coaches are taught to communicate clearly with workers about each problem and its potential consequences, to come to an agreement about what the problem is and what caused it (here, the worker is expected ultimately to "accept ownership of the problem") and to help the worker resolve both the problem and its underlying cause.

CHCN members report marked reductions in turnover after instituting this method of training.

Genesis ElderCare

Genesis ElderCare, the skilled nursing and assisted living branch of Kennett Square, Pennsylvania-based Genesis Health Ventures, offers an advanced title to qualified nursing assistants who want to earn additional duties and pay while remaining NAs. Geriatric nursing assistant specialist (GNAS). classes last for 108 hours and cover seven topic areas, including advanced communication skills, conflict resolution and customer service, and the problems, signs and symptoms of common disorders in the elderly. GNAS graduates get a \$1.25 an hour boost in pay and are assigned special duties, which may include greeting new residents and their families, helping to orient new nursing assistants, overseeing a nutrition, hydration, or weight management program, or serving on a facility's performance improvement committee.

While the program has not been formally evaluated, Genesis reports that nursing assistant turnover has decreased since it was implemented more than a decade ago.

The Towson Maryland Regional Office for Genesis ElderCare is approaching the shortage of nursing staff through what they characterize as a "re-engineering" of the nursing staff. The first step in this re-engineering process involved a thorough review of the responsibilities, duties and tasks performed by all levels of the nursing staff, both licensed and unlicensed staff. Based upon this review, Genesis was able to identify the most time-consuming tasks as well as a number of functions that could be performed by non-healthcare workers. Using their findings, Genesis implemented the following changes: 1) creation of new positions and

re-allocation of time consuming tasks to these positions, 2) streamlining of the admission process, and 3) expansion of career ladder programs for nursing assistants. Specific examples of staffing changes include the addition of an evening non-clinical manager. This person assumes responsibility for all issues that do not require the expertise of a licensed nurse such as staffing shortages, physical plant problems, and resident or family non-medical questions. Because many residents receive IV therapy, which requires significant nursing time to monitor, a separate IV team was assembled to deal with IV administration on a 24-hour basis. Lastly, Genesis instituted the creation of a new position, called the Dignity Specialist. The Dignity Specialist is a certified nursing assistant assigned to each unit who devotes his or her time to bathing and showering residents in a "spa-like" atmosphere. This has proven to be a very successful practice for both staff and residents. The Dignity Specialist coordinates the scheduling of baths and showers and is able to provide a relaxing and private bathing experience for residents.

Wellspring

Developed by 11 not-for-profit long term care organizations in Eastern Wisconsin, Wellspring Innovation Solutions, Inc. is a multifaceted approach to improving care quality and reducing turnover. Each participating home is encouraged to tailor the program to its own needs, but all must agree to send all eligible staff to Wellspring's eight training modules and to collect data and analyze it on a quarterly basis. A geriatric nurse practitioner (GNP) oversees and implements training for all member facilities.

The philosophy behind Wellspring is to empower nursing assistants and all other staff to make decisions that improve the quality of resident care and the work environment, to foster networking between departments within a facility and staff at different facilities, and to use data on resident outcomes to measure progress and identify areas in need of improvement.

Six modules include nursing assistants. Training begins with a two-day off-site session, in which care resource teams consisting of nursing assistants and other staff study one of the modules. The team then teaches all other staff at the facility what they have learned. The GNP visits the facility three months later to reinforce what the team has learned, and conducts a one-way workshop six months after the training for team members. The process is repeated for each of the modules, with different staff members involved in each care resource team.

The topics are as follows:

- Elimination/continence. The entire nursing staff explores causes, assessment techniques, treatment options and ongoing evaluation as it relates to incontinence. The contributions of every department, from housekeeping to dietary, are explored.
- Skin care. A nurse practitioner and enterostomal therapist teach how to prevent, identify, and treat pressure ulcers.

- Behavior management. The social worker generally leads this module, which focuses on how to identify and treat such problems as depression, anxiety, delirium, dementia and wandering.
- Falls and restraint reduction. The entire facility staff is involved in this module, which stresses ways of identifying frequent fallers and maintaining safety without using restraints.
- Restorative care. Nursing, restorative and activities staff discuss how to keep residents at their highest level of functional, emotional and cognitive ability. Use of assistive devices is demonstrated, and the impact of resident immobility on function is explored.
- Nutrition. A dietician and a nurse practitioner explain how aging affects nutritional needs, with a focus on preventing dehydration and malnutrition. All care team members, including activities staff and therapists, are included in discussions of creative fluid management techniques.

In addition, a management module helps managers learn to adopt a coaching and mentoring style in the interest of empowering frontline staff, and a physical assessment module encourages RNs and LPNs to check their documentation systems for efficiency and accuracy and to eliminate redundancy, as well as teaching clinical observation, assessment, and critical thinking skills.

As Reinhard and Stone noted, 168 "The Wellspring model is particularly compelling because of its attention to the day-to-day work of frontline staff, particularly the CNAs. The stated philosophy is that top management sets policies for quality, and the workers who know the residents best decide how to implement those policies."

The American Association of Homes and Services for the Aging's Institute for the Future of Aging Services is evaluating the program in a report expected out in fall 2001. Meanwhile, noted Reinhard and Stone (2001): "Preliminary empirical evidence suggests that the Wellspring model may be producing improvements in quality. Yet because it is a multifaceted approach, implementation is not easy, according to top management. Aside from initial start-up costs in hiring the GNP and developing data systems and training programs, there can be 'psychic costs' associated with broad organizational change. Mid-management nurses and staff who are accustomed to a certain level of authority can sometimes be stumbling blocks to creating an environment in which CNAs and other front-line staff have a more substantive role in resident care and purchasing decisions."

St. Martin's

J.C.

The St. Martin's Outreach Certified Nursing Assistant Program in Hartfort, Connecticut, is a state-licensed nursing assistant training program developed by St. Martin's Episcopal Church

Reinhard S. and Stone R (January 2001). Promoting quality in nursing homes: The Wellspring model. The Commonwealth Fund (New York City).

and the Seabury Retirement Community. Classes and clinical training are held at Seabury, which encompasses both skilled nursing and assisted living.

The program is an apparently successful effort to do two things: develop viable nursing assistant candidates and offer job opportunities to the primarily low-income West Indian population in the area. The majority of its graduates remain employed as home care, assisted living or nursing home nursing assistants, and the program had a 200-person waiting list as of the end of 1999.

7.16.3 Programs Developed by Trade Unions, Associations, and Other Private Entities

Supervisor Training

Three organizations in New York City have partnered since 1996 to develop a tuition-free college certificate program for direct care workers and their supervisors.

The Paraprofessional Healthcare Institute and the College of Adult Learning of Lehman College and the JFK Jr. Center for Worker Education, both at the City University of New York, have received support from the United Hospital Fund to develop these programs, which are aimed at improving competency and retention of home health aides. The curricula, however, can be used for nursing home staff as well.

To earn a Certificate in Home Care, home health aides attend the following three-credit college-level courses:

- Introduction to Gerontology,
- Introduction to Disabilities,
- Introduction to Rehabilitation, and
- The Home Care System Sociology, Politics and Economics.

Students meet for three hours a week for 14 weeks, take tests, and develop a final paper or presentation that requires interviews with clients, staff and health providers in their communities.

The Certificate Program for Supervisors in Home Care focuses on the direct care worker's immediate supervisor, who is often the reason she remains at or leaves her position. (See 8.2) This program combines some of the academic work and readings from the Certificate in Home Care course, but focuses on building supervisory skills among staff from different New York City agencies. One course focuses on coaching as an effective method of supervision. (For details on the coaching method, see the description of the Cooperative Healthcare Network in 15.2). For each course students bring to the class experiences from their work settings.

All courses are taught in an interactive mode, using small group discussion and regular feedback. Teachers include college professors, home care agency directors, staff training directors and social workers in addition to outside speakers who represent consumers, workers and providers in the home care system. The courses also emphasize the development of reading and writing skills. Staff associated with the program recognize that students who had taken a basic

preparatory course in reading and writing perform better in the courses. Materials for this preparatory course include readings from the health care world are of interest to students. Taking this course has become a requirement for admission to the program.

Although the course is for supervisors of home health aides, much of the material offered is applicable to CNA supervisors in nursing facilities. The course curricula will be available through the National Clearinghouse on the Direct Care Workforce at www.directcareclearinghouse.org.

1199 Training Institute

District 1199C Training and Upgrading Fund is a union-management educational trust fund composed of 61 of the major healthcare providers in the Philadelphia region and the National Union of Hospital and Healthcare Employees. The Fund is governed by a Board of Trustees composed of half management and half union representatives. The Fund is supported by management contributions of 1.5% of gross payroll and grants from a variety of public and private sources with an annual budget of \$5 million. Most classes are housed in a 37,000 square foot training center adjacent to City Hall in downtown Philadelphia. Additional classes are held in satellite sites around the city and in Southern New Jersey.

For 25 years, the Fund has offered training programs for every healthcare sector. In support of the skilled training areas, the Fund offers a wide variety of remedial and preparatory programs including adult basic education, GED, English as a Second Language, Pre-Nursing and assistance for the learning disabled. The Fund is also a public site for the nurse aide certification examination and the GED test. The Fund serves both union members and the general public, approximately 15,000 people a year.

One of the largest training segments is the nurse aide program. Approximately 200 students graduate annually. The students come from different sources, union members seeking additional training, welfare recipients, dislocated workers, and the general public. There are several formats in which the course is offered depending on the background of the students and their healthcare experience. If graduates need employment, it is provided by the union hiring hall and cooperating employers.

The Training Fund staff is also involved with the broader healthcare community and is involved in public policy. Staff hold positions on PA Quality Assurance Council, the Intragovernmental Council on Long Term Care Council, the Long Term Care Council on Cultural Change and the Pennsylvania Adult Basic Education Coordinating Council.

The Fund's basic commitment is to developing career ladders to provide opportunities for advancement and to stabilize the workforce. The nurse aide graduates are offered easy access to a part time Licensed Practical Nurse program offered by the Fund. The program is designed for workers and offered in the evening and on weekends. In most cases, nurse aides can attend on scholarship and expect to double their salary upon completion. The next step is registered nursing. The Fund has trained about 500 nurses and has developed a plan to end

the nursing shortage by reaching out to new populations, entry level healthcare workers, minorities and immigrants.

Career Nurse Assistants Programs Inc. and National Network of Career Nursing Assistants
Based in Norton, Ohio, and founded by Genevieve Gipson, RN, these related programs offer educational programs, leadership training and recognition programs for nursing assistants.

The Career Nurse Assistant Program's (CNAP) workshops include the following:

- Clinical Teaching Skills for Instructors, Supervisors and Nursing Assistant Mentors. This
 12-hour course covers adult learning methods and clinical teaching skills. Instructors
 who train new NAs and NAs' on-the job supervisors are taught to work as an effective
 team, helping new nursing assistants to transfer the skills taught in class to the clinical
 setting.
- The WH2O Patrol. This three-hour course on preventing dehydration teaches ways of assuring adequate fluid intake by residents.
- Encouragement: The Language of Caring. In a three-to five-hour session, students discuss and practice ways of communicating that convey both self-confidence and respect for other people's perceptions and beliefs.
- National Leadership Training Program for Nursing Assistants. This 12-hour course
 focuses on leadership skills to prepare nursing assistants to serve on facility committees
 or work with their peers. A related course, Working with Groups and Committees,
 provides training for nursing assistants who want to be members or facilitators of a
 facility's care planning, safety, purchasing or other committee.

CNAP provides recognition by inducting new members each year into its Twenty Year Club for nursing assistants with 20 years or more of service. In addition, it sponsors national CNA day and week in June, publicizing the dates and offering facilities materials, guidelines and suggestions to help them honor their employees.

The Institute for Caregiver Education

Based in Chambersburg, Pennsylvania, the Institute for Caregiver Education offers a number of programs to educate nursing assistants and their supervisors. These include:

- A career development series. This career path is open to all nursing assistants, but aimed primarily at new hires. It covers job skills that are needed by all nursing assistants but are not always taught. The training consists of 13 two-hour modules with such titles as "Walk a Mile in My Slippers," "He Said, She Said, Go Figure," and "Survey Savvy."
- The Nursing Assistant Specialist for Elders curriculum. In this program, which consists of 84 hours of advanced skills training for nursing assistants with at least six months'

experience, classes are typically taught in three-hour segments meeting twice a week for 14 weeks. It consists of four modules: Needs of the Elderly; Depression, Cognitive Impairment and Behavioral Management; Aspects of Aging; and Common Disorders of the Elderly.

- An English as a Second Language program. Geared toward people who want to work in elder care, this course begins with students meeting three times a week for three months with an ESL instructor. They then attend an eight-day course that covers non-medical skills needed by nursing assistants, such as communication skills, stress management, conflict resolution, basic math, and medical terminology. And finally, they spend three weeks learning hands-on skills and other knowledge needed to prepare them for the certification exam. The classes have been taught to about 25 students so far, most of them Spanish-speaking immigrants from Peru, Brazil, Ecuador, Mexico or Puerto Rico. The Institute estimates that 70 to 80 percent of the students have passed the state competency exam. According to Carol Tschop, chairman and president of the Institute, "the workers have proven to be quite responsible when placed in CNA positions."
- Leadership training for supervisors. The Institute recently introduced a 40-hour, 10-week program to enhance the leadership and supervisory skills of unit managers, charge nurses, and RN supervisors.

LEAP for a 21st Century Long Term Care Workforce

The acronym in the title stands for "Learn, Empower, Achieve, Produce," and the program was co-developed by Life Services Network in Hinsdale, Illinois and Linda Hollinger-Smith, PhD, RN, of the Mather Institute of Aging.

Currently being tested in Mather Lifeways in Evanston, Illinois, and three other sites, it consists of four pieces:

- Organization and team-building. This is the foundation on which the rest is built, stresses
 co-developer Anna Ortigara of Life Services Network, who says change cannot be
 implemented in a facility unless employees from all departments and shifts work
 together. ¹⁶⁹ "People don't know each other; they don't have a chance to learn about
 other departments."
- An educational program. At this six-day workshop on communication and team-building, staff from all parts of the facility participate. "People love it," says Ortigara. "It's nothing new, really, but it's new in this setting [long-term care]."
- A CNA career ladder. This has two levels, says Ortigara. The material taught in the first level is more basic, but getting into Level two "is a real audition. You have to have

-

Personal communication.

references, you have to apply, and you're told you'll have an expanded role with expanded responsibilities." The program was designed that way to ensure that it "changes the scope and responsibility of the CNA job."

- Mentoring for new CNAs. To ensure that new nursing assistants do not feel alienated from the facility, certain experienced CNAs are trained as peer mentors.
- Leadership development for nurse supervisors. Nurses are taught communication and management skills.

The researchers are refining the program based on initial feedback and expect to have their final materials available by January 2002.

The Learning Network for Senior Services

This is a collaborative initiative sponsored by the American Association of Homes and Services for the Aging with seven of its state affiliates (Illinois, Kansas, Michigan, Minnesota, New Jersey, New York, and Wisconsin) and Professional Mentoring, an electronic publishing company based in Manhattan, Kansas. The network uses technology-based tools to provide educational programming for nursing assistants and other staff.

States and facilities are encouraged to use the information to develop site-specific training. As of late summer 2001, additional states were testing the program, which is called The Learning Network (TLN) for Senior Services (http://www.tlnpartners.com).

Training programs include the following:

- On-line continuing education credits for administrators in various areas, including supervision, team building, communication, and hiring and retention of staff. Students can learn through written materials, corresponding with other students through e-mail or an on-line discussion group.
- A CD ROM-based program for nursing assistants covering 14 topics that can fulfill mandatory in-service requirements. Staff can take the course through an audio component in which the material is read to them or they can page through on a computer screen. A ten-point quiz follows each segment. The program tracks which components the staff person has studied, tested and completed and then creates a certificate for completion. A comprehensive tracking system also documents all non-TLN courses completed.

Curriculum components include residents' rights and psychosocial needs, infection control, lowering stress levels, death and dying, confidentiality, communication, dementia, preventing burnout, abuse and neglect, and more.

 A more advanced leadership training module includes segments on such topics as authority and control, change, dealing with groups, customer relations, decisionmaking, ethics, fear of failure, management, mistakes, money, motivation, professional growth, and more.

This segment includes a presenter's guide, which educators can use to supplement their in-house training programs. It also includes more than 1,000 articles on leadership, supervision and professional growth, allowing staff to search for and instantly receive relevant information. Employees at all levels of the facility can make use of the database, and trainers can package some of the articles for use in a course curriculum.

Collecting and Publishing the Wisdom of Nursing Assistants

In the course of researching dementia care training for nursing assistants, Nanette A. Kramer, Michael C. Smith, Janice Dabney and Tony Yang-Lewis were struck by the number of good ideas that came from the nursing assistants themselves. The researchers collected and organized those ideas, summarized each set of comments with a paragraph discussing what they have in common and how they can be put into practice, and paired them with high-quality black and white photographs of nursing assistants and residents with dementia.

The resulting manual, *Speaking from Experience: Nursing assistants share their knowledge of dementia care*, is published on high-quality paper with easy to read type. Accessible and elegant, it conveys a sense of professionalism, while the photographs give it emotional weight. Published in 1997 by Cobble Hill Health Center (Brooklyn, NY), the manual comes with a four-page trainer's guide on how to help nursing assistants use the ideas in the book or generate and act on their own.

Kramer and Smith (2000) noted that the reactions of nursing assistants at various nursing homes to the manual were "strong and consistently very positive." Nursing assistants, they wrote, "spoke about how good it felt to have their knowledge as well as their feelings validated," and said they were eager to show the manual to friends, family, and other staff.

CNAP (see Section 7.16.3) has created a similar series of booklets, Tips, Tips 2, Tips 3 and Tips 4. Each consists of tips offered by experienced nursing assistants, organized into topics such as "working with the new nurse assistant" and "Nursing assistants: making quality care happen through teamwork." Most are published through CNAP in Norton, Ohio, although a *Best of Tips* compilation is available through Hartman Publishing, Inc., in Albuquerque, New Mexico.

Frontline Publishing

Based in Somerville, Massachusetts, Frontline offers several employee training and development programs for nursing assistants in nursing homes and other settings. These include the following:

• The CareWorks career ladder. Developed by Frontline and customized for the long term care employers that institute it, the CareWorks career ladders consists of two levels comprising nine modules. In level one, as practiced in Integrated Health Services (IHS) facilities, nursing assistants get 30 hours of combined classroom and hands-on education in psychosocial and professional aspects of caregiving. Upon graduation, nursing assistants are given the title of Caregiver I. Level two offers advanced training in many key clinical areas, with graduates earning the title of Caregiver II. Training modules, each of which recommends two to three hours of instruction, cover topics such as customer service, arthritis and the musculoskeletal system, hydration and nutrition, pain management, and residents' rights. Students must pass a mid-term exam and complete a final exam in the form of a project in one of five areas: department shadowing, resident care planning, conducting an inservice, marketing the facility, or family or resident council presentation. Caregiver II status must be renewed yearly by completion of another project in one of the areas not already covered.

The CareWorks instruction manual strongly urges facilities to give raises of no less than a dollar an hour to those who graduate from the program, or to award a one-time cash bonus of no less than \$250 per graduate, noting that "anything short of a significant pay increase or cash bonus will undercut the seriousness and credibility of your entire program."

According to Frontline, IHS facilities say the career ladder program has decreased nursing assistants' turnover by 25 to 30 percent.

• The CareWorks mentoring program. To reduce turnover during the first three months on the job, this program helps facilities identify experienced nursing assistants to help orient new workers. It provides a curriculum for training those candidates, in six one-hour modules with such titles as "Mentor as Teacher," "Mentor as Leader," and "Communication Skills." And it offers advice on how to reward graduates with certificates, enhanced status, and increased responsibilities.

Some facilities include a second phase, called Team Works, for those who supervise nursing assistants.

 Nursing Assistant Monthly. This monthly educational tool consists of a newsletter for nursing assistants and a companion instructional guide for staff development directors. Each month, the newsletter covers a topic of importance to nursing assistants, such as managing conflict between residents or creative approaches to Alzheimer's care. Staff educators may base their monthly in-service programs on the material in the newsletter and facilitator's guide, or pass out a quiz included in the guide and allow nursing assistants to read the newsletter and take the quiz on their own in place of attending the in-service session.

SEUI Local 150

This Oakland, California-based branch of the Service Employees International Union instituted a program to train welfare recipients for work as nursing assistants in 1997. Four local corporations, each of which owns several nursing facilities, currently employ graduates of the classes, which are held in the Oakland/East Bay area and will expand in the fall of 2001 to include San Francisco and Sacramento as well. The trainers identify candidates and send them to one of the participating facilities for an interview. If a facility agrees to hire the candidate, he or she is enrolled in the program and guaranteed a job upon completing the training and passing the certification exam.

Candidates have been on public assistance for at least five years, so trainers screen in order to find the people likeliest to be able to handle the responsibilities of the job. Local 250 Education Director Joan Braconi says they look for people who can read and comprehend and do basic math. "People who've done some form of care, even just taking care of a grandparent or a sick child or a sick relative, are going to be much more successful. People who come from a family of healthcare providers tend to be more successful." Perhaps the most common reason their candidates lose jobs, she adds, is that they simply don't show up or show up very late, so her program screens for that. "Are they showing up for their appointments with their caseworkers on time? If they're not showing up or calling, or they're showing up on the wrong day — which is pretty common — that's a warning sign that they're not really ready."

Providing support is crucial as well. Local 250 holds Saturday study groups for nursing assistants in training, where they can go over the places where "people are getting stuck." They assign a caseworker to each student, who follows up throughout the training and for at least six months after graduation. And they help set up basic support services, as people whose lives are extremely chaotic may be unable to complete the course even if they're otherwise good job candidates. "Housing, childcare and transportation needs to be really nailed down," says Braconi. "They need to have backup child care."

The program begins with three weeks of 35-hour-a-week training in job readiness, including basic life skills, employment skills, and an introduction to the subject matter to be covered, such as taking vital signs and practicing infection control. That training is unpaid.

Those who complete it go on to eight weeks of 40-hour-a-week nursing assistant training. (The SEIU originally proposed six weeks of training, says Braconi, but the employers they were working with requested more.) The nursing assistant training takes place at the facility where the student will be working. The facilities pay the students for their time but agree not to use them on the floor, except when they are doing clinical practice supervised by an instructor. The students' caseworkers visit the facilities weekly during training to meet with instructors and students.

Braconi estimates that 25 to 30 percent of the students drop out over the course of the training, but the pass rate on the certification exam is extremely high for those who make it

all the way through — "close to 100 percent by the third try, and 80 to 90 percent on the first try."

She credits the success rate with the fact that only three weeks of training are unpaid, and those who enter into the paid training are guaranteed a job, "probably for life because of the demand," if they complete the training and become certified. "A lot of community college programs are a semester long, and then they still need to go look for a job," she notes. "that's a daunting task for people [on public assistance] who don't have good job search skills."

The Iowa CareGivers Association

After surveying nursing assistants and the licensed nurses who supervise them to determine what kind of education programming was needed for nursing assistants, the Des Moinesbased Iowa CareGivers Association (ICA) developed the following:

- Support groups and recognition programs for nursing assistants. A planning committee
 consisting of long term care consumers, family members, advocates, educators,
 providers, regulators, and others as well as direct care workers came up with programs to
 increase community awareness of the importance of the nursing assistant's role.
 Facilities and community groups held recognition programs, and CNA support groups
 were set up and facilitated by the local community college.
- CNA mentor training program. A joint effort between a community college, facilities, and the ICA, this two-day program was available to CNAs who met their facilities' criteria and filed an application. Facilities created their own implementation guidelines, with some but not all increasing wages, creating new name badges and titles, and including mentors in care plan meetings. Quarterly CNA Mentor reunion meetings were held to help new mentors solve challenges they faced in their new roles.
- In-service trainings on topics selected by CNAs. These included conflict resolution, Alzheimer's care, communicating with dying residents and their families, and communicating and team-building with coworkers.

Eight facilities received the interventions, while three did not, serving as control groups. Those implementing the programs experienced nearly twice the retention rate of those that did not (19 months versus 10 months.)

Peer Mentoring

The certified nursing assistant peer mentor training program is part of a three-year research project conducted by the Foundation for Long Term Care, the research and education affiliate of the New York Association of Homes and Services for the Aging. Project findings and a training manual for facilities will be disseminated through the Internet, conferences and publications.

The goal of the project is to create an effective, replicable, and sustainable peer-mentoring program for new nursing assistants, based on peer mentoring programs that have shown promise in nursing homes across the country.

The project directors anticipate three outcomes:

- the peer mentoring program will reduce turnover;
- the cost of implementing the project for each facility will be far less than the cost of doing nothing about the retention problem; and
- the train-the-trainer format will allow for nursing homes to sustain the project independently.

Project staff have completed the guide for facility trainers to use to institute the peer mentoring program in the demonstration facilities. It contains theoretical as well as practical information regarding teaching, communication, problem solving, and many other topics. The manual uses a variety of teaching tools including mini-lectures; brainstorming exercises; small group exercises; case discussions; role plays; informational handouts; power point slides; and trainer instructions.

Modules include the following:

- the role of the mentor;
- tools for successful mentoring such as attitude, communication skills and compassion;
- leadership skills; and
- knowledge and tutoring strategies.

The project is funded by a grant from the Fan Fox and Leslie R. Samuels Foundation.

7.17 Training Recommendations

The recommendations below were written for this report by the Paraprofessional Healthcare Institute. In addition to outlining specific content areas to be covered, they describe the educational approach, structural framework and set of relationships needed to prepare nursing assistants to deliver good care to nursing home residents. They are divided into five sections: recommendations for CMS; recommendations for states; recommendations for nursing facilities; course content, testing and training methods recommendations; and recommendations for further study.

The main recommendation to state agencies overseeing long-term care is to pay facilities the full costs of all allowable and required training expenses, abolishing cost limits on Medicaid reimbursement for training.

Of the actions recommended to CMS, the main ones are these:

- Require more than 75 hours of certification training to give students more time to absorb all the material covered in the classroom and to include sufficient clinical training;
- Add "soft skills" training, such as communication, problem solving and cultural sensitivity, to the curriculum requirements; and
- Develop a multi-agency task force at the federal and state levels across DOL, HHS, and DOE to address training issues such as curricula, certification, payment for training and access to public supports.

The primary changes recommended to facilities are as follows:

- Invest in workers for the long term, with incentives such as career ladders and peer mentors or other support systems;
- Ensure that trainers are trained in adult education methods and supervisors are trained in effective supervision techniques; and
- Strengthen connections with community colleges, private schools and other community-based trainers to ensure a smooth transition between the skills and information that are taught in class and those that are needed on the job.

The main recommendations for course content are:

- Teach "soft" skills, as outlined in the recommendations to CMS;
- Teach CNAs about disability and the aging process in general and ensure that they have contact with nursing home residents during training. Encourage them to treat individuals rather than diseases; and
- Incorporate extensive field experience into pre-certification training to prepare students realistically for the demands of the job, and follow up with ongoing training geared to individual CNAs' learning needs.

The main areas recommended for further study are:

- Evaluate provider practices aimed at improving recruitment or retention of nursing assistants, identifying which methods appear to be successful
- Find out what makes nursing assistants leave the field

• Identify effective ways of transferring learning from the classroom to the worksite.
The full text of the recommendations may be found in Appendix E-2.

References

Abramson, R. A. 1993. The Professionalization of Nurse's Aides. In Toner, J. A.; Tepper, L. M. and Greenfield, B., Eds. *Long-Term Care: Management Scope and Practical Issues*. Philadelphia: Charles Press.

Ablanese, T.; Blackmon, D.J.; Garland, T.N.; Gipson, G.A. and Schirm, V. 1997. Factors Affecting Quality of Care in the Nursing Home: Views of Licensed Nurses and Nurse Assistants. Presented at the Annual Meeting of the North central Sociological Association, Indianapolis, Indiana, April 25 – 27.

Adcock Lesley. 2000. Linking basic theory to practice for healthcare assistants. *Journal of Community Nursing*, July.

Alford Patricia J. 1986. Turnover Rate Slows with Creative Training Program. *Provider*. April.

Allen J. and Pifer, A., eds. 1993. *Women on the Front Lines: Meeting the Challenge of an Aging America*. Washington, D.C.: The Urban Institute Press.

American Federation of State, County and Municipal Employees. 2001. *Cheating Dignity: The Direct Care Wage Crisis in America*. Washington, D.C.: AFSCME.

American Health Care Association. February 2001. Staffing of nursing services in long term care: Present issues and prospects for the future. Washington, D.C.: AHCA, Health Services Research and Evaluation.

Anderson, J. and Adams, M. 1992. Acknowledging the learning styles of diverse student populations: Implications for instructional design. *Teaching for Diversity*, 49:23.

Aroskar M. A., Urv-Wong E.K., Kane R.A. 1990. Building an Effective Caregiving Staff: Transforming the Nursing Service in Kane, R. and Caplan, A.L. (eds.) *Everyday Ethics: Resolving Dilemmas in Nursing Home Life*. New York: Springer Publishing.

Atchley R. C. 1996. Frontline Workers in Long-Term Care: Recruitment, Retention, and Turnover Issues in an Era of Rapid Growth. Oxford, Ohio: Scripps Gerontology Center. September.

Ayach L. A. 1997. Skills program for nurse aides. Nursing Management. Nov; 28(11): 84.

Baker S.L., Stoskopf C.H., Ciesla J.R., Glik D.C., Cover C.M. 1996. Observation evaluation to assess race and educational bias in state-mandated standard testing of nurse aides in nursing homes. Journal of the National Black Nurses Association. Fall-Winter; 8(2): 23-37.

Banaszak-Holl J. and Hines M. A. 1996. Factors Associated with Nursing Home Staff Turnover. *The Gerontologist.* 36(4).

Banazak D.A., Mickus M., Averill M., Colenda C.C. 2000. Herding Cats: Barriers to Implementing a Nurse Aide Educational Program. *Annals of Long-Term Care* 8(10): 68-71 Bayer, E. 1994. Innovative Workforce Initiatives for Long-Term Care Paraprofessionals: A Resource Directory. *Generations*. Fall.

Bayer, E. J.; Stone, R. I.; and Friedland, R. B. 1993. Developing a Caring and Effective Long-Term Care workforce. *The Project Hope Center for Health Affairs*. June.

Beck C, Ortigara A, Mercer S, Shue V. 1999. Enabling and empowering certified nursing assistants for quality dementia care. *International Journal of Geriatric Psychiatry*. Mar; 14(3): 197-211; discussion 211-2.

Blackmon D.J., Garland N., Oyabu-Mathis N. and Gipson G. April 1994. *Changes in knowledge of care techniques among nurse assistants in a training program: Achievements and failures*. Paper presented at the Ohio Network of Educational Consultants in the Field of Aging, King's Island, OH.

Blackmon D., Albanese T., Gipson G.A., Garland T.N., Schirm V. 1997. Points of Agreement and Disagreement in the Views of Licensed Nurses and Nurse Assistants: A Factor in the Retention of Nurse Assistants. Paper presented at a special conference on Recruiting and Retaining Paraprofessional Frontline Workers in Long-Term Care, sponsored by the Scripps Gerontology Center and the Ohio Long-Term Care Research Project, Miami University, Oxford, Ohio.

Bonder B, Martin L., and Miracle A. 2001 Achieving cultural competence: The challenge for clients and healthcare workers in a multicultural society. *Generations* Spring; 25(1): 35-42.

Boockvar K., Brodin H. D., Lachs M. 2000. Nursing assistants detect behavior changes in nursing home residents that precede acute illness: Development and validation of an illness warning instrument. *Journal of the American Geriatrics Society* September; 48(9): 1086-1091.

Bowers, B. J. 1988. Family Perceptions of Care in a Nursing Home. *The Gerontologist*.28(3).

Bowers, B., Becker, M. 1992. Nurse's Aides in Nursing Homes: The Relationship Between Organization and Quality. *The Gerontologist*. 32(3).

Bowers B., Esmond S. August 1996. CNA Recruitment and Retention. University of Wisconsin-Madison.

Boyd, Charlene. 1994. Residents First. *Health Progress*. September.

Brannon, D. and Smyer, M. A. 1994. Good Work and Good Care in Nursing Homes. *Generations*. Fall; 18(3).

Brown, A. April 2001. *Beyond work first: How to help hard-to-employ individuals get jobs and succeed in the workforce.* Manpower Demonstration Research Corporation

Brown M. 1988. Nursing assistants' behavior toward the institutionalized elderly. Quality Review Bulletin. Jan; 14(1): 15-7.

Brunk D. 1995. Show Some Respect. Contemporary Long Term Care April; 18(4) 33-40

Brunk D. 1997. Random Acts of Violence. Contemporary Long Term Care July; 29(7) 38-42

Buelow, J. R. and Whittemore, A. 1996. Residents' Morale Can Be Improved Through Organizational Changes. *Journal of Long-Term Care Administration*. Spring.

Bureau of Labor Statistics. 1999 employment and wages for selected health care occupations and industries. Washington, D.C.: Bureau of Labor Statistics, Occupational Employment Statistics.

Burger, Sarah Greene. 1987. How Nurses Relate to Nursing Assistants. *Provider*. April.

Burgio L.D., Burgio K.L. 1990. Institutional staff training and management: a review of the literature and a model for geriatric, long-term-care facilities. International Journal of Aging and Human Development. 30(4): 287-302.

Burgio L. D., McCormick K. A., Scheve A. S, Engel B. T., Hawkins A., Leahy E. 1994. The effects of changing prompted voiding schedules in the treatment of incontinence in nursing home residents. *Journal of the American Geriatrics Society*, 42: 315-320

Burgio L.D., Scilley K. 1994. Caregiver performance in the nursing home: The use of staff training and management procedures. Seminars in Speech and Language 15(4): 313-322.

Burke G. III, Summers J., Thompson T. 2001. Quality in Long-Term Care: What We Can Learn From Certified Nursing Assistants. *Annals of Long-Term Care: Clinical Care and Aging* 9(2):29-35

Burke R.E., D'Erasmo M., Burger S.E. 1980. Research brief: Training geriatric nursing assistants--a solution. Journal of Long Term Care Administration. Fall; 8(3): 37-41.

Capitman, J., Abrahams, J. and Riteer, G. 1994. *Measuring the Adequacy of Home Care for Frail Elders*. Final Report to HCFA.

Cassidy, Barbara. 1997. Dilemmas of Being Supervised. *Journal of Nurse Assistants*. September.

Castle N. 2000. Deficiency citations for physical restraint use in nursing homes. *Journal of Gerontology* 55B(1): 533-540.

Catholic Health Association. 2001 Employer of Choice Strategy Guide: Finding and Keeping Direct-Care Staff. Washington, D.C.: Catholic Health Association.

Center for Workforce Studies, University of Albany, 2001 analysis of CPS data, 1997,1998, 1999

Chappell, N. L. and Novak, M. 1992. The Role of Support in Alleviating Stress Among Nursing Assistants. *The Gerontologist*. 32(3): 351-359.

Close, L.; Estes, C. L.; Linkins, K. W. and Binney, E. A. 1994. A Political Economy Perspective on Frontline Workers in Long-Term Care. *Generations*. Fall 18(3).

Cohen-Mansfield J. 1997. Turnover Among Nursing Home Staff: A Review. *Nursing Management* May; 28(5): 59-62, 64.

Cohn M.D., Horgas A.L., Marsiske M. 1990. Behavior management training for nurse aides: is it effective? Journal of Gerontological Nursing. Nov; 16(11): 21-5.

Commonwealth of Massachusetts, 105 CMR: Department of Public Health, 156.210(A), 4/1/94.

Coombs, Jackie. What nursing assistants do and do not do. Undated. Washington, D.C.: National Citizens' Coalition for Nursing Home Reform

Corbo, S. A. 1996. Training Nursing Assistants for Expanded Roles as PCT's. *Recruitment, Retention and Restructuring Report*. May/June.

Crown, W.H. 1994. A National Profile of Home care, Nursing Home, and Hospital Aides. *Generations*. Fall 18(3).

Dawson S. L., Surpin, R. 2001. Direct-care healthcare workers: You get what you pay for. *Generations* Spring; 25(1): 23-28

Dermody S.M. Do nurses' aides aid nurses or residents? Identifying the tasks they perform. 1993. *Journal of Long Term Care Administration*. Summer; 21(2): 19-22.

Deutschman M. 1999. How Do You Know What "Quality" Means to a Resident? Ask. Brown University Long-Term Care Quality Advisor March; 11(3): 1,5-6 Deutschman M. 2000. What you hear when you listen to staff, *Nursing Homes Long Term Care Management*, June.

Deutschmann, M. 2001. Redefining quality & excellence in the nursing home culture. *Journal of Gerontological Nursing*. August.

Deutschmann, M. 2001. Interventions to nurture excellence in the nursing home culture. *Journal of Gerontological Nursing*. August.

Dillon R.S., Stines P.W. 1996. A phenomenological study of faculty-student caring interactions. *Journal of Nursing Education*. Mar; 35(3): 113-8.

Doty, P.; Kasper, J.; Litwak, S. and Taylor, H. 1994. Consumer Choice and the Frontline Worker. *Generations*. Fall 18(3).

Duncan, Marie T. and Morgan, D.L. 1994. Sharing the Caring: Family Caregivers' Views of their Relationships With Nursing Home Staff. *The Gerontologist*. 34(2.)

Duss D.J., Soble B.A. November 2000. CNA focus group project report. Richmond, VA: Virginia Health Care Association.

Eaton, Susan C. 1997. *Pennsylvania's Nursing Homes: Promoting Quality Care and Quality Jobs*. Harrisburg: Keystone Research Center.

Eaton, S.C. 1996. Beyond "Unloving Care": Linking Work Organization and Patient Care Quality in Nursing Homes. Unpublished paper at Sloan School of Management, Massachusetts Institute of Technology.

Ersek M., Kraybill B.M., Hansberry J. 1999. Investigating the Educational Needs of Licensed Nursing Staff and Certified Nursing Assistants in Nursing Homes Regarding End-of-Life Care. *American Journal of Hospice & Palliative Care*. Jul-Aug; 16(4): 573-82

Evashwick C. J., ed. 1996. *The Continuum of Long-Term Care: An Integrated Systems Approach*. Albany: Delmar Publishers Inc.

Fagan, Rose Marie; C.C. Williams and S.G. Burger. 1997. *Meeting of Pioneers in Nursing Home Culture Change*. Final Report. Rochester, New York.

Federal Register 42CFR Part 431 et al. *Medicare and Medicaid; Requirements for Long Term Care Facilities; Final Rule* 56(187): September 26, 1991

Federal Regulations, Title 42, Part 483, Subpart D, Section 483.152.

Feldman, P. H. 1994. "Dead End" Work or Motivating Job? Prospects for Frontline Paraprofessional Workers in LTC. *Generations*. Fall 18(3).

Feldt K.S., Ryden M.B. 1992 Aggressive behavior. Educating nursing assistants. Journal of Gerontological Nursing. May; 18(5): 3-12.

Filinson R. 1994. An evaluation of a gerontological training program for nursing assistants. The Gerontologist. Dec; 34(6): 839-43.

Finnick, M.; Reis, J. and Drobits, K. 1990. How Nurse Aides Perceive Quality Care. *Nursing Homes*. September/October.

Foner, Nancy. 1994. Nursing Home Aides: Saints or Monsters? *The Gerontologist*. 34(2).

Foner, Nancy. 1994. *The Caregiving Dilemma: Work In An American Nursing Home*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Ford, W. D. 1996. Shoring up nurse supervisors. *Nursing Homes*. May: 14-16.

Gaddy T., Bechtel G.A. 1995. Nonlicensed Employee Turnover in a Long-Term Care Facility. *Health Care Supervisor* 13(4): 54-60

Garg A., Owen B. 1992. Reducing back stress to nursing personnel: an ergonomic intervention in a nursing home. Ergonomics. Nov; 35(11): 1353-75.

Garland, T.N.; Oyabu, N. and Gipson, G.A. 1988. Stayers and Leavers: A Comparison of Nurse Assistants Employed in Nursing Homes. *The Journal of Long-Term Care Administration*. 16(4).

Garland T. N, Oyabu N., and Gipson, G. 1989. Job Satisfaction among nurse assistants employed in nursing homes: An analysis of selected job characteristics. *Journal of Aging Studies* 3(4): 369-181.

Gipson G.A., Garland T. N. June 29, 1998. Final Report: Training Experienced Nurse Assistants in Long Term Care.

Gipson G., Garland T.N., Oyabu-Mathis N. 1994. Ohio Teaching Network: A Model for Training and Research for Nursing Assistants Employed in Nursing Homes. Presented at the twentieth annual meeting of the Association for Gerontology in Higher Education, Cleveland, Ohio, March 10-13.

Gipson G., Albanese T., Blackmon D., Garland T. N., Schirm V., Falter J. September 1997. *An empirical comparison of definitions of quality care held by licensed nurses and nursing assistants employed in long-term care in Ohio: Final report*

Goodman, M. and Trocchio, J. 1987. Cultivating Positive Attitudes in Nursing Home Staff. *Geriatric Nursing*. January/February.

Gornick, M. and Hall, M. 1988. Trends in Medicare Use of Post-hospital Care. *Health Care Financing Review Annual Supplement*.

Grant L.A., Kane R.A., Potthoff S.J., Ryden M. 1996 Staff training and turnover in Alzheimer special care units: comparisons with non-special care units. Geriatric Nursing. Nov-Dec; 17(6): 278-82.

Grasser, C. 1996. Reciprocity in Staff/Resident Interactions in Nursing Homes. *Journal of Women & Aging*, 18 (1).

Grau L, Chandler B, Saunders C. 1995. Nursing home residents' perceptions of the quality of their care. *Journal of Psychosocial Nursing Mental Health Services* 33: 34-43.

Gross, B. M. July 1995. Quality of care defined: An analysis of the impact of nurse aide training and competency testing programs on quality of care of residents of long-term care facilities in Pennsylvania. Harrisburg, PA: Pennsylvania Department of Education, Bureau of Vocational-Technical Education.

Hagen B., Sayers D. 1995. When Caring Leaves Bruises: The Effects of Staff Education on Resident Aggression. *Journal of Gerontological Nursing* November 21(11): 7-16

Hajicek D., Berg-Weger M., McGillick J., Schwartz L. 2001. Basic Care I: The Effects of Dementia Training on Certified Nursing Assistants and Other Staff. Paper presented at the Regional Conference of the Health Care Financing Administration, St. Louis, Missouri, May 17.

Hall, G. R. 1996. What Do You Do to Prevent Turnover of Non-Professional Staff? *Journal of Gerontological Nursing*. November.

Hanson L.C., Henderson M. 2000 Care of the dying in long-term care settings. *Clinical Geriatric Medicine*. May; 16(2): 225-37.

Harke J.M., Richgels K. 1992. Barriers to Implementing a Continence Program in Nursing Homes. Clinical Nursing Research. May; 1(2): 158-168

Harris A.L., Maier G. 2001. Give CNAs a Career Ladder to Climb. *Provider*. February: 39-40

Heaton W.H. 1989. Examining nurse aide competency evaluations. *Contemporary Long Term Care*. Mar; 12(4): 23-4, 38

Hegeman C., Lambating F. April 2000. *Best practice survey of nursing home aide continuing education programs*. Albany, NY: Foundation for Long Term Care

Helmer F. T., Olson S. F., Heim R. I. 1993. Strategies for nurse aide job satisfaction. *Journal of Long-Term Care Administration*, Summer; 10-14

Henderson J. Neil. 1994. Bed, Body, and Soul: The Job of the Nursing Home Aide. *Generations*. Fall 18(3).

Henderson, J. Neil and M.D. Vesperi, editors. 1995. *The Culture of Long Term Care*. Westport, Ct.: Bergin & Garvey.

Hill Simonton Bell, LC. December 1998. Certified nursing assistant (CNA) recruitment and retention pilot project. Phase I: Survey results. Iowa Caregivers Association.

Hill Simonton Bell, LC. January 1999. Certified nursing assistant (CNA) recruitment and retention pilot project. Phase II: Focus group study results. Iowa Caregivers Association.

Himmelstein K. U., Lewontin J. P., Woolhandler S. 1996. Medical Care Employment In the United States, 1968 to 1993: The Importance of Health Sector Jobs for African Americans and Women. *American Journal of Public Health*. April; 86(4).

Hinshaw Ada Sue, Smeltzer C. H., Atwood J.R. 1987. Innovative Retention Strategies for Nursing Staff. *JONA*..17(6).

Hoffman R. 1995. Training Nursing Assistants Translates Into Better Care. *The Brown University Long-Term Care Quality Letter*. November, 7 (21): 6.

Hoffman R. 1996. CNAs As Today's Key to A Successful Survey. *Nursing Homes*. March.

Hoffman R. 2001. Lessons Learned in Creating a Successful CNA Retention Campaign. *Nursing Homes Long Term Care Management*, April

Holder, Elma. 1998. Paraprofessionals on the front lines: Improving their jobs—improving the quality of long term care. Washington, D.C.: AARP symposium panel, September 10-11

Institute of Medicine, Committee on Nursing Home Regulation. 1986. *Improving the Quality of Care In Nursing Homes*. Washington, D.C.: National Academy Press.

In their own words: Pennsylvania's frontline workers in long term care. February 2001. A report to the Pennsylvania intra-governmental council on long term care. Harrisburg, PA

Iowa CareGivers Association. December 2000. Certified nursing assistant recruitment and retention project final report summary. Iowa Department of Human Services, contracts 99-040 and 2000-008.

Jacobs H. January 22, 1994. A new development in the education of direct care practitioners. SUNY-New Paltz.

Janz M. Perception of knowledge: What administrators and assistants know. 1992. Journal of Gerontological Nursing. Aug; 18(8): 7-12.

Kane, R.A. 1989. Toward Competent, Caring Paid Caregivers. *The Gerontologist*. 29(3).

Kayser-Jones, Jeanie Schmit. 1983. Social Exchange and Power in the Care of the Institutionalized Aged. *Human Organization*. 42.

Kayser-Jones, Jeanie and Schell, E.S. 1997. The Effect of Staffing on the Quality of Care at Mealtime. *Nursing Outlook*. March/April.

Kayser-Jones, Jeanie and Schell, E. S. 1997. Staffing and the Mealtime Experience of Nursing Home Residents On A Special Care Unit. *American Journal of Alzheimer's Disease*. March/April.

Kayser-Jones, Jeanie and Schell, E. S. 1997. The Mealtime Experience of A Cognitively Impaired Elder: Ineffective and Effective Strategies. *Journal of Gerontological Nursing*. July.

Kayser-Jones, Jeanie. 1997. Inadequate Staffing at Mealtime: Implications for Nursing and Health Policy. *Journal of Gerontological Nursing*. August.

Kayser-Jones, Jeanie. 1996. Mealtime In Nursing Homes: The Importance of Individualized Care. *Journal of Gerontological Nursing*. March.

Kindell, Josephine. 1997. Building Blocks to NA Retention. *Journal of Nurse Assistants*. September.

Kirk A, Reichert G. 1992. The Mentoring Relationship: What Makes It Work?" *Imprint*. January, 20-22

Knapp, Mary T. 1989. Strategies That Activate Talent. Provider.

Kolb D. 1987. The process of experiential learning, *Culture and Processes of Adult Learning*. London: Routledge

Konrad T R 2001. Where Have All The Nurse Aides Gone? North Carolina Institute on Aging

Kramer N.A., Smith M., Dabney J. January 1996-December 1997. Final report: Effects of specialized training of family and nursing home caregivers in the use of music and touch with nursing home residents with advanced dementia.

Kramer N.A., Smith, M.C. May 2000. The Effectiveness of a peer-oriented, work-integration dementia care training program for nursing assistants: Final report. New York State Department of Health Dementia Project.

Kramer N.A., Smith, M.C. 2000. Training nursing assistants to care for nursing home residents with dementia, in V. Molinari (Ed.), *Professional Psychology in Long Term Care*. NY: Hatherleigh

Krauss M.A., Altman B.M. Characteristics of Nursing Home Residents—1996. Rockwell, MD: Agency for Healthcare Policy and Research 1998, MEPS Research Findings No. 5, AHCPR Publication No. 99-0006.

Kruzich, Jean M. 1995. Empowering Organizational Contexts: Patterns and Predictors of Perceived Decision-Making Influence Among Staff in Nursing Homes. *The Gerontologist*. 35(2).

Lazear D. 1991. Seven ways of knowing: Teaching to multiple intelligences. Palatine, IL: Skylight Publishing.

Leon J., Marainen J., Marcotte J. February 2001. A Report to the Pennsylvania Intra-Governmental Council on Long Term Care. Jenkintown, PA: Polisher Research Institute at the Philadelphia Geriatric Center.

Lescoe-Long M., Long M.J. July 1998. *Identifying Behavior Change Intervention Points to Improve Staff Retention in Nursing Homes*. Wichita, KS: Department of Public Health Sciences, Wichita State University.

Maas M., Buckwalter K.C., Swansin E., Mobily P. 1994. Training key to job satisfaction. Long-Term Care Administration, Spring; 11(1): 23-26.

Maryland Register, Subtitle 39 Board of Registration - Certified Nursing Assistants 10.39.01 Certification of Nursing Assistants, Vol 28, Issue 2, 1/26/01.

Maun C., Lind D, Efta G. 2001. Workforce 21: Recruitment, selection and retention of top quality staff in the 21st century. Omaha, NE: Maun-Lemke Inc.

McAiney C.A. 1998. The Development of the Empowered Aide Model: An Intervention for Long-Term Care Staff who Care for Alzheimer's Residents. *Journal of Gerontological Nursing* Jan; 24(1): 17-22

McCallion P., Toseland R.W., Lacey D., Banks S. 1999. Educating nursing assistants to communicate more effectively with nursing home residents with dementia. *The Gerontologist*. Oct; 39(5): 546-58.

McConnell, John H. and Hall, V. 1989. A Non-Nurse as Manager? One Facility Says 'Yes'. *Provider*. November.

McGillivray T., Marland G.R. 1999. Assisting demented patients with feeding: problems in a ward environment. A review of the literature. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*. Mar; 29(3): 608-14.

Mentes J.C., Ferrario J. 1989. Calming Aggressive Reactions: A Preventive Program. *Journal of Gerontological Nursing*. Feb;15(2):22-27

Mercer, Susan O.; Heacock, P. and Beck, C. 1994. Nurse's Aides in Nursing Homes: A Study of Caregivers. *Journal of Women and Aging*. 6(1/2).

Morgan L.A. 1996. The Quality of Training for Nursing Assistants: Evaluations of Experienced Workers. Gerontology & Geriatrics Education. 16(3) 53-61.

Nakhnikian, Elise. 1996. Pair Power: For Veteran Nursing Assistants, Partnerships With Peers Provide Support and Stability. *Contemporary Long Term Care*. February.

National Citizens' Coalition for Nursing Home Reform. 1985. *A Consumers Perspective on Quality Care: The Residents' Point of View.* Washington, D.C.: NCCNHR. April.

National Citizens' Coalition for Nursing Home Reform.1988. Final report: Nurse aide training symposium. Washington, D.C.: NCCNHR. January 30

National Council of State Boards of Nursing, Inc. 1989. Nurse aide competency evaluation program (NACEP). San Antonio, Texas: The Psychological Corporation.

National Nursing Home Survey, National Center for Health Statistics, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, 1977 and 1997.

Noel M.A., Pearce G.L., Metcalf R. 2000. Front Line Workers in Long-Term Care: the Effect of Educational Interventions and Stabilization of Staffing Ratios on Turnover and Absenteeism. Journal of the American Medical Directors Association. Nov-Dec; 1: 241-247

Noelker, L. S. What can be done to improve the nursing assistant's job? Section 3: Working conditions, job redesign, and career ladders for paraprofessionals. Cleveland, OH: Benjamin Rose Institute.

Noell, E. 1995. Design in Nursing Homes: Environment as a Silent Partner in Caregiving. *Generations*. Winter.

Older Women's League. 1996. Faces of Care: An Analysis of Paid Caregivers and Their Impact on Quality Long Term Care. Washington, D.C..

Packer-Tursman, Judy. 1996. Reversing the Revolving Door Syndrome. *Provider*. February; 22(2): 50-54

Painter, W., Kennedy, B. 1999. The evolving role of certified nursing assistants in long term care facilities. Part One: Highlights of nursing home CNA roundtables on career issues for frontline staff. *The Director* Autumn, 7(4): 142, 146-147.

Paraprofessional Healthcare Institute. January 2001. *Direct-care health workers: The unnecessary crisis in long-term care*. Washington, D.C.: The Aspen Institute Domestic Strategy Group.

Paraprofessional Healthcare Institute. 1997. Welfare to work: An employers' dispatch from the front by the Cooperative Health Care Network. Bronx, New York.

Patterson, Joanne. 1987. Maximizing RN Potential In A Long-Term-Care Setting. *Geriatric Nursing*. May/June.

Brian Peacock Consulting Inc. January 2000. Recruitment, training, employment and retention: Report on certified nursing assistants in Florida's nursing homes. Tallahassee, FL: Florida Department of Elder Affairs.

Phillips R.M., Baldwin B.A. 1997. Teaching psychosocial care to long-term care nursing assistants.

Journal of Continuing Education in Nursing. May-Jun; 28(3): 130-4.

Pillemer, K. 1996. Solving the Frontline Crisis In Long-term Care. A Practical Guide to Finding and Keeping Quality Nursing Assistants. Cambridge: Frontline Publishing Co.

Pillemer, K. 1996. Myths About Nursing Assistants. Contemporary Long Term Care. July.

Pillemer K. 1996. The revolving door (and why it turns). Journal of Long Term Care Administration. Fall; 24(3): 46-9.

Pillemer, K. 1997. A Higher Calling. Contemporary Long-Term Care. April.

Pillemer K. 1997. Three "Best Practices" to Retain Nursing Assistant. *Nursing Homes* March; 46(3): 13-18

Pillemer K, Hudson Keller B. 1993. A model abuse prevention program for nursing assistants. The Gerontologist. Feb; 33(1): 128-31.

Pillemer K., Menio D. A., Hudson Keller B. H. 2001. *Abuse-proofing your facility: A practical guide for preventing abuse in long-term care facilities*. Somerville, MA: Frontline Publishing.

Pillemer, K., Moore, D.W. 1989. Abuse of Patients in Nursing Homes: findings from a survey of Staff. *The Gerontologist*. 29(3): 314-320.

Pitegoff P. Shaping Regional Economies to Sustain Quality Work: The Cooperative Health Care Network. In J.F. Handler and L. White (Eds.), *Hard Labor: Women and Work in the Post-Welfare Era*.

Polio J.D. 1997. Implementing a career ladder program for the geriatric nursing assistant. *Insight*, 6(3)

Pyle MA, Massie M, Nelson S. 1998. A pilot study on improving oral care in long-term care settings. Part II: Procedures and outcomes. Journal of Gerontological Nursing. Oct; 24(10): 35-8.

Radcliffe, I. 1996. Teaching RNs How to Select A Nursing Assistant Partner. *Recruitment, Retention and Restructuring Report.* January/February.

Rader, J.; Lavelle, M.; Hoefer, B.; and McKenzie, D. 1996. Maintaining Cleanliness: an Individualized Approach. *Journal of Gerontological Nursing*. 22(3).

Rader, J. 1987. A Comprehensive Staff Approach to Problem Wandering. *The Gerontologist*. 27(6).

Reinhard S., Stone R. January 2001. *Promoting quality in nursing homes: The Wellspring model.* New York, NY: The Commonwealth Fund.

Remsburg R.E., Armacost K.A., Bennett R. G. 1999. Improving nursing assistant turnover and stability rates in a long-term care facility. 1999. *Geriatric Nursing*. Jul-Aug; 20(4): 203-8.

Schirm, V., Garland T.N. 1997. Nurses' Perceptions of the role of nurse assistants in delivery of quality care in the nursing home. Presented at the annual meeting of the Midwest Sociological Society, Des Moines, Iowa, April 3-6

Schirm V., Albanese T., Garland T. N., Gipson G., Blackmon D. J. 2000. Caregiving in nursing homes: Views of licensed nurses and nursing assistants. *Clinical Nursing Research*, August; 9(3): 280-297.

Service Employees International Union. 1997. Caring Till It Hurts. How Nursing Home Work is Becoming the Most Dangerous Job in America. Washington D.C.: SEIU.

Service Employees International Union. 1998. A crisis for caregivers: Health insurance out of reach for nursing home workers. Washington D.C.: SEIU.

Sheridan, J. E.; White, J. and Fairchild, T. J. 1992. Ineffective Staff, Ineffective Supervision or Ineffective Administration? Why Some Nursing Homes Fail to Provide Adequate Care. *The Gerontologist.* 32(3): 334-341.

Shield, Renee Rose. 1988. *Uneasy Endings. Daily Life In An American Nursing Home*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.

Simpson A. 1998. American Red Cross chapter creates CNA development program. *Insight*, 7(2).

Sloane P., Rader J., Barrick A.L., Hoeffer B., Dwyer S., McKenzie D., Lavelle M., Buckwalter K., Arrington L., Pruitt T. 1995. Bathing persons with dementia. *The Gerontologist* 35(5): 672-678

Smyer, Michael; Brannon, D., Cohn, M. 1991. Improving Nursing Home Care Through Training and Job Redesign. *The Gerontologist.* 32(3).

Southwestern Pennsylvania Partnership for Aging Workforce Initiative. January 2001. *Direct Care Workers in Long-Term Care ... An Emerging Crisis*. Cranberry Township, PA.

Speaking From Experience. 1997. Brooklyn, NY: Cobble Hill Health Center, Inc.

Stannard, Charles. 1973. Old folks and Dirty Work: The Social Conditions for Patient Abuse In A Nursing Home. *Social Problems*. 20.

Stevens A.B., Burgio L.D., Bailey E., Burgio K.L., Paul P., Capilouto E., Nicovich P., Hale G. 1998. Teaching and maintaining behavior management skills with nursing assistants in a nursing home. *The Gerontologist*. Jun; 38(3): 379-84.

Stone R. I. January 31, 2001. Frontline Workers in Long-Term Care: A Background Paper. Washington, D.C.: Office of the Assistant Secretary for Planning and Evaluation of the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services

Stone R. I. August 2000. Long-Term Care for the Elderly With Disabilities: Current Policy, Emerging Trends, and Implications for the Twenty-First Century. New York, NY: Milbank Memorial Fund.

Straker J. K., Atchley R. C. June 1999. Recruiting and retaining frontline workers in long-term care: Usual organizational practices in Ohio. Oxford, OH: Miami University, Scripps Gerontology Center.

Streit A, Brannon D. 1994. The effect of primary nursing job design dimensions on caregiving technology and job performance in nursing homes. *Health Services Management Research*, 7: 271-278

Surpin R. 1988. Improved Working Conditions Lead to Improved Quality. *Caring*. May: 26-29.

Tellis-Nayak V., Tellis-Nayak M. 1989. Quality of Care and the Burden of Two Cultures: When the World of the Nurse's Aide Enters the World of the Nursing Home. *The Gerontologist*. 29(3): 307-313.

Tisdale, Sallie. *Harvest Moon: Portrait of a Nursing Home. New York: Henry Holt and Company.*

Tynan C., Witherell, J.1984. Good orientation cuts turnover. Geriatric Nursing 5(3): 173-175

U.S. Bipartisan Commission On Comprehensive Health Care. 1990. *The Pepper Commission Final Report: A Call for Action*. Washington, D.C.: Government printing Office, S. Prt.: 101 - 114

U.S. General Accounting Office. May 17, 2001. Nursing workforce: Recruitment and retention of nurses and nurse aides is a growing concern. Testimony before the Committee on Health, Education, Labor and Pensions, U.S. Senate.

Van Kleunen, Andy. 1998. Welfare—to—Work after the Personal Responsibility Work Opportunity Reconciliation Act: New Barriers created by "welfare reform," as encountered by the Cooperative Health Care Network. Bronx, New York: Paraprofessional Healthcare Institute.

Waxman H.M., Carner E.A., Berkenstock G. 1984. Job turnover and job satisfaction among nursing home aides. *The Gerontologist* 24: 503-509.

Whittier T. 1995. Finding and Keeping Good Direct Care Staff. *Provider*. August.

Williams C.C. 2001. *Relationship The Heart of Life and Long Term Care*. Rochester, NY: The Pioneer Network. March

Wilner, M. A. 1994. Working It Out: Support Groups for Nursing Assistants. *Generations*. Fall 18(3).

Wilner M.A., Shenkman S. 1993. *Evaluation of Support Groups for Nursing Assistants*. Final Report to National Center for Nursing Research.

Wilner M. A., Wyatt A. 1998. *Paraprofessionals on the front lines: Improving their jobs—improving the quality of long-term care*, September 10-11. A conference background paper prepared for the AARP long-term care initiative. Washington, D.C.: AARP

Wisconsin Association of Homes and Services for the Aging. Undated. Enhancing Employment in Long Term Care: A Guide to Retention. Madison, WI: WAHSA.

Wright, Lore K. 1988. A Reconceptualization of the "Negative Staff Attitudes and Poor Care in Nursing Homes" Assumption. *The Gerontologist.* 28(6).

Wunderlich, Gooloo S.; F.A. Sloan and C. K. Davis, eds. *Nursing Staff in Hospitals and Nursing Homes: Is It Adequate?* Institute of Medicine: Committee on the Adequacy of Nurse Staffing in Hospitals and Nursing Homes. Washington, D.C.: National Academy Press.